EMOTIONAL DEMANDS OF LEARNING TO BECOME A TEACHER: TRAINEE PE TEACHER EXPERIENCES OF CONFRONTING PROBLEMATIC SITUATIONS.

JAMES WALLIS

A thesis submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements of the University of Brighton for the degree of Doctor of Education

September 2014
Abstract

Theories exist on the causes, nature and impacts of emotions on qualified teachers. There is, however, limited research on the emotional demands on trainee teachers as they navigate towards Qualified Teacher Status (QTS). The central aim of this study was to develop an explanatory theory of the emotional demands of learning to become a PE teacher. The study used trainees’ experiences of confronting the common problems of obesity and sedentary behaviour to focus discussion on the management of complex situations in their everyday practice.

Data collection involved a total of nineteen semi-structured interviews with trainee PE teachers (n=10) who had recently completed their seventeen week final professional semester and had received confirmation of their successful qualification as teachers. Trainees all studied at the same institution in the South East of England. Further data were collected through theoretically sampled focus groups with school based mentors (n=3) and University teaching staff (n=4) which aimed to provide verification of the emerging theory. Data collection and data analysis ran concurrently and were informed by dimensional analysis, an analytical procedure following grounded theory techniques.

Findings showed that emotional demands on trainee PE teachers were catalysed by a contradiction between their aspirations for the type of teacher they aspired to be and the controlling expectations of the wider context. How trainees experience this contradiction was influenced by two factors. The first was the opportunity trainees perceived in acting under their own volition. The second was their perceived capacity to cope with challenging situations that threatened their practice intentions. This contradiction triggered emotional responses in all participants. Trainees attempted to manage their emotions through emotional labour, most often through surface and deep acting where they practiced in ways that conflicted with their aspirations. More specifically trainees’ emotional labour was linked to feelings of inauthenticity where they felt they had to fake or conceal their true self in order to perform according to the expectations of the School or University. The accumulation of emotions and their regulation through emotional labour was found to have either adaptive (such as increased confidence, greater awareness of what it means to be a teacher) or maladaptive impacts (such as thoughts of withdrawal, feeling disillusioned) on trainees as they attempted to achieve qualified teacher status. Impacts were dependent upon two factors. The first was the intrinsic reward felt by trainees, the second was whether carrying out emotional labour was perceived as enhancing or hindering their likelihood of achieving qualified teacher status.

Findings suggested that trainees were better equipped to cope with emotional labour when they were able to consciously attend to threats to the identity they held for themselves. This included staying attuned to how organisational expectations exerted pressure to conform and threatened their practice intentions. These factors are discussed against the backdrop of increasing early career burnout in teachers.

The explanatory theory contributes to the body of knowledge on emotions in teaching. Theories have not previously considered the accumulation or alleviation of the impacts of emotional labour in the training phase of teachers. This study provides professional implications for initial teacher training and school-based mentoring. Further research may focus on the impact of specific interventions which aim to raise conscious attention of trainee and newly qualified teachers and help them cope with the accumulation of emotions in the early stages of their career.
CONTENTS

Abstract .................................................................................................................................................2

Contents ................................................................................................................................................3

List of Tables ..........................................................................................................................................7

List of Figures ..........................................................................................................................................8

List of abbreviations .............................................................................................................................9

Acknowledgements ................................................................................................................................10

Author’s Declaration .............................................................................................................................11

Introduction to the thesis .....................................................................................................................12

  i) Origins of the study .......................................................................................................................12
  ii) Using trainee recollections of confronting obesity and sedentary behaviour.........................14
  iii) Overview of the thesis ...............................................................................................................15

CHAPTER 1     THE PHYSICAL EDUCATION CONTEXT

  1.1 Shaping contemporary PE in the UK ......................................................................................18
      1.1.1 The National Curriculum for Physical Education .........................................................20
      1.1.2 The shifting emphasis of PE .........................................................................................21

  1.2 Contemporary perspective from 2007-2014 .....................................................................25
      1.2.1 The health agenda and the 2008 NCPE .....................................................................26
      1.2.2 Leading up to 2012 and beyond ..................................................................................28

  1.3 Initial Teacher Training (ITT) ..............................................................................................30
      1.3.1 Teacher knowledge .......................................................................................................30
      1.3.2 School-based learning ..................................................................................................32

  1.4 Summary .................................................................................................................................33
CHAPTER 2     TEACHER IDENTITY

2.1 The use of literature in this thesis .......................................................35
2.2 The theoretical framework; understanding teacher identity in this study ......38
2.3 Summarising teacher identity in this study .............................................43
2.4 Learning to become a teacher ..............................................................44
   2.4.1 Trainee teacher identity ...............................................................44
   2.4.2 Emotions of becoming a teacher ..................................................47
2.5 Summary of the literature and gaps in research ......................................49
2.6 Refined research aims and research questions .......................................50

CHAPTER 3     METHODOLOGY

3.1 Paradigm of enquiry ..............................................................................52
3.2 Theory building research .................................................................54
3.3 Grounded theory methods ....................................................................55
3.4 Selecting a process for data collection and analysis ...............................56
3.5 Dimensional analysis ...........................................................................58
3.6 Case study design ................................................................................61
3.7 Insider research ..................................................................................62
3.8 Trustworthiness ....................................................................................65
   3.8.1 Credibility ....................................................................................65
   3.8.2 Natural generalisability ...............................................................68
   3.8.3 Confirmability ..............................................................................70
3.9 Ethical considerations ...........................................................................70
3.10 Summary ..............................................................................................71

CHAPTER 4     METHODS

4.1 Identifying the study participants ........................................................73
4.2 Data collection
   4.2.1 Interviewing ................................................................................75
4.2.2 Conducting the interviews and focus groups ........................................76

4.3 Data analysis
4.3.1 Transcribing .........................................................................................80
4.3.2 Evolving the interviews ........................................................................81
4.3.3 Dimensionalising ..................................................................................85
4.3.4 Building dimensions .............................................................................89
4.3.5 Differentiation .......................................................................................94
  4.3.5.1 Second round of data collection ......................................................95
  4.3.5.2 Third round of data collection .........................................................97
4.3.6 Integration ............................................................................................98

4.4 Summary ..................................................................................................99

CHAPTER 5 FINDINGS 1

5.1 Introduction to the findings .....................................................................100
5.2 The study participants .............................................................................101
5.3 Daily practice ..........................................................................................105
5.4 The training context
  5.4.1 The final professional semester ..........................................................109
  5.4.2 Contextual factors influencing trainee practice ..................................111
    5.4.2.1 Macro expectations .......................................................................112
    5.4.2.2 Meso expectations .......................................................................114
    5.4.2.3 Micro expectations .......................................................................116
5.5 Combining trainee aspirations with contextual expectations ...............118
  5.5.1 Opportunity to carry out practice intentions .......................................120
  5.5.2 Perceived capacity to cope with problems .........................................122
5.6 Summary of chapter 5 .............................................................................125

CHAPTER 6 FINDINGS 2

6.1 Responses to daily contradiction ............................................................126
  6.1.2 Managing emotional responses ..........................................................128
  6.1.3 The emotional labour of learning to become a teacher ..................133
6.2 Impacts of emotional labour on trainee teachers ...................................136
6.3 Coping with the emotional labour of becoming a teacher ..................140
6.4 Summary of findings – ‘An explanatory theory of the accumulation and mitigation of the emotions of learning to become a teacher.’ ..........148
CHAPTER 7   DISCUSSION

7.1 Findings in relation to the research questions ......................................152

7.2 The study findings in relation to existing literature .................................155
7.2.1 Emotional labour is an inherent part of learning to become a PE teacher .................................................................155
7.2.2 Impacts of emotional labour can be mitigated by providing opportunities for trainees to develop their skills of conscious attention ......................................................................................159

7.3 Implications to PE teacher training and future research ..........................164
7.3.1 Implications to PE initial teacher training .........................................164
7.3.2 Implications for future research .......................................................169

7.4 Transferability of findings ........................................................................172

7.5 Personal reflections, reflexivity and limitations of the study .....................173
7.5.1 Being a neophyte researcher ..............................................................173
7.5.2 Carrying out interpretive analysis .......................................................174
7.5.3 Duration of a study using grounded theory methods ..........................176
7.5.4 Range, scope and depth of the study .................................................177
7.5.5 Problems of self-selection and self-reporting .....................................177
7.5.6 Application of grounded theory methods to my professional life .........178

7.6 Conclusion ...............................................................................................179

REFERENCES..................................................................................................182

APPENDICES ...............................................................................................205-222

Appendix 1 – Letter to BA (with Qualified Teacher Status) year 4 and PGCE cohorts ………………………………………………………………………………….205
Appendix 2 – Follow up letter and further information for participants .........................................................................................207
Appendix 3 – Participant Consent Form ...............................................................................................................................................................208
Appendix 4 – Letter to University trained mentors for focus group involvement ............................................................209
Appendix 5 – Example of theoretical memo during differentiation of dimensions, June 2011 .........................................................................................210
Appendix 6 – Example of theoretical memo and use of literature to expand and understand role strain (a second example of a memo differentiating between dimensions) ........................................................................214
Appendix 7 - Example of dimensionalising and early analytic memos ..........217
Appendix 8 - Analytical memo and diagramming the explanatory matrix – February 2012 ........................................................................................................221
# LIST OF TABLES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Page</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Table 1, p.19</td>
<td>The shifting dynamics of PE up to the Education Reform Act (1988) and National Curriculum for Physical Education (1992)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 2, p.22</td>
<td>Public bodies who took part in NCPE negotiations since 1992</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 3, p.24</td>
<td>Events that have triggered the shifting emphasis of PE since 1992</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 4, p.31</td>
<td>Teacher competencies and core requirements since 1992</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 5, p.46</td>
<td>Alternative positions on socialisation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 6, p.55</td>
<td>Three central features of symbolic interactionism in this study</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 7, p.57</td>
<td>The methodological approach for this study against classical grounded theory</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 8, p.63</td>
<td>The insider characteristics of the present study. Constructs adapted from Robson (1993) and Sikes &amp; Potts (2008)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 9, p.66</td>
<td>Strategies employed to enhance credibility of the study</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 10, p.71</td>
<td>Steps taken to ensure ethical practice</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 11, p.78</td>
<td>Overview of interview timetable</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 12, p.79</td>
<td>Focus groups conducted towards the end of analysis</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 13, p.80</td>
<td>Examples of editing of interview data</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 14, p.81</td>
<td>Initial and adapted interview guides</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 15, p.83</td>
<td>Field notes from initial interviews</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 16, p.84</td>
<td>Example of reflective memo post interview</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 17, p.86</td>
<td>Examples of codes assigned to data pieces</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 18, p.87</td>
<td>Analytic and reflective memo displaying use of literature</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 19, p.88</td>
<td>Example of analytic memo on autonomy</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 20, p.88</td>
<td>Analytic memo to help identify the place of autonomy</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 21, p.90</td>
<td>Construction of the dimensions of ‘emotional investment’</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 22, p.93</td>
<td>Examples of dimensions from the first phase dimensionalising</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 23, p.94</td>
<td>Examples of dimensions from the second phase of dimensionalising</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 24, p.95</td>
<td>Examples of evolved dimensions</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 25, p.96</td>
<td>Examples of dimensions and data confirming the centrality of contradiction</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 26, p.97</td>
<td>Interview guide for consolidating contradiction as the central dimension</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 27, p.101</td>
<td>Bullet pointed summaries of trainee biographies</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tables 28, 29, 30, p.103, 104</td>
<td>Common features of trainee biographies</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 31, p.111</td>
<td>Examples of expectations</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 32, p.126</td>
<td>Positive emotional responses described by trainees</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 33, p.127</td>
<td>Trainee negative emotional response to contradictions</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 34, p.134</td>
<td>The resonance of the present theory with central tenets of emotional labour according to Hochschild (1983) and Theodosius (2008)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1, p.148   The accumulation and mitigation of the emotions of learning to become a teacher.

Figure 2, p.171   The accumulation of emotions in ITT and a future research direction in linking to burnout.
ABBREVIATIONS

ADHD – Attention Deficit Hyperactivity Disorder
BA (Hons) – Bachelor of Arts (Honours)
BMI – Body Mass Index
DA – Dimensional Analysis
DCMS – Department for Culture Media and Sport
DfE – Department for Education
DfEE – Department for Education and Employment
DfES – Department for Education and Skills
DES – Department of Education and Science
FREC – Faculty Research Ethics Committee
GT – Grounded Theory
ITT – Initial Teacher Training
NCPE – National Curriculum for Physical Education
NGB – National Governing Body
NHS – National Health Service
OFSTED – Office for Standards in Education
PE – Physical Education
PESSYP – Physical Education and School Sport for Young People
PGCE – Post Graduate Certificate of Education
QCA – Qualification and Curriculum Authority
QTS – Qualified Teacher Status
QTT – Qualifying to Teach
SDT – Self Determination Theory
TDA – Training and Development Agency
TTA – Teacher Training Agency
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to acknowledge the contributions of the following people who have been sources of support and encouragement during this 7 year journey.

I would like to thank the trainee teachers who participated in this study and for sharing their experiences with me.

I feel fortunate to have benefitted from the support of three knowledgeable and committed supervisors in Professor Julie Scholes, Dr. Nikki Petty and Dr. John Smith. Their patience throughout the process was invaluable as was their ability to set appropriate expectations on me, when to push and when to back off!

Numerous work colleagues have tolerated being held captive in corridors and over coffee. I would like to extend special thanks to Jeanne, Angela, Tom and Andy for offering their time and support when it was most needed.

This thesis is dedicated to my family. Firstly my wife, Carol, for still being my wife and accepting the inevitability of the thesis weighing heavy on me at times. Finally, I would like to acknowledge the unwitting contribution of my two children, Connie and Freddie. Both have shown limitless energy and engagement in their education. They have maximised their opportunities and have willingly accepted each new challenge. Their endeavour made it impossible for me to accept defeat in my own studies.
AUTHOR’S DECLARATION

I declare that the research contained in this thesis, unless otherwise formally indicated within the text, is the original work of the author. The thesis has not been previously submitted to this or any other university for a degree, and does not incorporate material already submitted for a degree.

Signed; .....................................................

Dated; .....................................................
Introduction to the thesis

This study was conducted as part of a Professional Doctorate in Education (EdD). The first stage of the EdD was carried out between 2007 and 2010. Each of the stage one assignments focused on aspects of initial teacher training (ITT). They gave me the opportunity to take a critical view of the ITT process and to reflect on my own experience of becoming a teacher. The assignments also allowed me to formulate research questions and how I could address them relative to my epistemological and ontological position. This introduction to the thesis starts with personal accounts of practice and experiences that have shaped my attitudes and beliefs of Physical Education. This also demonstrates the critically reflexive stance adopted throughout the study (Finlay, 2002; Finlay & Gough, 2003).

i) Origins of the study

As a trainee teacher from 1991-1995 the standardised ITT curricular (DFE, 1992; DFE, 1993) meant the majority of my training was underpinned by an institutional interpretation of the knowledge and skills required for a prospective PE teacher. There was a bias towards explicit knowledge of common sports and what I perceived as an emphasis on children’s technical and tactical proficiency in discrete sporting disciplines. This left me underprepared to cope with complex situations, notably cases of dyspraxia, obesity, attention deficit hyperactivity disorder (ADHD) and significant emotional and behavioural difficulties, phenomena common to school teaching. It was evident to me, that I was underprepared and that I did not have the resources to cope with these daily challenges. I had to find a way to bridge this gap and survive in the profession. Only in retrospect can I recognise the ‘marked disjuncture’ (Green, 2008: 214) between my training and the tough realities of teaching.

Upon graduation in 1995 I spent 6 years working across the 11-19 age range in a variety of publicly-funded institutions. I had constant reminders of the diversity and complexity of school life. Whilst I had a healthy respect for one school’s philosophy towards a curriculum that prioritised sporting performance and implicitly ‘fostered rather than contested sexism, racism and elitism’ (Evans & Davies, 1993; 21), I felt uneasy following this vision of PE. The most able performers were nurtured while the weaker
children were ignored. Boys played football and rugby, girls played netball and hockey. Those who did not fit the dominant sporting image of being ‘sporty’ were marginalised.

Two of my most significant learning experiences involved encountering complex problems for the first time without a mentor to assist me. The first involved confronting a child with a significant physical disability. I was required to include a child with juvenile arthritis into mainstream PE lessons. She often had very limited movement and had rarely been included in practical activities. Her confidence and motivation to engage were very low. I would be relieved when she did not attend or requested extra time in the library instead of taking part in PE. I began to question how the subject was being presented to children who did not fit the stereotype of a ‘sporty’ child. The second experience involved attempting to cope with an extreme emotional outburst of a child who was later diagnosed with dyspraxia. He was unable to perform basic movements but whilst he did not present any significant disruption to my lesson, he was left to descend into a state of learned helplessness. I felt that I had failed these two children.

In addition, I noticed participation rates in girls were in decline, staff tolerance of ‘non-sporty’ types was poor and the continuation in activity outside of compulsory PE dropped off dramatically at key stage 4 (14-16 years of age). I was complicit in this. I became increasingly aware of the divide between my philosophical standpoint on PE and the practice that was embedded at the school and, more worryingly, accepted norms on the subject.

These experiences ran counter to the origins and evolution of a philosophy of PE which has equity and inclusion at its core and prioritising the subject as a means for holistic development of the child. My experience was that claims of equity were just a ‘facade behind which old habits hide’ (Evans and Davies, 1993; 22). I began to question what it meant to be a PE teacher. I struggled to reconcile the training I had received against my own teaching philosophy and the needs of some of the children.

Working in Higher Education and being able to research PE teacher training ignited an interest in the process of learning to become a teacher. More specifically, I was keen to research whether my early experiences were unique to me, or whether some features resonated with the experiences of trainee teachers in the present day. I was keen to
interrogate current ITT processes, my own recollections acted as a starting point for research. For example; what knowledge do current trainee teachers require? How do they handle problematic situations? What are the impacts of these experiences? How do they learn to cope with situations they face? Can ITT better prepare trainees for a career in teaching?

It is widely acknowledged that the most significant learning experiences for trainee teachers occur during their professional placements. The final professional semester is the point at which trainees integrate all of their prior theoretical and practical learning and is the last formal ITT process before qualifying. For this reason I wanted to interview students about their experiences whilst completing their final professional semester, as it was at this point I would be able to mine rich data that would illuminate further understanding of this key transitional phase in the lives of teachers.

The aim of this research was to increase understanding of the emotional demands of learning to become a PE teacher. To achieve this I wanted to guide trainee recollections of coping with a specific, recurring issue in contemporary PE teaching. Just as I had found challenge in my early experiences of engaging pupils with severe disability and dyspraxia, participants were invited to recollect their experiences of confronting obesity and sedentary behaviour. Given its scale and prevalence I felt that this selection would be most likely to provide responses that would be based on recollections of real-life experience as opposed to situations that were merely theoretical or hypothetical.

ii) Using trainee recollections of confronting obesity and sedentary behaviour

The selection of trainee experiences of confronting obesity and sedentary behaviour as the basis on which to focus trainee discussion can be attributed to two factors.

1. The increasing prevalence of obesity in the UK (Foresight, 2007; Health Survey of England, 2012). In order to build on existing understanding of learning to become a teacher it was necessary to select a common, but nevertheless complex situation that trainees were likely to have encountered during their final school-
based placement which could act as a basis to build further discussion on learning to become a teacher. Obesity is therefore an appropriate means to investigate praxis, what happens when trainees attempt to enact the theory provided in the ITT curriculum within the complexity of a practical setting. This focal point is considered a complex scenario for trainee teachers to contend with as coping with health-related issues, including obesity and sedentary behaviour, has traditionally been an area of weakness in PE teacher training and practice (Harris, 2010; Alfrey, Cale & Webb, 2012).

2. The evolution of ‘healthism’ in PE with a particular emphasis on obesity and sedentary behaviour. As will be discussed in chapter 1, discourse around health, activity and contributing to the management of obesity were assigned greater emphasis in PE during the training phase of the participants in this study.

The timing of this research is important to consider. PE was about to undergo another overhaul to fit the vision of the Conservative-Liberal Democrat coalition’s view of PE. Implicit in this is the use of PE to support the development of sports performance and inter-person competition. It is a commonly held view by many in the PE community that politicians and policy makers have rarely understood the distinctions between PE and sport, regularly evolving its purpose to be a panacea for what is wrong with society at any given time (Stidder & Griggs, 2012; Penney, 2008; Green, 2008). It is a time of further widespread change for PE. Layers of policy and societal change have impacted on PE, as will be discussed in chapter 1.

### iii) Overview of the thesis

What follows is an overview of each chapter of the thesis.

*Chapter 1* presents literature on the background and context to PE and how it has evolved through societal, political and historical influences. It is important to understand the contested space that PE has become in order to fully appreciate the context in which trainees are placed as they learn to become a teacher. This chapter provides an overview of three of the most significant events that shaped PE during the training phase of the participants who took part in this study; the evolution of the National Curriculum for Physical Education, the rise of obesity and the staging of the
2012 Olympic and Paralympic Games. In addition, this chapter outlines major changes
to ITT processes. Included here are the implications of increased emphasis on school-
based learning and mentoring.

Chapter 2 sets out the theoretical framework for the thesis. This chapter starts by
reviewing the literature on teacher identity, how it is formed and continually reformed.
Trainee teachers encounter diverse perspectives on the role of the PE teacher during
their training. This, in addition to the diverse social picture outlined in chapter 1,
presents challenges to the trainee to adopt a clear identity for themselves within their
role and for their future career. The chapter then considers some of the challenges faced
by new entrants to the profession in developing an identity including current
understanding of the role played by emotions. This chapter concludes with the research
aims and research questions.

Chapter 3 examines the methodological considerations that were necessary in order to
investigate the emotional demands of learning to become a teacher using recollections
of dealing with obesity and sedentary behaviour. This chapter discusses the decision to
employ dimensional analysis, one approach in second generation grounded theory
(Bowers & Schatzman, 2009) to frame the data collection and analysis. Ethics,
trustworthiness and reliability of approaches are considered, along with issues relating
to anonymity and confidentiality. The chapter concludes with strategies implemented to
respect the needs of participants and to minimise any perceived power differential.

Chapter 4 presents a step by step overview of the stages incorporated in the collection
and analysis of data. An initial round of data collection resulted in dimensions and
properties being ‘conjured’ (Schatzman, 1991). A second phase of data collection,
including theoretically sampled second interviews, enabled differentiation of
dimensions based on their salience and explanatory power. Further data collection for
theoretical sampling using third interviews and a focus group was followed by
integration of dimensions into a meaningful story of the case. Examples of how data
were generated and interpreted are used to demonstrate transparency to the analysis.

The next two chapters present the findings of the research. Data pieces are used
throughout both chapters to demonstrate how findings were inductively built from the
data. Chapter 5 is the first of the two chapters presenting the findings. Trainees’ biographies contribute to the aspirations they hold for their practice when confronting common problems such as obesity. This chapter presents what happens when trainees combine their aspirations with the expectations of the School and of the wider PE context.

Chapter 6 extends the findings of the study by presenting how the accumulation of experiences outlined in chapter 5 over the 17 week period can impact on trainees, drawing on constructs associated with Hochschild’s (1983) theory of emotional labour. Findings are also presented on the processes employed by trainees in attempting to mitigate some of the negative consequences of their emotional labour. The chapter concludes with an overview of chapters 5 and 6 along with presentation of an explanatory theory of the emotional demands of becoming a PE teacher inductively built through the data.

Chapter 7 presents the findings of the study in relation to existing literature and understanding of emotional labour in teaching. This chapter revisits the research questions before considering how the study has contributed to the body of professional knowledge in the specific field of PE ITT. Implications for future practice in ITT and future research in the field are presented. The possible transferability of the findings to other contexts is considered along with my reflections, reflexivity and limitations. The final section of chapter 7 concludes the study.
Chapter One

The Physical Education context

This thesis explores the emotional demands of learning to become a PE teacher using trainees’ recollections of coping with daily challenges. To do this it is important to understand the context in which they are trained as they work towards Qualified Teacher Status (QTS).

Chapter One:

- Discusses the evolution of PE. It presents historical influences on PE, highlights shifting dynamics and discusses landmark events and policies that have shaped the subject to suit public needs and contributed to diverse interpretations of PE.
- Outlines three significant socio-political events that influenced the PE landscape between 2007 and 2010, when the participants who took part in this study were training. It looks at the impact of the 2008 National Curriculum for Physical Education, the social and financial implications of the rise of obesity and the UK’s winning bid to stage the 2012 Olympic and Paralympic Games. It also argues how each of these three events gave PE greater diversity and continued its tradition of being used to address public needs.
- Provides the context against which the participants were trained. It outlines the requirements of the ITT curricular, together with the added complexities that can arise from school-based experience and interactions during training.

1.1 Shaping contemporary PE in the UK

Physical Education has been shaped by its history. A review of landmark changes from the latter half of the 19th century, up to the introduction of the first National Curriculum for Physical Education (NCPE) in 1992, is presented to help position the different perspectives of PE and how they have been layered over time. It is argued that these different layers have shaped the complex and dynamic context that influences current PE practice.
PE has a long-standing tradition of evolving to suit social needs (Green, 2008). Its use as a social vehicle has been consistently demonstrated, perhaps setting precedents for contemporary interpretations of the subject (Stidder & Griggs, 2012). Table 1 identifies key periods in the evolution of PE and highlights significant occasions when PE was required to serve the needs of society. Presenting these events provides an appreciation of the evolved position of PE throughout its history, the regularity of its reinvention and the current context in which trainee teachers must operate.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Shifting dynamic of Physical Education</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Latter half of the 19th Century</td>
<td>PE was used to prepare boys for the military and support the preservation of the British Empire</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1900-1944</td>
<td>Physical training was recognised as a way to strengthen the workforce for economic gain</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1944</td>
<td>'The Education Reform Act resulted in schooling and as a result, PE for all children. PE was used to promote discipline through 'drill' for the masses in state schools and for 'strategy' in private schools</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1960</td>
<td>The Wolfenden Report acknowledged the very significant reduction in activity levels among school leavers. New approaches and conceptions of PE were required to make sure that people stayed physically active after the age of 16.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1965-1986</td>
<td>Diverse approaches to PE, and the creation of an international PE ‘community’, meant greater freedom and autonomy in how PE was conceived and delivered.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1: The shifting dynamics of PE up to the Education Reform Act (DES, 1988) and National Curriculum for Physical Education (DES / WO, 1992)

As a result of the Education Reform Act (1988), and the subsequent National Curriculum for Physical Education (1992), expectations of PE became more formalised and centralised. These two landmark policies were the main catalysts that determined the shape and objectives of the curriculum. The prospect of a centralised PE curriculum was seen as a positive step from within the subject, although there was some
ambivalence regarding whose perspective it would be written from and who it would seek to benefit (Penny & Evans, 1999).

The late 1980s and early 1990s were pivotal in shaping what PE has now become and set the precedent for future trends in the changing expectations of the subject. Due to the central role that this period played in its development, the following section provides a detailed insight into the consultation and conceptualisation of PE in a new era of education.

1.1.1 The National Curriculum for Physical Education (NCPE) (1992)

The NCPE (DES / WO, 1992) laid the contemporary foundations for PE as it is practiced today. It also signalled the Government’s increased involvement in curriculum design, driven by the social, political and economic conditions that impact on policy decisions. Penney & Evans (2002) claimed that this increased Government involvement meant that there would be nothing arbitrary about the design of a curriculum for England and Wales. They argued that PE was unlikely to be shaped by people actually working in the subject and as a result the curriculum would struggle to gain a foothold that would enable it to evolve further.

The working group that designed the first version of the NCPE was chaired by Education Minister John MacGregor and included the Head Teacher of Harrow School, two professional sportsmen, senior executives from NatWest and IBM and senior figures from primary, secondary and higher education. No PE teachers were involved in the working group which was a notable omission. The Department for Education and Skills (DES) was unequivocal when it came to PE teachers’ responsibilities for the new curriculum. They would be “responsible for the organisation of the curriculum and the scope and content of schemes of work” and “would just make it happen” (DES, 1989: 10). From these comments, and the omission of PE teachers from the design of the curriculum, it was clear that teachers would merely deliver the subject, but would have no role in debating what it aspired to achieve.

The working group also included two academics from Colleges of Physical Education, Elizabeth Murdoch and Margaret Talbot, who argued that the new curriculum should promote cognitive, social and emotional development, not just a sport performance
based orientation. These wider educational aims for PE were a priority by those involved in the subject, but later reports confirmed that the working group had taken little notice of these views (Talbot, 1995) in favour of a pro-sport orientation for PE. The Government had previously expressed disdain for PE holding the view that PE was an example of what was wrong with the state education system. They considered that PE was preventing Britain from achieving international sporting status (Evans, 1990) and that it should help put the ‘Great’ back into Great Britain through sporting achievements.

The Government’s vision for PE, at this time, was that it should be used as a vehicle to enhance the country’s sporting status, rather than prioritise wider educational and child centred aims by expecting that ‘participating and performing will be the single most important element of attainment in Physical Education’ (DES / WO, 1992: ). This statement meant that teachers were expected to prioritise children’s participation and performance in discrete sports. It was feared that such a one-dimensional approach to PE could not meet the needs and interests of all children and would lead to a reduction in the proportion who continued physical activity once they left school. A pro-sport approach could, for example, jeopardise the continued engagement of those who preferred non-competitive, creative, aesthetic activities or were repelled by the interpersonal rivalries inherent in sport.

This overview of events shows how PE was re-invented as the country moved into a new educational era. It demonstrates how PE has been moulded by political, social and economic factors and underlines that the future for PE is likely to continue to be manipulated. The following section considers how these influences have shifted the emphasis of PE to help address various social needs.

1.1.2 The shifting emphasis of PE

The following quote captures some traditional recollections of PE and reflects some of the common confusion over the conceptual basis of PE. It succinctly sums up a range of alternative, and at times, conflicting aims of the subject.
“I grew naturally to hate PE and games, generally, associating it with unpleasant, negative and, at times, humiliating experiences. Sport, games, PE – It’s important. It’s exercise. It can build confidence and character. It can be and should be fun. For me, and for many others like me, it was an ordeal. Untold numbers of children in the past were never given a chance by PE teachers who only had eyes for elite athletes in their charge. I would really like to believe that things are different now.”

Asbury (2001: 52)

PE is viewed as having diverse roles. Because of this diversity, contemporary PE still suffers from a legacy of confusion that has left successive generations questioning the subject’s place or relevance in their lives. PE has become a “crowded and contested policy space” (Penney, 2008: 35). Multiple discourses shape PE, namely the important policy areas of sport, health (embracing physical and social dimensions) and education (Houlihan & Green, 2006). These areas have continually influenced what PE has become. The following bodies have been involved in policy decisions concerning PE and school sport since 1992 (Table 2).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sport</th>
<th>Health</th>
<th>Education</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Department for Culture Education Media and Sport (DCMS)</td>
<td>Department of Health (DoH)</td>
<td>Department for and Skills (DFES)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sports Council (now Sport England)</td>
<td>Department for Children, Families and Schools (DCFS)</td>
<td>OFSTED Association for Education (AfPE)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physical British Olympic Association (BOA)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Youth Sport Trust (YST)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Governing Bodies Of Sport (NGB)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2: Examples of public bodies who have taken part in NCPE negotiations since 1992

Since 1992, PE has forged diverse unions with organisations that have interests in what PE should become (Penny & Evans, 2002). It is therefore legitimate to claim that
confusion over the point and purpose of PE can be attributed to the long-standing tradition of politicians and public bodies using the subject to address public needs. This ranges from solving the obesity crisis, controlling dysfunctional youth cultures, promoting positive citizenship and winning Olympic medals. Green (2008: 41) presents one of the strongest statements of ill-conceived notions of PE when describing a commonly held view of the subject as a “panacea or wonder drug that, if administered sufficiently, would rid society of a breadth or social ills.”

As evidence of this point, table 3 presents an overview of landmark policies and events that have shaped PE since the inception of the NCPE in 1992. This table also highlights how the emphasis of PE has shifted as a consequence of each policy. To underline this shifting emphasis, labels have been allocated to depict the underlying aim of each policy initiative:

- Sport and performance – policy changes that targeted an emphasis on a narrower, more specialised curriculum and increased the importance of performance and competition.
- Lifelong activity – policy changes that widened the curriculum offered to children, diminished the importance of performance in PE or invested in initiatives to enhance the uptake of activity outside the curriculum.
- Health and well-being – policy changes that explicitly targeted physical and social health as a goal for PE.

Table 3 shows how regularly PE has shifted due to political, economic and social factors. The expectations placed on PE departments, teachers and trainees have also shifted constantly, as they have been challenged to evolve their practice and to embrace the most recent policy requirements. Those involved in the teaching of PE and the training of future teachers can legitimately claim that the subject still has an identity crisis as power brokers continue to shift its emphasis to coincide with wider political and social discourses. It is legitimate to question, in view of recent policy changes and a pending 5th NCPE, the impact of all of this complexity on trainees as they try to fit into such a complex picture.
Being aware of the history of PE gives an appreciation of the current picture and some of the challenges that trainees are likely to encounter during their training. Investigating the emotional impacts of carrying out day to day roles, and the processes people use to survive in the profession, are central concerns of this study.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Event</th>
<th>Lifelong activity</th>
<th>Sport and performance</th>
<th>Health and well-being</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1995</td>
<td>2nd NCPE (DfE) Government framework ‘Sport; raising the game’ after continued national failure in world level sporting events.</td>
<td>Breadth of activity maintained to capture children in longer-term activity.</td>
<td>Games are compulsory at every key stage, in an attempt to improve national performance.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1996</td>
<td>Launch of Specialist School Status and Specialist Sport Schools.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1998</td>
<td>Identification of Education Action Zones.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>PE recognised as one on the major vehicles through which Citizenship could be delivered.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2000</td>
<td>3rd NCPE (DfEE / QCA, 1999)</td>
<td></td>
<td>Maintained focus on compulsory teaching of games to all children.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2003</td>
<td>PESSCL strategy (Physical Education, School Sport and Club links strategy).</td>
<td>Linking schools with clubs to encourage long-term retention of sport.</td>
<td>Linking schools with clubs to encourage long-term retention of sport. Games still compulsory</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Government health strategy ‘Choosing Health’ (Department of Health, 2004)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>A priority of ‘Choosing Health’ is reducing obesity with schools expected to take greater responsibility.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2008</td>
<td>4th NCPE (DCSF / QCA, 2007) launched Physical Education and Sport Strategy for Young People (DCSF, 2008) (PESSYP) launched</td>
<td></td>
<td>The aims of PESSYP, aligned to sustained performance in sport, were contradictory to the NCPE (DCSF / QCA, 2007).</td>
<td>Priority emphasis given to health and physical activity. Sport is relegated as an objective of the NCPE (DCSF / QCA, 2007).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010</td>
<td>Obesity costs to the National Health Service (NHS) reported as £4 billion. NCPE review announcing a re-focus on competition as part of the Olympic legacy.</td>
<td></td>
<td>PE braces itself for a revision to the current health emphasis (This point is highly relevant to this study as trainees were completing their training while the 5th NCPE was being debated, having spent four years delivering a curriculum with a very different emphasis).</td>
<td>Consolidation of the health emphasis.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Table 3: Events that have triggered the shifting emphasis of PE since 1992

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Event Description</th>
<th>Emphasis</th>
<th>Curriculum Impact</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2012</td>
<td>Successful staging of the Olympic and Paralympic Games. New NCPE (DfE, 2013) drafted.</td>
<td>Emphasis on numbers of children involved in inter-person competition.</td>
<td>Schools are braced for a re-emergence of competitive sport into the curriculum.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2014</td>
<td>First teaching of 5th NCPE (DfE, 2013)</td>
<td>Focus on sport through inter-person and inter-school competition.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1.2 **Contemporary perspectives from 2007-2014**

Contemporary PE is still a contested curriculum area. Definitions of PE vary greatly in terms of their content, philosophical position and opinions of what the subject aspires to deliver. Historical definitions have tried to encapsulate learning in the physical, moral, social and spiritual domains, with each new definition emphasising different priorities. Kirk (2010) underlines this point by suggesting that the PE profession seems very clear about what PE is *not*, but that the issue of what PE *is* has been an eternal problem. For example, there are different views on PE as a tool for child development, preparation for later life or to benefit society. To further this point, between 2005 and 2010 the UK Government invested over £1.5 billion in its school sport strategy, with three different and conflicting intentions of enhancing the development of talented performers, reducing obesity and contributing to public order (Kirk, 2010).

The contemporary picture, therefore, appears to continue the traditional trend of diverse expectations of what PE should aim to achieve. Multiple interpretations of the subject are still apparent. It has become the norm for academics, practitioners and, most significantly for this thesis, for new entrants to the profession to contend with this diversity. Contemporary interpretations of the subject are still influenced by the social picture.

The following section will draw on the most recent events that have directly shaped the training of the group of trainees who participated in this study. It elaborates on three of the socio-political events introduced in table 2; the 2008 NCPE, the rise of obesity and the hosting of the 2012 Olympics and Paralympics.
1.2.1 The health agenda and the 2008 NCPE

The Foresight Report ‘Tackling obesities – future choices’ (Foresight, 2007), provided compelling data about the obesity epidemic in the UK, together with apocalyptic predictions of how the future might look if current trends were not arrested. An overview of the most significant statistics is presented below:

- Obesity\(^1\) rates in the UK have doubled in the last 25 years and 25% of the UK adult population is currently obese.
- One in ten children aged 6-10 and 5% of boys and 11% of girls aged 11-15 are obese.
- By 2025, 47% of men and 36% of women will be obese, based on current trends.
- By 2050 over half the adult population will be obese, including 76% of young girls and 55% of young boys, based on current trends.
- The estimated cost of obesity in 2002 was £7 billion (House of Commons Select Committee) and in 2050 it is expected to be £45.5 billion (Foresight, 2007)

Predictive data has been subject of significant criticism with a number of researchers suggesting figures should be viewed with caution (Evans, Rich, Davies & Allwood, 2008; Cale & Harris, 2013). Whilst various limitations regarding measurement and reporting of figures are apparent, more recent data from the Health Survey of England (2012) suggests that the broad Foresight predictions appear to be correct as obesity rates have continued to increase between 2007 and 2011. Despite differing positions on the severity of the situation obesity is widely accepted as a significant health problem with the World Health Organisation (2011) labelling it as one of the biggest challenges to public health in the 21\(^{st}\) Century.

---
\(^1\) Overweight and obesity are defined as abnormal or excessive fat accumulation that may impair health (World Health Organisation, 2014). Overweight and obesity are categorised by Body Mass Index (BMI). Body mass index (BMI) is an index of weight against height where a person's weight in kilograms divided by the square of his or her height in meters (kg/m\(^2\)). Overweight is classified as a BMI equal to or greater than 25. Obesity is classified as a BMI equal to or greater than 30.
The recommended response to this impending epidemic was multi-faceted, calling for major changes at all levels within organisations that have the capacity to influence the behaviour of individuals. The response to the Foresight predictions was immediate for PE, with an increased emphasis on health, the maintenance of active lifestyles and a reduction in the dominance of sport-focused outcomes in the 2008 NCPE (DCSF / QCA, 2007). This continued the trend of successive NCPE curricular having increased emphases on health-related outcomes (Cale & Harris, 2005), providing clear evidence of a further shift in emphasis and expectations for PE towards addressing health concerns.

The NCPE 2008 (DCSF / QCA, 2007) provided the most significant shift away from sport and performance since the first version in 1992 and the impact of the Foresight report was one of the main reasons. A second, significant reason was the resurgence of national sporting success resulting from the significant public funding of agencies such as UK Sport and the English Institute of Sport. These elite sports bodies were created to take the lead in advancing the UK’s sporting achievements, while the PE curriculum was relieved of this expectation and given a clearer and narrower focus. Health and social dimensions were pre-eminent in the 2008 NCPE, with references to sport, competition and fitness almost entirely omitted from the document. At this time, the School Sport College programme received further financial support to expand extracurricular school sport and this also withdrew sport further from the PE curriculum. These changes gave PE clarity and space to focus on the 2008 NCPE objectives of preparing for an active life and promoting lifelong physical activity, to help address trends in obesity and sedentary behaviour.

With the emphasis of PE during their training phase shifting towards the lifelong activity and health agendas, and a reduced emphasis on sport and performance, it was likely that the trainees would have first-hand experience of the diverse interpretations of the subject. They were likely to have experienced the sport and citizenship agendas through their own schooling, from 2000-08, while their teacher training will have prepared them for delivering the 2008 health-focused curriculum. It is timely to question the extent to which these multiple interpretations impacted on trainees as they approached qualified teacher status.
1.2.2 Leading up to 2012 and beyond

In July 2005, the UK won its bid to host the 2012 Olympic and Paralympic Games. This proved to be the third critical landmark in the future direction of PE during the training phase of this group of trainees. The foundations of the London bid were based heavily on the legacy that the Games could ‘Inspire a Generation’ to adopt and sustain physical activity. The brief clarity that the 2008 NCPE provided was complicated by the launch of The Physical Education and School Sport Strategy for Young People (PESSYP) (DCSF, 2008), which was considered to be the first part of the Government’s plans for an Olympic legacy. Sport, performance and competition were central to the PESSYP strategy and PE would be expected to deliver its objectives. But the re-prioritisation of sport through the PESSYP strategy conflicted with the core direction of the 2008 NCPE. Once again, PE was challenged to find a clear identity and re-define its role.

The momentum behind the Olympic legacy, based on competitive sport, gathered pace in 2010 when plans were unveiled for further consultation on the future of PE. The re-emergence of competitive sport at the forefront of school PE escalated in May 2010 when new curriculum proposals were unveiled. The newly-appointed Education Secretary, Michael Gove, announced the creation of an annual “Olympic style” school sport competition and his desire to ‘place competitive sport at the centre of a truly rounded education that schools offer’. On 20 December 2010, Mr Gove announced his plans to deliver his vision for PE and School Sport. He said that the Government would:

- Inject £65 million into schools to free up one PE teacher from the curriculum for one day every week in order to promote competitive sport. This funding would run until the end of the 2013 school year, one year after the Olympics.
- Work with Sport England and the national governing bodies of sport to introduce more sports leaders and qualified coaches into schools.
- Invite Dame Kelly Holmes to lead a network of sporting advocates responsible for promoting school sport.

The most significant, potential impact was the promise to immediately overhaul the NCPE to “place a new emphasis on competitive sports.” History appeared to be repeating itself with a re-emergence of traditional conservative ideals of inter-person
competition, which were originally promulgated at English public schools and more recently by the ‘Sport – Raising the Game’ policy statement (Department of National Heritage, 1995). The Government White Paper ‘The Importance of Teaching’ (DFE, 2010) formalised intentions for the overhaul.

Section 4.28 – Children need access to high-quality physical education, so we will ensure the requirement to provide PE in all maintained schools is retained and we will provide new support to encourage a much wider take up of competitive team sports. With only one child in five regularly taking part in competitive activities against another school, we need a new approach to help entrench the character building qualities of team sport.

A commitment to team sport was made in the original White Paper (DfE, 2010) to ensure that every child played competitive team sport by 2013. Similar beliefs on competitive sport as a panacea had been raised by the Department for Culture Media and Sports in its ‘Plan for the legacy from the 2012 Olympic and Paralympic games’ (2010: 2). This stated that:

“Just under four in ten pupils compete regularly against classmates and only two in ten compete against those in other schools. This lack of competition may contribute to what happens when young people leave school. Sports participation drops off sharply. The cost is enormous, not just in terms of health, where one in four adults in this country are now classed as obese.”

Of immediate concern was the contradictory nature of the Government’s position on the value of competitive sport. The definition of high-quality PE linked to competitive sport has been strongly contested by academics and practitioners, as has the link between competitive sport and reducing obesity. Previous evidence (e.g OFSTED, 2009; Griggs, 2008; Green, 2010) has suggested that sport alone does not have the all-inclusive capacity to engage and inspire lifelong physical activity, of which sport is just one dimension.

An emphasis on competitive team sport was singled out for particular criticism in the OFSTED subject report in 2009, as schools who adopted this focus fell short of the expectations of generating healthy, active lifestyles. Griggs (2008) found that PE
teachers increasingly supported the view that competitive sport was exacerbating feelings of embarrassment and self-consciousness, while Green (2010) considered that the health claims emanating from competitive sport were contentious. Indeed, it has been shown that participation rates in girls have been sustained, and even increased, when the choices on offer include non-competitive healthy lifestyle activities (Her Majesty’s Inspectorate for Education and Training in Wales, 2007). Similarly, Sport Scotland (2005) found that competition was linked to confidence and that many girls were turned off by PE and school sport because it was deemed too competitive.

The confusion surrounding the contemporary picture of PE is relevant to this study, as new entrants to the profession must contend with conflicting interpretations of PE from policy, research and practice. It is clear that the three socio-political influences discussed in this section all had a significant impact on the current picture. They also highlight the complex picture that new entrants to the profession need to assimilate into.

1.3 Initial Teacher Training

In order to investigate the experiences of trainee PE teachers, it is important to understand certain aspects of the ITT process. This section focuses on the knowledge and skills that trainees need to achieve QTS, together with school-based elements of training and the role played by mentors.

1.3.1 Teacher knowledge

Since 1992, trainee teachers have had to provide evidence of their attainment against a series of competencies. Since that date, there have been five different sets of trainee teacher competencies, with the most recent introduced in September 2012. While each set of centralised standards has had different names and authors, there has been little change in the core knowledge that trainees need to demonstrate during this period. Table 4 presents each of the five sets of trainee teacher competencies alongside their core requirements.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Document and authorship</th>
<th>Core requirements</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 1992 | Department for Education (DfE, 1992) | - Subject knowledge  
- Subject application  
- Class management  
- Assessment and recording  
- Further professional development |
| 1998 | National Standards for Qualified Teacher Status (DfEE / TTA, 1998) | - Knowledge and understanding  
- Planning, teaching and class management  
- Monitoring, assessment, recording, reporting and accountability  
- Other professional requirements |
| 2002 | Qualifying to Teach (DFES / TDA) | - Professional values and practice  
- Knowledge and understanding  
- Teaching; planning, monitoring, assessing and class management |
| 2007 | Professional Standards for Teachers (DCSF, 2007) | - Professional attributes  
- Professional knowledge and understanding  
- Professional skills |
| 2012 | Teacher’s Standards (DfE, 2012) | - Teaching; e.g subject knowledge, planning, assessment, recording  
- Personal and professional conduct; upholding the values of the profession |

Table 4: Teacher competencies and core requirements since 1992.

It is claimed that PE teacher training has suffered from an over-emphasis on prioritising subject knowledge (Hayes, Capel, Katene & Cook, 2006), perhaps to the detriment of other knowledge that could prepare trainees for the “everyday realities of teaching” (Korthagen, Loughran & Russell, 2006: 1021). Emphasis on pedagogic and content knowledge reduces the time that is available to build trainees’ understanding of the conceptual basis of PE and can lead to a domination of “PE as sport techniques” (Kirk, 2010: 23). It also adds to the confusion over the point and purpose of the role of PE.

It has been suggested that PE has benefitted from a centralised teacher education curriculum (Green, 2008). However, others (Seidentop, 2002) feel that centralisation has led to the creation of teachers who are pedagogically skilled, but underprepared for many of the day-to-day realities of their subject. Difficulties that trainees face in addressing challenging situations such as obesity and sedentary behaviour in a real-life setting is considered by Seidentop (2002) as an unintended consequence of an overly structured and standardised approach to physical education initial teacher training. Such
criticisms of teacher preparation have been consistent throughout the era of competence-based curricular in teacher education (Sandlin, Young & Karge, 1992; Barone, Berliner, Blanchard, Casanova & McGowan, 1996; Bullough & Gitlin, 2001; Korthagen, Loughran & Russell, 2006).

Navigating unpredictable, unstructured and challenging situations, and the nuances of human interactions, are important skills for teachers. Trainees will experience moments every day that test their coping skills and formal training appears to pay little attention to helping them to develop these, instead choosing to emphasise content, pedagogic and professional knowledge.

1.3.2 School-based learning

At the same time that the centralised curriculum for trainee teachers was introduced, there was an increased emphasis on moving teacher education into school-based settings (DoE circular 9/92: DFE, 1992). This shift increased demands on the quality and volume of mentor training for teacher training institutions. Schools would now be responsible for a greater proportion of initial teacher training, with roles allocated to qualified staff. These increased resources provided impetus and status to mentoring trainee teachers in school-based settings.

School-based learning is considered to be the richest learning period in teacher training (Ben-Peretz, 2001; Tang, 2003). Based on this, increasing trainee time in schools and raising the quality and training of mentors in schools, could be seen as a logical and progressive step. There were, however, significant unintended consequences of this ‘phasing up’ of the roles of the school and mentor in teacher education. The relationship between trainee teachers and their mentors can often lead to the creation of certain values in trainees. Brown and Evans (2004) considered these relationships to be inter-generational and to contribute to the proliferation of values, a kind of cultural reproduction. Other authors have strengthened this contention. Green (2002) refers to a workplace culture that continues to reproduce a PE teaching habitus or occupational socialization of trainees, by influencing new entrants in the profession. Handing the responsibility for assessing trainee teachers to school-based mentors could add to trainees’ perceived constant surveillance of their work.
The shift towards school-based learning and mentoring is relevant to this study. It is possible that exposure to wider, intergenerational interpretations of PE may further complicate the understanding that trainees have of their subject and their ability to develop a clear identity within it.

1.4 Summary

This chapter has shown that diverse interpretations of PE have arisen because of historical, social and political influences that have confused the role that PE and PE teachers should play in contemporary society. These conflicting perspectives present significant challenges for those working in PE, who need to adopt and maintain an identity in the face of constant political and sociological pressure to conform to a series of pressing public agendas. The result is that trainee teachers face a very complex picture, together with a set of demands that may exceed the scope of the initial teacher training curricular.

This complexity is exacerbated by the increasing emphasis on the part played by school-based learning and subject mentors in the education of trainee teachers. On the surface, this could be viewed as a logical and progressive step in teacher education. However, this may not be the case for PE, as inter-generational positions on the subject may differ according to the dominant view of PE held by the mentor or other senior figures working in the placement context.

Navigating such an uncertain context as a newcomer to the subject, in addition to their own views and experiences, could present significant challenges to the trainee who is trying to find out who they are and what they are trying to achieve. Recent research has suggested that there is a link between people leaving teaching early in their careers and identity issues. It has suggested that tackling these drop-out rates may call for attention to ‘identity-making’ by reinforcing, not undermining the identity of teachers (Schafer, Long & Clandinin, 2012). This research is particularly significant for PE, as it is considered that successive changes to policy and societal shifts have left the subject with an identity crisis. Caught up in this are trainee teachers who must make sense of and fit into such a complex picture. As PE continues to evolve in the current social and
political climate, it is timely to question how trainees experience this complexity, how it impacts on them and how they can be supported.

Confronting everyday work issues, such as obesity, requires the trainee to navigate multiple perspectives and expectations. Appreciating the PE context helps to build an understanding of challenges facing new entrants to the profession. This chapter suggests that trainee PE teachers face a complex picture as they try to build an understanding of themselves within their chosen profession. This mapping of the background and context has raised some important points of interest to carry forward into subsequent chapters such as

- How does the complex picture in PE impact on learning to become a teacher, specifically emotional impacts?
- Do trainees develop a sense of teacher identity during their training?
- How do trainees learn to cope with the complexity surrounding PE?
- Do ITT processes prepare trainees to confront these challenges?²

This study has set out to add understanding to the process of learning to become a teacher. The context in which they learn has been outlined here as fragmented and ‘layered’ over time and as difficult for new entrants to the profession to understand. How trainees view themselves within such a complex picture and how they build a self-view as a teacher are further explored in the next chapter.

---

² In keeping with the basis of a naturalistic study (Guba & Lincoln, 1989; Erlandson, Harris, Skipper & Allen, 1993) these broad areas of concern were evolved as the study iterated between data collection and data analysis. As the study progressed and further lines of enquiry were opened the research questions became more focused (section 2.6 on p. 50).
Chapter 2
Teacher identity

This chapter will:

- Discuss how literature was used in this thesis in light of the contested positions of the use of literature in theory generating research
- Review literature on the development of teacher identity to frame existing understanding of becoming a teacher.
- Review literature on the evolving identity of trainee teachers and how they begin to develop a self-view from experiences during their training
- Analyse existing understanding of the place of emotions in learning to become a teacher
- Present refined research aims and research questions

Each section of this review concludes with a short summary drawing the link between the section content and the present study.

2.1 Use of literature in this thesis

The use of literature in theory building research is a contested area. According to traditional grounded theory, the literature review should be delayed until after data analysis (Glaser & Strauss, 1967; Glaser 1978). This original position was intended to avoid imposing preconceived ideas onto the data. Other authors (Strauss & Corbin, 1990, 1998) suggest that literature is a necessity and is often unavoidably brought to the research through previous experience. In the present study, knowledge of literature provided the understanding that the study was novel in the field of teacher training and that a theory could be built inductively from the data. From my position of 13 years of experience in initial teacher training in PE I was already familiar in the substantive area of the research. I had to reflexively manage my preconceptions from previous
experience and remain open minded when looking at the data (McGhee, Marland & Atkinson, 2007).³

Traditional grounded theory requires the researcher to enter the field of enquiry with as few as possible pre-conceived ideas on the phenomenon under investigation. Glaser (1992: 31) suggests that ‘there is no need to review any of the literature in the substantive area under study’ but this does not imply that Glaser’s original version of the method expects the researcher to be completely naive of the subject under investigation. His sentiment is based upon the danger of researchers imposing existing theories or frames of reference onto the data and the potential of being blind to theoretical possibilities.

The timing of the review of literature is the contested area and not whether the researcher has any prior knowledge in the area of study. Immediate engagement with literature to assist the researcher in evolving theory and to supplement the data in reconstruction is an alternative view held by some authors (Strauss and Corbin, 1998; Urquhart and Fernandez, 2006; Urquhart, 2007). Common ground across theorists is that the researcher enters the field with ‘an open mind and not an empty head’ (Glaser and Strauss, 1967). Researchers should have a sound grasp of the phenomenon under investigation from either awareness of literature or from previous experience and working knowledge. Grounded theorists have called this awareness theoretical sensitivity. For legitimate theoretical sensitivity the researcher must ensure that the theory generated determines the relevance of the literature to the study (Urquhart & Fernandez, 2006) and that literature is not forced onto the data⁴.

Previous experience in the field, assignments completed during stage one of the EdD, and literature reviewed in pursuit of ethical clearance gave me a working knowledge of literature in the area. In contrast to the view held by classic grounded theorists, I embraced the use of literature throughout data collection and analysis by using literature

³ Hence the opening commentary in the introduction to the thesis which provided some of my values, experiences and understandings of PE. I used these as devices to openly and theoretically reposition analysis to address my own world view, and to be sensitive to what the participants were telling me about theirs.

⁴ Literature and existing knowledge in the field of question were used as additional conceptual levers to illuminate and not drive the development of theory. This process is presented in greater detail in chapter 4.
as an analytical tool (Strauss & Corbin, 1998), to assist in constant comparison (Charmaz, 2006) and to develop my theoretical sensitivity up to the point of writing up the substantive theory. Literature was therefore used to become aware of what was already known, identify what remains to be found out and to expand theoretical possibilities.

During early data collection literature was used to provide conceptual labels to capture some of the phenomena which were apparent in the data. Some labels were quickly dismissed as new perspectives were adopted. Other labels remained for differing periods of time. Some were dismissed but were later re-adopted following further analysis. The use of literature in this way was designed to capture, code and organise data pieces before attempting to draw them together in a coherent story of the case. Sources of literature included online journal databases such as ScienceDirect, PubMed, British Education Index, Psychinfo, Sport Discus and Emerald. Databases provided the majority of more focused searches as analysis progressed. In addition, more general literature from selected books, internet search engines, staff seminars and online publications were used to expand the data and to provide ideas for appropriate labels and possible perspectives for the study.

Literature used in this chapter was encountered at different stages of the analysis. For example, the theoretical framework through which I have chosen to view the study was originally employed as a code allocated to several data pieces in early data collection. During further data collection and analysis it became clear that the code had a more central role in explaining some of the problems that trainees face in becoming a teacher. On the basis of its explanatory potential a much more focused literature review was then undertaken in the area of teacher identity. Through continued data collection and analysis it became clear that the identity trainees hold and the type of teacher they want to be, had a central role in explaining and understanding the emotional demands they face. This process of using general literature to allocate labels and then later conducting a more detailed review as the label became more substantive was applied several times in this research study.\footnote{For example ‘identity’ was used as a label but was not considered for centrality until about 18 months later at which point a detailed literature review was carried out. Similar processes were in place with}
This study embraced the use of literature in order to help expand the data and to provide labels for collection of data pieces. What follows is a review of the literature on teacher identity, a concept that was applied to data labelling early on in the analytical process. It was later on during analysis that its salience in building the theory was recognised.

2.2 Understanding teacher identity in this study

Creating and managing an identity are acknowledged as crucial parts of becoming a teacher (Hoban, 2007; Riopel, 2006). Yet there is still little concrete evidence that the expression and exploration of shifting identities is included in teacher education (Beauchamp & Thomas, 2009). Instead, ITT is dominated by competency-based curricular (Pinnegar, 2005). There is broad awareness of the importance of recognising oneself as a teacher (Rots, Kelchtermans & Aelterman, 2012) and yet it remains absent in the policy discourse on teacher education (Ballet & Keltchermans, 2008; Rots et al, 2012).

Teacher identity has been the subject of significant academic attention over the last decade (Sachs, 2005; Lasky, 2005; Day, Kington, Stobart & Sammons, 2006; Freese, 2006; Olsen, 2008). Despite this a consistent definition of the term remains elusive. Previous work has acknowledged the multi-faceted nature of identity with some authors choosing to avoid the restrictions imposed by one definition (Beijaard, Meijer & Verloop, 2004; Beauchamp & Thomas, 2009) preferring the use of common features of identity that are consistent across published works. Four common themes of teacher identity are present in literature. Each is important in setting the scene for this study into becoming a teacher. Identity is

1. formed through social processes
2. dynamic, in constant change
3. includes interplay between personal and professional selves
4. influenced by agency.

several other possible dimensions; contradiction, reflection, agency, socialisation, transition, all of which were considered at some stage through the analysis but now have differing levels of salience in the final theory.

Further clarification of principles used in data analysis are presented in chapter 3 and demonstrated in chapter 4.
Each of these common characteristics is now elaborated on using relevant literature as all are essential concerns carried forward through this thesis.

Common characteristic 1 - Identity is formed through social interactions

Teacher identities evolve over the lifetime of a teacher and are often put into stages of development (Ball & Goodson, 1985; Huberman, 1993). Becoming a teacher is a continuous series of professional development experiences which are created by meaningful interaction between the person and the environment (Keltchermans, 2007). Appreciating the significance of the interplay between person and context, the meaning that is derived out of interactions and how people act as a result, is in-keeping with a symbolic interactionist stance on human behaviour (Blumer, 1969). A symbolic interactionist perspective has been applied in previous studies to build an understanding of the development of a sense of self (Freese, 2006; Borich, 1999; Gergen & Gergen, 1987), all of which have built on Herbert Mead’s (1934) original work in his exploration of the self in relation to society.

This view on how teacher identity is formed requires awareness of contextual influences. Chapter 1 provided a detailed overview of historical, political and contextual factors from which teachers derive meaning and develop their self-view. In addition to these contextual influences Wenger (1998) links the formation of teacher identity to working within a specific practice setting. He contends that factors such as practicing within a community membership, active involvement in local and national contexts and openness to a network of professionals have greatest significance on how teachers develop a sense of who they are. Applied to this case of trainee teachers, practice networks could include the school, mentors, colleagues, pupils and parents. For trainee teachers in this study the network would also extend to their University-based teacher training including its staff, curriculum and other cohorts of trainee teachers.

---

7 Symbolic interactionism is discussed in more detail on p.51.
Common characteristic 2 - Identity is dynamic, in constant change

Previous work (Sfard & Prusak, 2005; Olsen, 2008; Rots, Keltchermans & Aelterman, 2012) has considered teacher identity to be in constant change. Olsen (2008: 139) refers to teacher identity as both a product and process in the following quote, ‘it is the collection of influences from immediate contexts, prior constructs of self, social positioning and meaning systems’ and that a teacher’s identity will ‘react to and negotiate given contexts and human relationships at given moments.’

Support for the dual view of teacher identity is abundant in previous work. Rots et al, (2012) consider that enduring images of teachers are commonly defined by externally imposed normative measures. Despite this, they contend that teachers’ self-view should not be restricted by this and should be allowed to evolve through deliberate sense-making of experience. In light of this Rots et al (2012) choose to follow Keltchermans (2007, 2009) in veering away from using the term identity altogether as it inspires ‘static and essentialist connotations’ (2007: 2). They choose instead to work with the term self-understanding which, they claim, has the capacity to embrace knowledge of the self in any given moment in time as well as knowledge of the on-going evolution of the self through experience. Keltchermans (1993, 2007, 2009) has evolved five components of self-understanding. These are in constant state of change and are presented below.

1. Self-image; how teachers view themselves based on what is mirrored to them by others, for example comments by pupils, colleagues, parents.
2. Self-esteem (the evaluative component); the digestion of comments into how teachers view their performance.
3. Task perception (the normative component); the teacher’s deeply held beliefs and values about what it means to be a teacher.
4. Job motivation (the conative component); the motives to take up teaching, to stay in teaching, to achieve goals or to leave the profession.
5. Future perspective; this component demonstrates how the present and the past can combine to influence a teacher’s intentions for the future.

Whilst accepting the stance taken by some authors (Keltchermans, 2009; Rots et al, 2012) on how the word identity may be perceived as static, this study maintains its use
and does not choose to distinguish between identity and self-understanding. Using the term identity in this study therefore includes what some authors may refer to as self-understanding.

Common characteristic 3 - Teacher identity requires interplay between personal and professional selves.

Being a teacher inextricably links the person and the profession. Research has previously cited the inability to separate the person from their occupation and has tended instead to focus on how one influences and informs the other (Nias, 1989; Pajak & Blasé, 1989; Keltchemans & Vandenberghe, 1994). Teaching requires a considerable emotional and personal input and as a result a teacher’s identity should combine personal and professional dimensions (Lipka & Brinthaupt, 1999). Others have described the interweaving of personal and professional selves as unavoidable due to the human investment required in contemporary teaching and noted that teachers find it difficult to draw distinctions between their teaching and personal lives (Day, Kington, Stobart & Sammons, 2006). Previous research has suggested that teachers’ personal lives are intimately linked to the perception of their performance in their professional lives (Hargreaves & Goodson, 1996; Acker, 1999). Additionally, Nias (1989: 5) refers to the ‘persistent self-referentialism’ when teachers are asked to talk about teaching suggesting their inability to differentiate between the two.

Of significance to the present study is research by Rodgers & Scott (2008) into the interplay between personal and professional selves. They distinguished between external contributors to identity (such as the context and contextual relationships) and internal contributors (such as personal stories, beliefs and emotions). This fusion of context and biography is considered by Rodgers & Scott (2008:733) to be pivotal in teacher identity as the ‘normative demands of the external encounter the internal meaning making and desires of the teacher.’ How these two factors combine is an important consideration in learning to become a teacher.

Common characteristic 4 - Teacher identity is influenced by agency

The role played by agency in the development of teacher identity is well documented in literature. The discussion on agency in this study is not focused on the much larger
sociological debates surrounding human agency (Bandura, 1989; Foucault, 1984). The emphasis here is placed on how human beings are able to influence their lives and their environment while also being shaped by it (Bourdieu, 1977; Giddens, 1984). The primary concern here is the ways in which social and cultural tools have the capacity to shape and be shaped by thoughts and actions (Vygotsky, 1978; Wertsch, 1991).

Central to this interpretation of agency and its role on teacher identity is the manner in which structure (external influences) impacts upon agency (ones perception of ability to pursue a course of action). Structure and agency can be in a state of tension or unison. How this relationship manifests in the lives of teachers has been the subject of much academic attention (Day et al, 2006; Lasky, 2005).

If a teacher has a sound realization of their identity, a strong sense of who they are and what they stand for, they will have a strong sense of agency in moving ideas forward (Beauchamp & Thomas, 2009). They will have feelings of empowerment in achieving goals and in shaping or influencing the context. Sfard & Prusak (2005) support this view of people as active agents who can play decisive roles in the dynamics of social life. However, there is an alternative view that teachers’ identities can become undermined in the pursuit of prescribed roles or actions or when their ‘personal voice is suppressed in favour of an objective and distanced voice’ (Cooper & Olsen, 1996: 87). This scenario has become increasingly evident over the last decade as demands of the centralised curriculum and pressure to achieve exam success have reduced teacher agency (Mahoney & Hextall, 2000), autonomy and sense of control (Carlisle & Woods, 2002). Teacher identity can become threatened when having to work to the agenda of others. This can have negative consequences for the teacher when this is in direct opposition to their preferred ways of operating (Perryman, Ball, Maguire & Braun, 2011).
2.3 Summarizing teacher identity in this study

A useful summary of teacher identity, which is helpful in drawing together each of the four common characteristics reviewed above, is offered by Sachs (2005: 15):

*Teacher professional identity stands at the core of the teaching profession. It provides a framework for teachers to construct their own ideas of ‘how to be’, ‘how to act’ and how to understand their work and their place in society. Importantly, teacher identity is not something that is fixed, nor is it imposed; rather it is negotiated through experience and the sense that is made of that experience.*

This quote captures a view of identity that is applicable to this study. Teacher identity is the tool used to help us understand the journey that trainee teachers are on in learning to become a teacher. They are accruing experience which is informing who they are and what they want to be. They are trying to understand themselves within an ever-changing and challenging context.

Whilst the majority of research into teacher identity has focused on qualified teachers, this review will now begin to raise questions from the perspective of trainee teachers as they accrue experience. The focus on trainee teachers is a distinctive feature of this thesis.

Four common characteristics of teacher identity can be found throughout relevant literature. These four characteristics are a useful basis to frame this study. Using the lens of identity helps build a picture of how experience impacts on the way that trainees begin to view themselves as teachers.

- Interactions between the teacher and the environment are influential in the forming of an identity. This study explores the interplay between the trainee and the contexts in which they are trained.
- Trainees on the cusp of entering the profession are the product of their experiences. This in turn contributes to who they are and how they act. Recognising and accepting teacher identity as malleable is significant to this study.
- Teacher identity encompasses personal and professional selves.
- A strong sense of agency contributes to a sound development of identity. This can create feelings of empowerment and confidence in shaping the context. Over-powering structure can weaken identity and have negative impacts.

The next section will take a more focused look into the experiences of trainee teachers in establishing an identity and how this is influenced by their experiences.

### 2.4 Learning to become a teacher

Trainee teachers are at the start of a journey of establishing themselves as teachers. Trainees are in what Sachs (2005: p.15) describes as a process of finding out ‘how to be, how to act and how to understand’ themselves in their work. The following section reviews literature discussing key influences on trainee teacher identity development and the outcomes of some of the early experiences in learning to become a teacher.

#### 2.4.1 Trainee teacher identity

The typical identity desired by trainee teachers is to be seen as warm, caring and approachable by pupils (Shkedi & Laron, 2004). They want to identify with pupils, create connections and be popular. These intentions often become acted out through practice characterised as altruistic in nature (Daehlen, 2008). Trainee teachers enter their ITT programme with strong beliefs about teaching, pupils and about themselves as teachers (Tillema, 1995). Their identity and their expectations for practice have been informed by their own experiences as a pupil through an apprenticeship of observation (Lortie, 1975). These early experiences, part of their biography, initiate the start of the identity building process as new insights take time to overhaul often happy memories of experiences as a pupil (Kennedy, 1999).

i) Early idealism as trainees hold idealistic expectations about teaching and the type of teacher they want to be.

ii) Surviving school based experiences.

iii) Action taken to blend into the school by trading the teacher they want to be for the teacher they need to be to survive.

iv) Altered practice to match the teacher they need to be to survive.

v) Divergence between their practice and their deeply held beliefs about teaching.

During the final stage Reynolds (1996: p. 75) suggests that trainees become ‘enculturated as a good teacher according to prescribed definitions.’ Shkedi & Laron (2005) go a stage further in suggesting that trainee teachers quickly move from notions of idealism to pragmatism in order to fit into the school’s way of operating. They ask the rhetorical question of whether this should be deemed as a progressive or regressive step for education.

Furlong & Maynard’s (1995) stages outline a sequence of events that occurs when trainees begin to accrue relevant professional experience to add to their existing beliefs. Keltchermans (1993, 2007, 2009) contends that this fusion creates a core to a personal interpretive framework; an evolving, always temporary lens through which they perceive their job, its demands and how they intend to act. This is the start of trainee teacher identity building.

Training exposes trainees to situations which require revision of their personal interpretive framework. These may be critical incidents, moments or relationships (Keltchermans, 1993; Sikes, Measor & Woods, 1985) or influential socialising experiences (Smagorinsky, Cook, Moore, Jackson & Fry, 2004). The start of a teaching career has been described as a two way struggle as new entrants to the profession wrestle between how they want to be but at the same time are exposed to how they should be by socialising influences of the school (Huberman, 1995; Shkedi & Laron, 2004). Such contextual pressures can be considered to contribute to the socialisation experienced by trainee teachers. Three differing views of socialisation are presented in table 5.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Theory of socialisation</th>
<th>Major theorists</th>
<th>Major tenets</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Consensus / Functionalist Theory</td>
<td>Durkheim, Parsons</td>
<td>Socialisation contributes to stability in society</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>All institutions, roles and norms are indispensable for stability of society</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conflict Theory</td>
<td>Marx, Webber</td>
<td>Socialisation is a way for those with power to preserve the status quo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Conflict between people is an ongoing and fundamental part of society</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interaction Theory</td>
<td>Blumer, Mead, Goffman</td>
<td>Socialisation is a major determinant of human nature</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Behaviour is determined by how people define and give meaning to situations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>they face</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5; alternative positions on socialisation

Trainee teachers are not passive recipients of contextual pressures or socialisation processes. Adopting an interactionist perspective in this study accepts that teachers learn as they accumulate and absorb social experience (Carter & Doyle, 1996; Ballet & Keltchermans, 2008). It is through their interactions that trainees develop pedagogic and subject knowledge but also a fuller understanding of themselves as teachers (Beijaard, Meijer & Verloop, 2004; Rodgers & Scott, 2008). As trainees develop a sense of identity through their work they experience moments and situations which either strengthen or conflict with the views they hold. It is widely accepted that experiencing dissonance due to social interactions, and the emotions which result, are inherent and necessary parts of becoming a professional (Kagen, 1992; Martin, 1996). Previous work has considered the socialisation of trainee teachers as part of the hidden curriculum⁸ of teacher education (Barratt, Solomon, Singer, Portelli & Mujuwamaria, 2009). Assisting trainees in understanding and dealing with this feature of their work is considered to be consistently marginalised in teacher training programmes (Beauchamp & Thomas, 2009).

It can be difficult for trainees to contend with their early identity being challenged or conflicted. Such moments are well known in the profession and have been labelled

⁸ Hidden curriculum – ‘Instructional norms and values not openly acknowledged by teachers or school officials.’ (Vang, 2006: 20)
praxis shock in teaching (Cole & Knowles, 1993) and reality shock in nursing (Kramer, 1974). The phenomenon is particularly well known when trainees are on the interface between training and the workplace and when personal beliefs conflict with those required by everyday practice and those around them.

The training phase is a critical and challenging period in the development of a teacher’s identity. It is the first time that the beliefs held by the trainee are pitched against those required by the context. Trainees can expect to experience many problems and critical moments in their training. Of principle concern to this study are the emotional impacts on trainees as they try to develop a clear view of themselves and the teaching profession. The next section reviews literature on the place of emotions in becoming a teacher.

2.4.2 Emotions of becoming a teacher

Conceptions of emotion have historically been aligned to either a physiological, psychological or, much later, a sociological perspective. Early work by eminent theorists such as William James and Carl Lange (1888, cited in Cannon, 1927) considered that emotions were physiological phenomena. As psychological research gathered momentum into the 20th century, emotions were increasingly regarded as cognitive processes (Arnold, 1960; Tomkins, 1962; Simon, 1967; Lazarus & Folkman, 1984). Over the last 40 years the nature of emotion has been debated from sociological perspectives (Collins, 1975; Hochschild, 1979; Kemper, 1978; Schott, 1979). Whilst these differing positions on emotion are still discussed separately advances in neuroscience and neuro-imaging (LeDoux, 2002; Damasio, 2010) have resulted in contemporary conceptions of emotions being combinations of differing positions. This study, as with others which have focused on the lives of teachers (Schultz, Hong, Cross & Osbon, 2006; Split, Koomen & Thijs, 2011) considers that emotions are relational. This perspective views emotions as not residing in the individual or within the environment but as a result of person-environment interactions. Important within this study is the ability to look at the link between ‘microscopic perspectives of the teacher self’ alongside ‘macroscopic features of the social, political and historical environment’
(Zembylas, 2011: 31). Adopting this perspective is in-keeping with the interactionist stance adopted for this study.

Teaching is widely recognised as an emotive profession (Kinman, Wray & Strange, 2011; Hargreaves, 2000; Zembylas, 2005; Freid, 1995). Literature has also cited that trainee and early career teachers have emotion embedded in their work (Fransson, 2006; Paulin, 2007). Most regularly cited sources of emotion for new and trainee teachers are when their long held identity for themselves as teachers is challenged due to unrewarding classroom experiences (Day et al, 2004; Hargreaves 2000), having to adopt the practice of others (Keltchermans, 2009; Perryman et al, 2011), or due to challenging relationships with new colleagues (Jakhelln, 2009). Role ambiguity or confusion over how to fulfil the role of the teacher is considered as having an accumulative emotional effect on trainee teachers (Clemente, 1999).

The accumulation of emotion has been considered to contribute to burnout symptoms in early career teachers (Carlyle & Woods, 2004; Grayson & Alvarez, 2007). Discussion on burnout in teaching has been the subject of a great deal of research from the earliest warnings within the profession (McGuire, 1979) to current concerns over continued attrition rates (Kinman, Wray & Strange, 2011).

Each of the examples cited in the paragraph at the top of the page show emotions as being a result of an interactional process between person and environment. The type and intensity of emotion felt will be dependent upon how the individual interprets this interaction and will be heavily influenced by the strength of their beliefs and identity (Cross & Hong, 2012). It has been reported in previous work that interactions such as this are very common in the pre-service and early years of teaching and that trainees have little voice in the interactional process between person and context. As a result, trainees and early career teachers have little agency to shape their own identity (Nias, 1989; Day, Assuncio & Viana, 2007). The constant confrontation with novel experiences that are inherent features of being a novice come thick and fast in the final professional semester, this leads to a continual construction, deconstruction and reconstruction of identity (Reynolds, 1996).

---

9 Burnout is considered here as being comprised of three components of emotional exhaustion, depersonalization and diminished personal achievement (Maslach, Jackson & Leiter, 1996).
Becoming a teacher involves experiencing and managing strong emotions. How trainees handle their emotions is recognised as an important factor in becoming a teacher (Day, Assuncio & Viana, 2007). It is also clear that a contributing factor to the emotional load of trainees is the challenge to develop a clear identity which is consistent with personal beliefs about the profession. The next section draws together themes that have emerged out of this literature review providing a basis for the study research questions.

2.5 Summary of the literature and gaps in research

This chapter has presented the view teachers have of themselves, their identity, as a lens through which to view the study. The review of literature has drawn together previous work that has discussed common characteristics of teacher identity. Literature presented has shown that there is broad agreement in the most substantive features of teacher identity.

Literature has also shown that trainee teachers face challenges in developing and maintaining a sense of their own identity. The notion that trainees undergo rapid and regular reconstruction of their identities through their early experiences has been discussed. Questions remain regarding the emotional demands of this process.

Jakhelln (2011) reviews two generations of research into emotions in teaching. First, with predominance in the 1980s, came research into the type and nature of emotions experienced by teachers. Secondly, since 2000, the research focus was on how emotions are created and become an inherent part of the role of the teacher. Currently neglected, and requiring a third generation of research, is understanding of the role played by emotions in helping or hindering development of different groups of teachers at different stages of the teacher life cycle. Recent studies into emotions have focused specifically on female teachers (Noor & Zainuddin, 2011), secondary school teachers (Jakhelln, 2011) and experienced [>10 years] primary school teachers (Cross & Hong, 2012). To date there is limited literature that considers contributors to the emotional load placed on trainee teachers or the role played by emotions in becoming a teacher.
Reviewing the most recent literature on teacher identity, emotions in teaching and teacher education, there are key questions still to be answered which could further inform current ITT processes. Previous studies have concluded that more research is needed into trainees’ experiences as they begin to build a teacher identity (Freese, 2006). Other studies state that more can be learned from students who are placed in situations which challenge their beliefs and self-identity (Smagorinsky, Cook, Moore, Jackson & Fry, 2004). The present study intends to add to these areas where there is currently limited coverage.

2.6 Refined research aims and research questions

The central aim of this study is;

1. To build an explanatory theory of emotional demands of becoming a PE teacher.

The following secondary aims are;

2. To use trainee recollections of working with obese and sedentary children to initiate discussion on their training experience.
3. To add to the understanding of contributors to the emotional load on trainee PE teachers.
4. To generate recommendations to further inform ITT in assisting trainees to manage their emotional load.

The study has the following research questions;

- What factors contribute to the emotional load on trainee PE teachers?
- Do threats and challenges to identity impact on the emotional demands on trainee PE teachers?
- How does emotional load impact on trainee PE teachers?
- What strategies can help trainees in coping with the emotional demands of becoming a teacher?
• How can ITT evolve to better prepare trainees for the emotional demands of becoming a teacher?

The next chapter presents the methodological decisions in relation to data collection and analysis that could achieve the aims and answer the research questions.
Chapter 3  
Methodology  

This chapter presents the methodological decisions that were taken in order to fulfil the aims of the study. The central aim was to inductively build a theory of the emotional demands of learning to become a PE teacher. Decisions were taken to provide a sound theoretical basis and a clear audit trail to the collection and analysis of data relative to the research question.

This chapter;

- Begins with a discussion of the paradigm of inquiry used in the study.
- Presents a critical overview of theory building research and the use of dimensional analysis, an analytical method that utilises grounded theory methods.
- Critiques decisions made in designing the study relating to ethical issues and measures taken to protect study participants.
- Considers the trustworthiness, credibility and generalisability of the study along with strategies employed to ensure methodological rigour.

3.1 Paradigm of inquiry

The nature of reality, how best to discover reality and the selection of methods, arise from the nature of the research question along with the philosophical beliefs of the researcher (Annells, 1996; Mills, Bonner & Francis, 2006). This section presents an overview of the methodological decisions made within this study.

To build an explanatory theory of learning to become a PE teacher a constructivist paradigm was adopted. Whilst this is the term which was used by Guba and Lincoln (1989), an important addition to the present study is that the researcher is acknowledged as central in the interpretation and meaning that is given to the data. The term constructivist-interpretivist is considered to be a more appropriate approach for the
present study as reality is interpreted then reconstructed by the researcher (Denzin & Lincoln, 2005).

Given the centrality of the researcher’s reconstruction and interpretation of events in this study it was also important to verify the researcher’s reconstructed account. Verification of meaning in data analysis is required to assure that researcher reconstructions have not been interpreted from outside the experience of the participants. Numerous authors have asserted the place of the researcher as an integral part of the research process as opposed to an objective observer (Mills, Bonner & Francis, 2006; Finlay & Gough, 2003; Walsh & Downe, 2006). During data collection and analysis reflexive memos were taken to acknowledge this process. Reflexive commentary became an inherent feature of the methods used and have been incorporated in two ways;

i) By permeating reflexive comments into the text at times throughout the thesis

ii) By making an overall reflexive and reflective comment at the end of chapter 7 (section 7.5).

Showing appreciation of my own values was important when adopting the view that reality is socially constructed. Cavana, Delahaye & Sekaran (2001: 43) consider that ‘the researcher becomes the vehicle through which this reality is revealed’. In support, Appleton (1997), Guba and Lincoln (1989) and Stratton (1997) all highlight the ‘humanness’ of the researcher and that their values must be acknowledged as inevitable elements of research outcomes. For this study it was not considered possible or desirable to delineate myself from the participants. I adopted a position which could account for my emerging analytical account of the stories they shared with me. This included cycles of inductive and deductive reasoning and by providing participants with opportunities to verify the emerging story at regular intervals during analysis.

Adopting this constructivist stance denies the existence of an external, objective reality and instead asserts that there are multiple realities. In this respect, constructivism assumes a relativist ontological position. The essence of relativism has been summarized by Guba and Lincoln (1989) in that realities are social constructions of the
mind, whereas Strauss and Corbin assert that ‘a reality cannot actually be known, but is always interpreted’ (2008: 22). Bernstein (1983) extends relativism to include individual constructions of reality which are based upon interpretations of society and context.

This study assumes a relativist ontology and constructivist-interpretivist epistemological position. What follows is a critical selection of a methodology which ‘fits’ with this view of knowledge and provides the processes able to achieve the aims of the study.

3.2 Theory building research

Theory building research is appropriate when investigating social processes or phenomena for which there is limited knowledge or no formal theories. Whilst the nature and impacts of emotional demands encountered by qualified teachers has received good coverage, relatively little is known about the demands on trainees. It was therefore felt necessary to use a theory building methodology to generate an explanation.

Theory building research seeks to build robust theory whilst providing rigorous analytical trails that are transparent and make decisions explicit. Theory building research has its roots firmly embedded in symbolic interactionism (Blumer, 1969; Mead, 1934, Dewey, 1938). Symbolic interactionism is defined by Blumer (1969: 21) as ‘an approach designed to yield verifiable knowledge of human group life and human conduct.’

Central to interaction is the place of symbols in human interaction. Most symbolic in contemporary society is considered to be language (Sarantakos, 1993), and is utilised as the principle symbol in this study. The three central tenets of symbolic interactionism (SI) are evident within the methods employed and are depicted in the table overleaf.
Core principles of SI | Evident within this study
---|---
Action is based on the meaning that people assign to experience | - Participants reflect on experiences prior to and during data collection through interviews
- Participants respond on the meaning that their experiences have to them
- Participant experience is bound by a context and subsequent actions are central considerations of dimensional analysis

Meaning arises from social interactions | - Meaning is constructed through the interaction between researcher and participant

Symbols are central to interactions | - Participant voice through interviews is the principle symbol used in the interpretive paradigm

Table 6; three central features of symbolic interactionism in this study

Interpretive research of this nature asserts that social reality is constructed through human interaction (Orlikowski & Baroudi, 1991). Symbolic interactionism can be considered as the guiding methodological principle in this study.

3.3 Grounded theory methods

Grounded theory (GT) is the ‘discovery of theory from data’ (Glaser and Strauss, 1967: 1). Since the original version of grounded theory inspired by Glaser and Strauss in 1967 there have been many adaptations which have served to broaden the method and generated debate over its philosophical assumptions (Strauss, 1987; Strauss and Corbin, 1990, 1998; Annells, 1996; Charmaz, 1995, 2000, 2014; Clark, 2005.) The separation of the original authors into binary opposition (Mills, Bonner & Francis, 2006) with Glaser standing by his ‘classical’ version of GT method against an ‘evolved’ interpretation of Strauss & Corbin, has led to divisions over interpretation and application. The continued broadening of variations of grounded theory methods, described as second generation methods by Clark (2005), has been considered as a methodological spiral with Glaser on one end of a continuum and constructivist interpretations at the other (McCann & Clark, 2003). Mills et al (2006) consider it vital that researchers employing GT methods should identify the point on this methodological spiral that resonates with
their own beliefs about the nature of knowledge and reality as well as the nature of the research question.

The methodological approach for this research is located at the constructivist end of the spiral. The work of Strauss and Corbin (1994: 279) refutes the existence of ‘a pre-existing reality ‘out-there.’ To think otherwise is to take a positivistic position that....we reject....Our position is that truth is enacted.’ This ontological position resonates with that of the researcher and the methodological framework in this study and therefore moves away from the belief of Glaser (1967) that truth is discovered within the data. In addition, Strauss and Corbin (1994) acknowledge the existence of multiple ‘truths’ and the importance of recognising the participant’s context in the reconstruction of theory. Adopting a constructivist perspective (Charmaz, 2014) acknowledges the pivotal place of the researcher – participant relationship within the research and reasserts the centrality of symbolic interactionism as a guiding principle in the present study.

3.4 Selecting a process for data collection and analysis

This section presents an overview of some of the challenges of using a constructivist theory building methodology. The first challenges to a neophyte researcher when undertaking theory building research are the issues of complexity or mystique. Whilst accepting and utilising many of the processes of grounded theory, Leonard Schatzman (1991) criticised the method as having operations which were mysterious and difficult to follow. He asserted that there was a lack of a theoretical structure or set of operations to follow which, in turn, led to confusion and misguided application of the method. The lack of concrete instruction presents serious consequences to the novice researcher in finding ways of elucidating their analytic procedures and presenting transparency to their findings. These limitations can often undermine the whole research process. Recognising the ‘fit’ of this study with constructivist interpretations of theory building research was reassuring, however, the complexity of operations which underpin Strauss and Corbin’s method was initially disconcerting. Mills et al (2006) cite Strauss and Corbin’s (1990) complicated array of procedures for coding, memmoing and diagramming as presenting challenges to researcher understanding. Melia (1996: 376)
considered the complexity as a potential diversion from the creation of knowledge from data as ‘the technical tail begins to wag the theoretical dog.’ These challenges of using grounded theory methods resonated with me as early on I became more focused on analytical processes than the theoretical possibilities within the data.\textsuperscript{10}

Selecting a specific methodological approach from a range of contested positions required consideration. For example, the use of literature in theory building research is a contested area and can present further challenges to the researcher\textsuperscript{11}. Two uncontested principles of grounded theory methods are that theory must be built inductively from the data and that researchers should have a sound grasp of the phenomenon under investigation.

The following table summarizes hallmarks of classic grounded theory alongside the approaches taken within this study.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Classical Grounded theory\textsuperscript{12}</th>
<th>Explanation of approach taken in this constructivist-interpretivist study</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Objectivist</td>
<td>Constructivist / relativist</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Master narrative</td>
<td>Modest contribution to the field</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Universal truths and generalizations</td>
<td>Situated knowledge, partial perspectives from a bounded case</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Researcher as tabula rasa – ‘open mind but not an empty head’</td>
<td>Researcher is able to be openly knowledgeable about area of research and gradually sensitised towards theoretical possibilities within the data</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Literature review suspended</td>
<td>Literature used for project design and as data. More focused literature reviewed as the substantive theory takes shape</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Theoretical sampling\textsuperscript{13} To achieve verification of my reconstructed version of participant stories. Theoretical sampling was carried out during rounds 2 and 3 of data collection and through focus groups with mentors and University staff

Theoretical sensitivity\textsuperscript{14} Through a working knowledge of the area of research, professional involvement in the field and previous assignments in stage 1 of the EdD. Heightened theoretical sensitivity through engagement with

\textsuperscript{10} This is further considered in the reflections and limitations of the study in section 7.5
\textsuperscript{11} Use of literature in this thesis is presented on pages 34-36.
\textsuperscript{12} Constructs adapted from published works of Clarke (2005) and Mills et al (2006). The terms used in the Classical Grounded Theory column are from these authors published work. The table provides an indication of the resonance of the use of different GT processes within the present study. Where there is divergence with the present study an explanation and alternative is presented.
\textsuperscript{13} Theoretical sampling - method of sampling to develop theoretical concepts or categories
\textsuperscript{14} Theoretical sensitivity – the ability to understand what is going on in the data
literature during data analysis. Use of literature was guided by the data and emerging theory

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Project planning</th>
<th>Ongoing evolution of the study through inductive and deductive reasoning</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Grounded theory coding – open and theoretical</td>
<td>Dimensionalising and differentiation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Memoing and diagraming</td>
<td>Memoing and diagramming occurred throughout the cycles of data collection and analysis. These processes provided the audit trail of decisions made during cycles of inductive and deductive reasoning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Constant comparative method</td>
<td>Constant comparative method was used between participants</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theory inductively built from data</td>
<td>Through inductive and deductive reasoning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theoretical saturation(^{15})</td>
<td>Theoretical sufficiency(^{16}) - no claim is made to saturation due to the confines of the EdD study. It was considered that sufficient analysis had been carried out to arrive at a point for writing a substantive theory. A claim of saturation would hold a different epistemological position than the one adopted in this study</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Formal theory identified</td>
<td>Substantive theory constructed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Author has authority as expert in the theory generated</td>
<td>Author offers reflexive voice in research process and outcome</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Researcher seeks verification of the interpretation and reconstruction of theory</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 7; the methodological approach for this study against classical grounded theory

From table 7 it can be seen that 5 of the central tools of grounded theory are used in this study but 10 other constructs are less apparent. Therefore, the majority of criteria which constitute classical grounded theory are not followed within this study. Processes employed in this study are closely related to constructivist methods and can be considered as second generation grounded theory. The specific method utilized in this study forms the basis of the next section.

3.5 Dimensional analysis

Dimensional analysis was conceived by Leonard Schatzman (1991) as a result of supervising students who claimed to be using grounded theory methodology but found the applications complex, mysterious and lacking in transparency. He criticised classical GT as lacking ‘structural foundation that would allow for the explicit articulation of the

\(^{15}\) Theoretical saturation – the point where further data collection fails to add to existing properties or insights

\(^{16}\) Theoretical sufficiency – taking that saturation of data is contested the term sufficiency is based less on the assumption that saturation has been reached and that categories raised are sufficient to generate an explanatory theory.
analytic process’ (Kools, McCarthy, Durham & Robrecht, 1996: 313). Schatzman’s response was to generate a process for building theory which had a clearer articulation of the steps taken in theory generation. Through dimensional analysis Schatzman embraced the principles of symbolic interactionism and the centrality of language as a symbol of human interaction. The processes of dimensional analysis outlined below, enabled me to audit my own interaction with the data and develop an interpretation of interactions between the participants and the phenomenon of learning to become a teacher.

Dimensional analysis is concerned with ‘what all is involved’ in the data (Schatzman, 1991: 310). By this Schatzman was keen to encourage researchers to engage in what he termed ‘natural analysis’ to yield an understanding of ‘all’ considerations and to create a much broader view of the theoretical potential of the data. Researchers naturally break complex situations down into constituent parts called dimensions. The closeness of the researcher to the data reflects the central tenet of symbolic interactionism within dimensional analysis as the researcher is asked to interact very closely with the participants and the data to yield its full diversity and potential. More specifically, the researcher is required to analyse and interpret the properties, context, processes and consequences of the phenomenon under investigation. Looking at the data in this way provides a ‘scaffold’ to organise, analyse and collect further data.

Three stages of analysis were identified by Schatzman (1991) and refined by Kools et al (1996). Whilst the stages are represented here sequentially it should be recognised that they exist as iterative processes which continue up until the final drafting of the substantive theory\(^{17}\). The three stages are

- **Dimensionalising** (Schatzman, 1991; Kools et al, 1996) or conjuring (Bowers and Schatzman, 2009)
- **Differentiation**
- **Integration**

*Dimensionalising* is the process through which the data is expanded to illuminate its theoretical possibilities. Data pieces are identified and labelled along with various

\(^{17}\) Examples of these analytic processes are presented in appendices 5, 6, 7 and 8
properties of the dimension. This early process involves the creation or conjuring of a critical mass of dimensions concerning the phenomenon under investigation to identify what ‘all’ is in the data. Each dimension is an abstracted component of the research area, in this case the emotional demands of becoming a teacher. Dimensionalising is a creative process which begins immediately after the start of data collection and continues up until the final stage in writing up the substantive theory. Alongside the naming of data pieces, memos are written to document decisions taken in the creation of dimensions and the key questions which serve to inform further data collection and analysis. This audit trail is a significant source of transparency and rigor in the study’s findings.

The relative importance or salience of dimensions is considered during differentiation. At this stage dimensions are organised into an explanatory matrix providing an order and meaning to an otherwise disparate group of concepts. The analysis at this stage moves from a mere description of what ‘all’ is in the data, to the drafting of a story of the case which can offer meaning and explanation. Dimensional analysis provides a scaffold upon which the researcher can begin to build an explanation. This scaffold is comprised of context, conditions, processes and consequences. The researcher is able to draw together dimensions onto this framework to begin to gather ideas about the phenomenon under investigation.

In dimensional analysis the story is underpinned by a central lens or perspective. One of the key features of this approach is to recognise an initial study perspective and use it as a theoretical device to see ‘what all’ is in the data. The most salient dimensions from the critical mass accrued during dimensionalising are each then auditioned as the study perspective. As the perspective changes the story is re-written to accommodate different points of view. One dimension will ‘assume a key position within the matrix because of its explanatory power’ (Kools et al, 1996: 318). Other dimensions then become more or less significant to the emerging theory. At this point in the analysis further focused data collection can take place in the form of theoretical sampling whereby elements of the emerging theory can be tested and moulded.

The final stage, integration, refers to the drafting of the developing theory. The final explanatory theory is a representation of the relationships between dimensions,
informed by an overall study perspective. The matrix is used as the basis for writing up the explanatory theory. Dimensional analysis was adopted as the method for this study due to:

i) Theory building in an area where little is known but can account for the researcher voice within the substantive theory.

ii) The affordance of a clear structure to the analytic process for a neophyte researcher.

iii) A ‘fit’ with the epistemological assumptions of the researcher.

Each stage of the process is covered in detail in chapter 4 along with examples and an audit trail of how the theoretical direction emerged through iterative cycles of data collection and analysis.

3.6 Case study design

Case study can either be used as part of a research design (Crotty, 1998), as in this study, or as a broader paradigm with its own methodological assumptions about the social world (Gomm, Hammersley & Foster, 2000; Denzin & Lincoln, 2000). The case, or bounded system (Smith, 1978), comprised a group of 10 trainee PE teachers from one teacher training institution. Constant comparisons between individuals within the case formed part of the study design, in-keeping with the constant comparative method, which is a common feature of studies using grounded theory processes. Collectively the participants comprised the case and individually the participants’ voices were compared within the case.

The position adopted for this thesis, using case study as part of the design alongside second generation grounded theory methods, differs from that of Yin (2003) whose work supports the use of case study as the methodology. However, in-keeping with the present study, Yin (2003) does agree with the notion of case study design as a particularly useful strategy to build an understanding of phenomena in real life contexts. It can also provide the researcher with the opportunity to gain a more holistic picture of what is happening in the context under investigation.
Common criticisms of this use of case study as a design often emerge from positivistic researchers who are critical of a perceived lack of robustness or precision in the methodological process (Tellis, 1997). These opinions are contested by Siggelkow (2007) who values case study design as it uses the natural setting and adds ecological validity, richness, and depth of insight to research. Through researching a single case the researcher has the opportunity to become a ‘passionate participant’ (Guba and Lincoln, 1989: 72) in the research process. This can contribute to further closeness to the phenomenon in question and enhance the richness of the data (Diaz Andrade, 2009).

Case study design in interpretive research has also been criticised due to a lack of detailed procedures (Diaz Andrade, 2009) and a lack of transparent ‘explanation building’ (Yin, 2003: 120). A method which has the ability to clearly articulate the theory building process was adopted in this study in order to address these perceived limitations. Dimensional analysis provides this structure on which to create a coherent and transparent audit trail to the building of the substantive theory.

3.7 Insider research

Participants in this study were all recruited from one of two courses which accredit PE with QTS at the place of the researcher’s full time employment. Trainees from the 4 year BA (Hons) degree and the PGCE in PE courses were all sent a letter inviting them to be involved in the research study (appendix 1). The researcher had been heavily involved in the ITT of the BA (Hons) degree and had been peripheral to the teaching of the PGCE course. Whilst such research from the ‘inside’ offered insights and contextual depth to the study, it could also constrain access to participants and the information they are prepared to give (Holian, 1999; Boucher and Smyth, 2004).

The construction of the study raised questions concerning the insider status of the researcher. This positioning of the researcher can lead to scrutiny over the credibility of research outcomes (Sikes & Potts, 2008). The insider – outsider positioning of the researcher is not best depicted as a dichotomy but as a continuum as the researcher displays differing degrees of ‘insiderness’ at different times (Adler, 2004; Mercer, 2007). The present study has the following characteristics.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Insider characteristic</th>
<th>Present study</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Participants known to the researcher</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Researcher knowledge of the context – in this study, the University</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Knowledge of context – placement schools</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perspective of participants – going native</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Knowledge of the curriculum under investigation</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Specialist knowledge, credible voice in the field</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research activity to outlive the present study</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 8; The insider characteristics of the present study. Constructs adapted from Robson (1993) and Sikes & Potts (2008)

Whilst the study fits into the broad boundary of insider research according to Robson (1993, 2002) there are also key elements of the research where I could be considered an outsider. For example, issues relating to specific situations, age, gender, emotions or attitudes of participants towards themes raised could only be perceived from my perspective as researcher.

There are advantages to displaying the insider characteristics shown in table 8. Having knowledge of participants can develop a strong rapport and enhance the quality of interview data (Kushner, 2000). Research into educational settings can benefit from a pre-existing teacher-participant relationship and provide more in-depth responses (Burke & Kirton, 2006; Mercer, 2007). In addition, an added benefit of familiarity with the course studied by trainees is that it can add to the flow of interviews. The inverse is also apparent on occasions where my status shifted towards the outsider end of the continuum and I had to be aware that there may be a different rapport with participants and that data may not be as free-flowing.

Limitations to insider status relate to impacts of researcher and participant bias in the study. Researcher bias can be a result of familiarity with participants whereby statements may be taken for granted or false assumptions made (Mercer, 2007). In theory building research this may have theoretical consequences as researchers look to recognise and confirm their suspicions of what is in the data as opposed to exploring a

---

18 An example of this is presented on pages 81-82 where I use my knowledge of the course and from my own initial teacher training to create a free-flowing interview environment.
wider range of possibilities. In these situations it is necessary to make the phenomenon conceptually strange by seeking conceptual levers to surface new perspectives. Each new possibility can then be audited through memos. Additional challenges from the insider characteristics of this study could include issues relating to power, status, working relationships and confidentiality (Robson, 1993). Failing to adequately consider these challenges could limit the credibility of the study and restrict the theoretical possibilities in the data. A number of steps were taken in minimising the impact of these concerns:

- Initial contact with all students from both BA (QTS) and PGCE cohorts was timed after the submission of all assessed work. Letters stated that interviews would commence after work contributing to their degree had been marked and feedback received.

- Interviews would all take place following the PE area exam board and after career entry tutorials. Any researcher decision over trainee progression towards qualifying had ceased by this point (initial contact letter and email – appendix 1)

- Participants could request further information with no obligation to commit to the study. Further information to participants included example questions which would open the interview. Insight into the first question and a follow up question were designed to allow participants to guide the interview and to make decisions regarding the examples of practice they were prepared to discuss (further information letter – appendix 2)

- Interviews could be arranged on the University premises or at another agreed location.

- Interviews were arranged one week before the intended interview date. The participants were given this time and opportunity to reflect on their involvement in the study and were given the opportunity to withdraw should they choose. The researcher was available during the one week reflection period to answer any specific questions concerning their involvement.

---

19 Examples of memos auditing shifting perspectives and the use of conceptual levers can be found on p. 87 (table 18) and p. 88 (table 20).
20 All trainee teachers are required to attend a career entry interview with a university tutor to confirm their achievement of the QTT Standards of practice.
Following transcription participants were sent a copy of the transcript by email for comments on any inaccuracies or misinterpretations.

Participants were asked to give their informed consent in writing. The form clearly stated their right of withdrawal, anonymity and the confidentiality of the research. Limits to confidentiality were given (appendix 3).

Whether research is conducted with predominantly insider or outsider status, what is important is that participants’ voices are given genuine and respectful attention so that meaning could be mutually constructed and not forced by the researcher. Measures taken to ensure the trustworthiness and credibility of research with these insider characteristics are considered in the following section.

### 3.8 Trustworthiness

Adopting a relativist ontological position and constructivist-interpretivist epistemological stance for the study presents challenges in strengthening the trustworthiness of data analysis. A common criticism of qualitative research and in particular theory seeking research is the accusation that theory is forced due to researcher bias and preconceived ideas being forced upon the data (Cutcliffe, 2000). Theory which either lacks transparency, a clear audit trail to findings,\(^{21}\) or contains elements which are not substantiated by the data may be considered as forced and lacking integrity.

The trustworthiness of the inquiry is dependent upon four criteria (Guba, 1981; Guba and Lincoln, 1989). Each is detailed below in relation to the present study.

#### 3.8.1 Credibility

Evidencing the credibility of data analysis and research findings are central concerns for interpretive research. This is problematic for a study which is following a constructivist

---

\(^{21}\) The word ‘findings’ will be used throughout this thesis as the collective term for the outcomes of analysis. I recognise the limitation of this word as siding with the positivistic roots of traditional GT in considering that there is an objective truth waiting to be ‘found’. A more appropriate term for the constructivist paradigm of this study is offered by Stake (1995) as ‘assertions.’
paradigm where the reality is constructed by the researcher and verification is sought from the participants. The challenge for the present study was to yield credible analyses from thorough and rigorous research design, data collection and data analysis. Guba and Lincoln (1989: 237) consider credibility in constructivism as rejecting the search for a ‘presumed real reality to establishing the match between the constructed realities of respondents and those realities as represented by the evaluator and attributed to various stakeholders.’ They propose various techniques for generating credibility which have been considered here in the context of the present study.

Guba and Lincoln (1989) technique for generating credibility in constructivist research paradigm

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Guba and Lincoln (1989) technique for generating credibility in constructivist research paradigm</th>
<th>Examples from the present study</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Prolonged engagement</td>
<td>Initial interviews June – August 2010 Analysis continuing up to beginning of drafting of thesis in August 2012. Minor changes were ongoing up to February 2014 further evidencing the prolonged engagement in the area of concern.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Persistent observation</td>
<td>Study area is an inherent part of the professional world of the researcher. On-going observation and consideration of the problem was an inherent part of the research process</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peer debriefing</td>
<td>Staff seminar at 10 months and 20 months post initial data collection. Invited questions on study design and transparency of analytic process. Seminar to EdD stage 1 students in September 2011 on the development of a theoretical framework. Conference presentation in July 2014, during the final writing of the thesis. All three presentations led to questioning by peers.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Negative case studies</td>
<td>An inherent part of dimensional analysis is the trialling and rejecting of study perspectives and the testing out of numerous hypotheses before resting on one with most explanatory power. Negative cases were considered along with several lines of enquiry that were latterly rejected as not holding sufficient explanatory power.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 9: Strategies employed to enhance credibility of the study

In addition to the checks outlined above were rigorous supervisory meetings which took place every 6 weeks throughout the length of the study. Supervisors gave critical and
incisive feedback on the research and analytic process and guided the researcher in maintaining processes which maintained the credibility of the results.

Key to the constructivist-interpretivist research paradigm is that the researcher’s reconstruction of events accurately captures the intention of the participants (Beck, 1993; Cresswell, 2002). Respecting this required careful and considerate attention to the language of the participants and to seek accuracy and credibility to analysis and conclusions drawn. In addition to Guba & Lincoln’s (1989) techniques, credibility in studies using grounded theory methods can be enhanced in four ways (Chiovitti & Piran, 2003). Each of these is expanded upon below.

Firstly, participants should be involved in guiding the direction of the research process. This was achieved in two ways. Dimensions from early interviews were explored in later interviews with participants selected through theoretical sampling. At these points participants were asked to verify and comment on emerging themes. Moreover, interview questions evolved as time and analysis progressed and as theoretical concepts emerged (Cooney, 2010). Questions often became more open and explored other experiences of confronting problematic situations.

Second, the emerging theory should be checked against the participants’ meaning of the phenomenon in question (Ciovitti & Piran, 2003). This type of verification has been previously rejected by some research using grounded theory methods (Elliot & Lazenbatt, 2005). However, I considered that research using constructivist grounded theory required verification from participants as the study progressed (Mills et al 2006). Each participant was given the opportunity to read their transcript along with memos and field notes interpreting what had had been said during the interviews. As data collection and data analysis progressed with further interviews participants were invited to comment on concepts raised to date (Benton, 1996). During theoretically sampled interviews, towards the end of data collection, participants were invited to start each interview with a discussion of the central themes and the emerging theory and participants were asked whether they could ‘locate themselves’ within the theory presented. This approach concurs with what Schatzman & Strauss (1973: 135) called

---

22 See page 97 for further consideration
23 See pages 81-83 for further consideration
‘phenomenon recognition’ whereby participants were invited to recognise their own story within the emerging theory.

Thirdly, Ciovitti & Piran (2003) recommend the use of participants’ own words in the presentation and communication of findings. This has been adhered to throughout both chapters detailing the findings.24

Finally, researchers should be able to articulate their own personal views and insights into the phenomenon in question. This has been addressed through ongoing reflexive management over the duration of the study. Reflexivity involves creating and articulating one’s own position in the research process and understanding how this may guide decision making (Holloway, 2005; Birks & Mills, 2011). Charting my own experiences is woven throughout the whole thesis, in particular in chapters 1 and 7. My experiences have been embraced as a further source of data and have often acted as a starting point from which perspectives shift. Reflexive insights are also provided through analytical and reflexive memos, examples of which are presented in sections 4.3.2 and 4.3.3. These demonstrate reflexivity in some of the abstract thinking that was part of the various processes of data collection, dimensionalising and early theory generation. Throughout the whole EdD experience a research diary was kept to chart my own thoughts and feelings about my research, its direction and the processes I was undertaking. Keeping a research diary is considered to be a good way of keeping abreast of feelings as research unfolds in order to ‘reflexively analyse more than just an audit trail of decisions made in relation to operational or analytical processes’ (Birks & Mills, 2011: 54). This process can be particularly important to novice researchers in adding a further layer of reflexivity to their research (Darra, 2008).25

3.8.2 Natural generalisability

Natural generalisability refers to the extent to which the study findings can be generalised or transferred across other contexts. A significant challenge to the use of

24 A certain amount of ‘tidying up’ of participants’ own words was carried out. This is discussed along with examples on page 80.

25 Reflections on the research can be found in chapter 7, p. 173.
individual voices within a single case is to attempt to generate a much broader conceptual appreciation that extends further than the case itself. Herreid (1998) describes this as the use of an individual case to illuminate findings in a practical domain which have wider and more far reaching applications to a specific field of inquiry. In the present study this applies to the application of findings from a single case in PE teacher training to broader teacher training contexts. The question of generalisability of single cases is heavily contested. At best the constructivist study may provide a ‘thick description’ (Geertz, 1973, cited in Guba and Lincoln, 1989: 241) of the case under investigation so that researchers may be able to apply findings to contexts which show similarity or that ‘fit’ with other cases (Gomm, Hammersley and Foster, 2000).

The boundaries of the case in this study are limited to research in one teacher training institution. The nature of constructivist inquiry will depend largely on the context with results being specific to the particular case in question. Donmoyer (1990) considers traditional conceptions of generalisability have been considered to be inadequate when considering case study designs due to them being heavily influenced by positivism (Donmoyer, 1990; Guba and Lincoln, 1989). Donmoyer (1990) instead points to the uniqueness of case study design in education as its true value.

The present study set out to build a theory of the emotional demands of learning to become a PE teacher. Analysis generated an explanatory theory which may be further tested in similar contexts with different students of different biographies, at different times or even studying in different professions. The level of similarity or ‘fit’ with other contexts is a relative consideration therefore readers can make their own judgements as to the generalisable potential of this study. The ‘thick description’ of the case is designed to present ‘full and thorough knowledge of the particular’ (Stake, 2000: 7) and claims are not made that the substantive theory has sufficient explanatory power to automatically generalise to other populations. This claim would be contrary to the ontological and epistemological roots of the study. In addition to this, no claim is made that the findings of this study constitute a formal grounded theory due to the range and scope of the study. To achieve this would require comparisons between cases, a process which exceeds the stated intention of this study but which could be considered an area
for future research and require an extensive number of further studies. Theoretical sampling contributed to the creation of a substantive theory which requires greater testing across many more contexts and disciplines before approaching the rigor required for a grounded theory. For this reason the validity of the study has assumed a degree of ‘theoretical sufficiency’ (Dey, 1999: 117) as opposed to ‘theoretical saturation’ (Glaser and Strauss, 1967: 61), which implies an end point or level of completion.

3.8.3 Confirmability

Confirmability of research in the constructivist – interpretive paradigm resides in the data. The key to confirmability in this paradigm is a careful and transparent reconstruction of the story of the case that is clearly rooted in the voice of the participants. The processes underpinning dimensional analysis are clearly detailed in the following chapter, in the findings and in the appendices. Clarity is provided through interview transcripts, dimensionalising of the data, differentiation of dimensions, analytic memos, diagrams and in repeated drafts of the study findings as perspective shifted. Verification from study participants was sought at key times during the data collection and data analysis to help confirm the integrity of decisions made.

3.9 Ethical considerations

The study was presented to the ethics committee of the University Ethics Committee in April 2010. Measures were taken to ensure that the study met ethical approval and the codes of practice generally expected by research in the social sciences. Denzin and Lincoln (2008) have identified four areas of common ground across bodies overseeing scholarly activity in the professions. These four considerations are detailed overleaf along with the steps taken in the present study to ensure ethical practice.
Informed consent

- Following an open invite and expressions of interest further information was sent to participants which outlined the purpose and aims of the study and the extent of their role.
- Each participant was asked to sign informed consent having been given extensive written and verbal clarification of their role in the study.
- Clarity was given on their right to withdraw at any time.

Avoiding deception

- The study aims were communicated prior to participants agreeing to take part in the study.
- Participants were given clarity on what the data would be used for and how it would be analysed.
- Example questions were included in the further information for participants whereby they could prepare their responses on the basis of what they were prepared to disclose.

Privacy and confidentiality

- Anonymity of participants was given high priority. Following transcription voice recorders were kept in a locked drawer and deleted on an agreed date.
- Reference to names of children, schools and teachers were changed in transcriptions so that information was not traceable.
- Names of participants were changed in the presentation of this thesis. Every participant was given a name beginning with the letter ‘S’. Gender was also been concealed through this process.
- Limits to confidentiality were clearly communicated on the participant consent form (appendix 3).

Accuracy

- Transcriptions were offered to each participant following transcription to check for inaccuracies. No amendments were necessary.
- All of the original participants were given the opportunity to discuss the emergent themes and findings one year after data collection.
- Eight participants accepted the opportunity for a second interview during theoretical sampling and were given the opportunity to comment on the findings drawn at this stage.

Table 10; Steps taken to ensure ethical practice

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Denzin and Lincoln (2008) criteria code of ethics</th>
<th>Steps taken in the present study</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Informed consent</td>
<td>- Following an open invite and expressions of interest further information was sent to participants which outlined the purpose and aims of the study and the extent of their role.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Each participant was asked to sign informed consent having been given extensive written and verbal clarification of their role in the study.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Clarity was given on their right to withdraw at any time.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Avoiding deception</td>
<td>- The study aims were communicated prior to participants agreeing to take part in the study.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Participants were given clarity on what the data would be used for and how it would be analysed.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Example questions were included in the further information for participants whereby they could prepare their responses on the basis of what they were prepared to disclose.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Privacy and confidentiality</td>
<td>- Anonymity of participants was given high priority. Following transcription voice recorders were kept in a locked drawer and deleted on an agreed date.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Reference to names of children, schools and teachers were changed in transcriptions so that information was not traceable.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Names of participants were changed in the presentation of this thesis. Every participant was given a name beginning with the letter ‘S’. Gender was also been concealed through this process.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Limits to confidentiality were clearly communicated on the participant consent form (appendix 3).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accuracy</td>
<td>- Transcriptions were offered to each participant following transcription to check for inaccuracies. No amendments were necessary.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- All of the original participants were given the opportunity to discuss the emergent themes and findings one year after data collection.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Eight participants accepted the opportunity for a second interview during theoretical sampling and were given the opportunity to comment on the findings drawn at this stage.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

3.10 Summary

This chapter has outlined the methodological decisions taken in planning and executing the study in order to answer the research questions. It has also presented an overview of the ontological and epistemological views of the researcher and the need to adopt a methodology that is congruent with this worldview.

This study adopted a constructivist-intepretivist stance and employed dimensional analysis as the method to inductively build a theory of the emotional demands of
learning to become a teacher. The next chapter extends these broad decisions and provides an audit trail of processes employed in the data collection and analysis to ensure transparency to the building of an explanatory theory.
Chapter 4

Methods

This chapter:

- Provides an overview of the identification of study participants, their profile and how they were recruited to the study, with further supporting documents presented in the appendices.
- Presents an overview of the methods employed during data collection and data analysis.
- Provides examples of the steps taken in order to provide clarity and transparency to the interpretation of the data and give credibility to the findings.
- Exemplifies each stage of dimensional analysis, providing selected data to show transparency to the analytic process.

4.1 Identifying the study participants

The study participants were purposively sampled from two cohorts of trainee Physical Education teachers. One population was from 104 trainees who had just completed a 4 year BA (Honours) degree with Qualified Teacher status (QTS). The second population were 16 students who had completed their Post Graduate Certificate of Education (PGCE) qualification. Both sets of trainees had completed their final professional semester and had been awarded QTS. Excluded from the initial contact were trainees who had been referred in assessed work or who had been referred or deferred in their final professional placement. In total, 8 trainees were not in a position to be invited to be part of the study.

Initial contact was made with the 112 trainees who fulfilled the inclusion criteria through a letter and email sent to their University email address. The contact was made in the form of an open invite to all graduating trainees. The email was sent by the school liaison administrator on my behalf, while the letter was sent to the trainees’ placement...
schools. The contents of the two communications were the same and can be found in appendix 1. Trainees were invited to show expressions of interest directly to me but were reassured that these in no way constituted a formal agreement. On receipt of the expressions of interest I forwarded the participant information sheet to prospective participants that outlined further detail with regards to the nature of the study, extent of participant involvement, support and quality assurance mechanisms and example questions. In addition to this information, was a participant consent form that could be sent back or brought along to the interview (participant information sheet and consent forms can be found in appendix 2). Interview dates were arranged via email giving at least one week notice for the trainee to reconsider their involvement, ask additional questions or approach the EdD course leader.

Out of a potential field of 112 trainee teachers the sample size who expressed interest was 13 trainees. Following further information being sent out this field narrowed to 10 as two trainees felt that they could not provide sufficient time and one did not consider that they had anything to offer the research process. The 10 participants were split between the 4 year BA degree and the PGCE in a ratio of 8:2.

In addition to the data generated from semi-structured interviews with the graduating trainee teachers, further data were yielded from two focus groups. One was with three experienced, University trained mentors. This group was theoretically sampled and recruited by sending letters to current mentors in local schools who had accrued a minimum of 3 years mentoring experience. To be considered for the study mentors could not have mentored any of the participants interviewed in the study. A second was with four University teacher educators who were invited to form a focus group following a research seminar delivered to colleagues. These two focus groups were used during theoretical sampling to test out the recognisability and sufficiency of the emerging theory.

26 Letter to mentors can be found in appendix 4
4.2 Data collection

4.2.1 Interviewing

The principle form of data collection was through the use of semi-structured interviews. This format of interview was considered to best represent the nature of the researcher – participant relationship that would provide rich and meaningful data and support the interactional nature of the study. The degree of structure to the interviews was an important consideration. Structured interviews require the researcher to use a pre-prepared series of questions which are standardised across all participants (Denzin & Lincoln, 1994). This traditional form of interviewing was considered to be too closed and controlling and did not allow for participants to tell their story from their own perspective. Using a method which could be described as ‘prospecting for the true facts residing inside the respondent’ (Weinberg, 2002: 114) did not conform to the constructivist-interpretivist basis of the study. The lack of flexibility to this method would also inhibit the use of constant comparison within and between interviews to probe and develop emergent themes. The view of the respondent as ‘methodologically passive’ (Weinberg, 2002, p. 115) and not engaged in knowledge production was rejected early in the conception of the study in favour of a more interactional and active form of interviewing.

A social constructivist approach to knowledge would consider the means through which knowledge is yielded as important as the knowledge itself. This study considered interviews as more than merely a pipeline to participant experience and instead conceived the interviews as an opportunity to use the encounter to begin to actively assemble knowledge through reconstruction and verification. The interviews themselves were interpretively active, meaningful and collaborative, as opposed to being stripped of ‘interactional ingredients’ that remain sensitive to the view of knowledge as being socially constructed (Alasuutari, 1995; Holstein & Staples, 1992). Adopting a semi-structured approach allowed me to remain open and flexible to the accounts of participants and able to respond appropriately to themes as they emerged.

Important to this study was the recognition of the educative potential of the interview process to the participants. Meaning is under continual construction (Garfinkel, 1967)
and interviews can form part of the interactional process through which participants have the opportunity to develop their understanding of their experiences (Weinberg, 2002; Beer, 1997.) This process was evident in this study and is revisited in chapter 6.

4.2.2 Conducting the interviews and focus groups

The role of the interviewer is pivotal in creating meaning to experiences which reside within the participants (Silverman, 1993). Eliciting open and free flowing responses from participants had to be carefully planned. The following action was taken to achieve this;

- Through the participant information sheet participants were made aware of the aims of the study, my motives for carrying out the research, how the data would be used, how it would be stored and when it would be deleted.
- Participants were reminded in writing and in person that my role in assessing their work or influencing their QTS had ceased at the point of interview.
- The first question (table 14, page 81) was given to the trainees one week prior to the interview to allow them to plan their response and create a free flowing interview.

A further strategy that was employed to settle participants and to create an honest and open dialogue was the considered use of empathy, affirmation and self-disclosure relating to issues raised (Hall & Callery, 2001). This may lead to a sense of ‘mutual disclosure’ (Weinberg, 2002: 117). Making empathetic statements or trading anecdotes can serve to create a friendly and supportive environment during interaction (Douglas, 1985). My experience of studying the BA (QTS) course, mentoring students in schools and then contributing to the University-based element of the course gave me a good basis upon which to empathise with student recollections.27

Having received the further information, participants were asked to send a selection of dates directly to me if they would like to be involved. On each occasion common

---

27 This is an example of how the insider characteristics of my role in this research (page 63, table 8) have been used to positive effect.
ground was found and interview dates were set. Having set the interview date participants were given one week prior to the interview as a ‘cooling off’ period. They were made aware that they could withdraw from the study if necessary. No strategic decision was made as to who to interview first, the interview order was dictated by the availability of participants and the order in which the expressions of interest were received. Conducting the first interview inspired a great deal of personal reflective and reflexive thinking which was documented in a reflective diary and embedded in reflective memos, excerpts of which are shown on pages 84, 85 and 87. The benefits of completing the diary were two fold. Firstly, it allowed me to articulate to myself my own processes and assumptions about the data and how I was viewing them, and secondly they can be used as another tool for displaying an audit trail to the findings of the study. In setting time aside to complete the first interviews, a minimum of 1 hour post interview was factored in to provide an opportunity to deal with any post interview needs of the participant and also as an opportunity to use the time for immediate post interview reflections and to assemble coherent field notes (Stake, 1995).

Interviews were carried out according to the schedule set out in table 11. First interviews were spread out across a seven week period to enable me to listen back to the interview and make extensive field notes on my initial observations. This time allowed me to immediately start coding the data and begin conjuring dimensions. Clearance between first interviews was between 2 and 9 days which allowed me to make sense of what had been said and to make amendments to subsequent interview schedules. As the interviews unfolded, I was able to continue to make comparisons between participants and begin to draw together common themes which emerged (Strauss & Corbin, 1998). At the same time I was able to begin to label my interpretations under names or headings that appeared to capture the sentiment of the data pieces.

Interviews were recorded using a digital voice recorder and stored until the data had been transcribed. The Microsoft Word files were stored on my password protected university computer and on a data stick for back up. The recording of data was considered a necessary process as it gave me greater freedom to focus on the face to face interactions with the participants. Only a fraction of time was spent writing field notes during the interview. In the interests of maintaining the basis of interactionism I
wanted the participant to feel that the interaction between us was the most important feature of the interview. Setting aside time post interview for immediate detailing of field notes became even more important in order to write and collate field notes.

The first interviews accrued just under 10 hours of interview data and 157 pages of A4 transcript. Following completion of the 10 initial interviews was an extensive period of analysis between August 2010 and February 2012. This extended period of time was necessary to generate greater familiarity with the complex procedures of qualitative data analysis. As a novice researcher, this time was spent immersed in the data trying to interpret meaning and also to generate theoretical sensitivity to the ideas being created (Mills, Bonner & Francis 2006.) During this time I increased my theoretical sensitivity by mapping literature from the field, writing extensive theoretical memos and by diagramming numerous models of the emerging theory to try to capture a story of the case.28

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Participant</th>
<th>First interview – initial interview. Ongoing constant comparison between participants</th>
<th>Second interview – checking hypothesis, renaming dimensions, theoretical sufficiency</th>
<th>Third interview – theoretical sampling</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>2nd week June, 2010</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>2nd week June, 2010</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>3rd week June, 2010</td>
<td>2nd week February, 2012</td>
<td>4th week April, 2012</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>3rd week June, 2010</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>3rd week June, 2010</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>4th week June, 2010</td>
<td>4th week February, 2012</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>4th week June, 2010</td>
<td>3rd week March, 2012</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>1st week July, 2010</td>
<td>1st week March, 2012</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 11 – overview of interview timetable

Data collection re-commenced in February 2012 once I felt I had achieved a good level of theoretical sensitivity to the issues being raised from the data. Second interviews were offered to nine of the 10 original participants. Six of the remaining nine accepted the invite to be re-interviewed, four during face to face interviews and two by phone. The first two second round interviews aimed to investigate any further broadening of dimensions that may have been missed in the first series of interviews and to confirm

28 Early examples of theoretical memos can be found in appendices 5 and 6. Example diagram is presented in appendix 8.
the relative strengths of other dimensions. The following four interviews began the process of theoretical sampling whereby a story or hypothesis could be tested out to check explanatory power.

Following further analysis three third interviews were conducted along with two focus groups for further theoretical sampling. This phase of data collection was aimed at confirming sufficiency and recognisability of the emerging theory.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Focus group – theoretical sampling</th>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Composition</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>3rd week, April 2012</td>
<td>Three University of Brighton trainee mentors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>4th week, June 2012</td>
<td>Four teacher educators, University of Brighton</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 12 - focus groups conducted towards the end of analysis.

### 4.3 Data analysis

As previously stated the data collection and data analysis were conducted simultaneously with ongoing iteration between the two. This section is presented in a linear format from the start of data collection with the first interviews. Each step of data collection, changes to interview schedules, and the evolving analysis, is communicated here in a linear fashion. Presenting analysis in this way may be considered unrepresentative of the realities of theory generating analysis which is far more fluid and malleable. Failure to adequately explain the steps taken and conclusions drawn is a common criticism of studies incorporating a theory building design (Wasserman, Claire & Wilson 2009). Clarity in documenting the processes of data collection, data analysis and the continual iteration between the two is central to the reliability of the study (Silverman, 2000). This section will incorporate data pieces, evolving interview guides, field notes and three different types of memos (analytic, theoretical and reflective) in order to offer clarity to the analytic process and give rigour to the study.
4.3.1 Transcribing

Each of the interviews in the first phase of data collection was transcribed verbatim. For the purposes of the presentation of the findings, excerpts of text have been amended or ‘polished’ (Dewalt, 2002: 100) to increase their clarity. I was careful not to change any words, terms or phrases used by participants but made decisions to edit sections of text presented in the study that were considered to be unnecessarily repetitious or to protect the identity of people who may be implicated in the data. There were sections of data which were used in memos and in analysis which were amended to protect the anonymity of the school and people within the school. The elements edited out were not considered to be analytically important. I also took the decision to amend vernacular and elements of data which would not reflect participants’ linguistic skills in a positive light (Blauner, 1987). The nature or style of participants’ speech was not considered to be part of the study so this was discarded in favour of the content of their responses. The purpose of editing the interviews had a ‘benign intent’ (Dewalt, 2002: 100) and was carried out to add clarity to the points raised by participants. Polished transcripts were given back to participants to agree amendments and to check that no changes to context or meaning had been made. Examples of this editing are included in the table below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Verbatim responses given during interviews</th>
<th>Edited version for clarity</th>
<th>Reason for editing</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yea, yea, definitely yea, I’d say, yea definitely, the absolute key part of it, and this is what I’ve found with other, similar situations, was just building up a relationship, just getting to know the pupil so they, they’re doing it cos they want to, but also, you know, they see that they’re getting something from it – Interview 2, page 7</td>
<td>Yes, definitely. That is a key part of it and that is what I have found in other, similar situations. It was just building up a relationship, just getting to know the pupil so they are doing the activity because they want to do it and they see that they are getting something from it</td>
<td>Editing out repetition, Editing grammar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OK, well we got, like within, like, my last placement basically, like half of the class complete mixed ability, where I, in the Jewish school, like obese, overweight, really low levels of fitness, and the other half not so much, they do</td>
<td>Ok, on my last placement I had half the class of complete mixed ability, obese, overweight, really low levels of fitness. The other half not so much. They [the PE department] do split the class 50:50 and we had to do a run.</td>
<td>Editing grammar, Edit out the irrelevant information as Jewish school, Edit in clarification of who is implicated in the statement</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
like, like a split 50:50 kind of thing, and basically, we had, we had to do a run.

Interview 8, page 1  

I hate it, I absolutely hate it, I think it’s, I know it’s difficult sometimes because with, it’s really funny in, at Hayesbrook we had a department meeting and they were talking about this sort of issue.

Interview 9, page 4  

I hate it, I absolutely hate it. I know it is difficult sometimes because at my first placement school we had a department meeting and they were talking about this sort of issue.

Editing grammar  

Edit out name of the school

Table 13 – Examples of editing of interview data

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Broad question</th>
<th>Specific prompts for depth and detail</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(Adaptations to subsequent interview guides in bold italics)</td>
<td>(Adaptations to subsequent interview guides in bold italics)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Please tell me about an occasion when you had to try to engage a sedentary or obese child into physical activity?</td>
<td>No adaptations were made to this or the second broad question as these were provided to the trainees in the initial information to participants and were designed to ease the trainee into the interview.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| 2. Please give me a brief overview of the context, the pupil(s) involved and any other contextual information that may be of interest in helping to understand the situation? | - Can you describe what happened during this situation?  
- Are you able to recall what was going through your mind at this time?  
- What were the courses of action that you considered taking when this situation arose? |
| 3. What strategies did you actually employ in trying to solve this problematic situation? | - Why did you take this course of action?  
- What prompted or motivated you to deal with it in this way?  
- What strategies did you rule out? Why did you not see them as suitable?  
- Why do you think you settled on this course of action over others open to you?  
- **In hindsight were there other strategies that were not even considered at the time?** |
| 4. What were you feeling during the whole scenario? | - What were you feeling immediately after the scenario and a few hours later? |

4.3.2 Evolving the interview guide

The first series of interviews consisted of a total of 10 interviews, one with each study participant. These interviews ranged between 46 – 82 minutes in duration. The first interviews followed a similar interview guide, although as themes emerged from the early interviews some questions and prompts were amended. In practice the interviews were not as rigid as presented in this overview but were a more fluid conversation. The semi-structured interview guide for the first interview is shown in table 14 along with examples of adaptations as first round interviews progressed.
As interviews were conducted early categories were identified and data pieces were coded to begin to develop dimensions. The interview guides were reconsidered to provide greater insight into areas of interest that were emerging. As interviews unfolded I was able to shift the focus from the specific scenario of coping with obese and sedentary adolescents to broader issues relating to their experiences such as factors that influenced their decisions, how they felt about their practice and other examples of managing problematic situations in their everyday practice. Discussing experiences of confronting obesity focused interviewees’ attention on specific situations they faced and acted as a starting point for further questioning. I was then able to investigate more abstract features of their experiences as further data were collected and analysed.

The gradual shifting of interview guides and the ongoing analysis of data started immediately after the first interview in the form of field notes and reflective statements. These two sets of notes document my developing understanding of the data and

29 The focus was guided by the early analysis as presented in section 4.3.3.

30 Examples of adaptations to the original interview guide are presented in bold italics in table 14.
provided an early basis to my thinking. The taking of notes during the interviews was kept to a minimum in order to allow me to give my attention to the interaction between myself and the interviewee. Field notes and reflective memos were constructed post interview. Examples of field notes written immediately after interviews 1 and 2 are presented in table 15 along with insights into some of my own reflections on the interview and consideration of the theoretical possibilities within the data.

Excerpt of a field note taken following interview 1

Evident in this interview that the trainee is very confident to construct her own interventions, she is not reliant on received wisdom before acting. She is aware of broad department policies and strategies used by staff but is not keen to blindly follow calling this the ‘easy option’ and intimating that issues encountered are often much deeper and require careful thought and actions. There is a preparedness to work outside of her comfort zone in finding solutions to problems, a willingness to commit to the situation and act in the best interests of the child. There is evidence of dealing with the child and not the behaviour and becoming consumed by a problematic situation. She appears genuinely ‘moved’ by the problems she has encountered.

Key words; emotional investment, autonomy, received wisdom, child-centred.

I am keen to explore the basis of these decisions. What enables this trainee to act under her own instinct as opposed to acting on received wisdom? What is informing her decision making in constructing responses? From where is she drawing the capability to act with autonomy? Does the context allow for this trainee to act with autonomy? What impact does reduced autonomy have?

Field notes from interview 2

Further examples of a trainee who is not content to follow policy in dealing with problematic and complex situations. This trainee appears invested in doing what they perceive to be right for the child and considers some policy to be based on expediency and reducing impact on resources. She is outspoken on how, in her experience, departments have been disinterested in children who do not fit the ‘sporty’ typology. This, she feels, undermines the role of PE. In terms of strategies employed this trainee has examples of giving time and effort to her own detriment in terms of completing tasks assigned. A key factor in her practice is the sense of intrinsic reward for her efforts, such as praise from staff, gratitude from children and general positive comments.

Key words; power, autonomy, investment of time and energy, reward from praise and positive affirmations, gratitude.

I am drawn to this trainee’s observation of the use of power to control and amend sedentary behaviours. She takes the stance of minimising the distance between her and the child. Again I am drawn to features of the context which allow for her to act with autonomy and the sources of information upon which she has drawn to construct her interventions in attempting to deal with sedentary behaviour.

Table 15 – field notes from initial interviews
Taking clear and early field notes was an important addition to the study as thoughts could be acted on immediately and applied to the subsequent data collection and to assigning early codes to data pieces. Building in time between interviews allowed for ongoing reflection on my role in the collection of the data. Reflective memos were handwritten personal observations taken throughout the study in the form of a reflective diary. The diary served two main purposes; firstly, to chart reflections and ideas concerning data collection and analysis and secondly to detail my own reflexivity over the course of the study. Table 16 displays an excerpt of a reflective memo which was written during the first round of data collection. Reflections on interviews were carried out sporadically during the first round of data collection and were unstructured. For ease of presentation and coherence I have written this memo here in three sections which capture the broad content of my reflections.

Table 16 – example of reflective memo post interview

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reflective memo – June 2010</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Immediate thoughts post interview -</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Why are trainee teachers able to achieve positive outcomes where qualified staff members are not able? This cannot be a competence issue. Trainees seem to have personal skills and a dimension to their role that has long since disappeared in the actions of staff around them. What is it about trainees that provide them a basis to solve such problems? Stories from trainees are very celebratory. This is unsurprising as they have offered their time and are keen to share what they perceive to be examples of their good practice. Have they any bad examples to share? Would they want to share them with me?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Common words and terms from field notes; competence, time, caring, child-centred, experiential learning, biography.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Action for future data collection –</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Allowing the trainee to tell their story at the start of the interview has worked well. Further story-telling on more examples of their practice may bring out counter examples which are less celebratory. I would like to know if these situations offer learning opportunities to them and whether they recognise problems as learning opportunities. Do they gravitate towards or away from them?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To date trainees have all shown that they are prepared to sacrifice their own time and the time they have for paperwork in order to help a child who they perceive to need extra support or guidance. I would like to explore this further given that this behaviour does not appear to be evident in teachers around them. How would trainees respond if they were unable to act the way they want to? This is worth pursuing.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My role as interviewer –</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Open responses to questions, possibly due to the clarity of pre-interview contact with the trainees putting them at ease. Provision of initial questions has eased the start of each interview. I have been a little structured to date not wishing to probe too far into negative cases or events which trainees might not want to discuss. I have tended to adopt a more cautious approach but would like to further investigate the origins of their interventions, counter cases where things did not go to plan and how they now view their experiences. If they are to open up and be confident of discussing counter cases I will need to consider</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
offering some of my own anecdotes of cases with varied outcomes. What happens when they cannot act the way they want? This may create some counter cases. Reading back over field notes it is clear that I tend to readily jump to conclusions and attach my own values to some participant comments. I need to be aware of my own values being imposed on the data, to report what has been said and take themes forward. Have I abstracted far enough to see what ‘all’ is in the data or am I using pre-existing ideas? Pulling back will allow me to stay open to new insights and not close on theoretical possibilities in the data.

Table 16 – example of reflective memo post interview

The timing and nature of my reflective memos helped me to maintain an ongoing dialogue with my own values, assumptions and subjective influences on the data (Primeau, 2003). Memmoing personal thoughts about the direction of the analysis, acknowledging the place of the researcher and the decisions taken add further transparency to the analysis. Mills, Bonner & Francis (2006: 11) suggest that constructivist research should avoid the ‘removed, third-person voice’ and that the researcher could include themselves ‘as a human being and not a disembodied data gatherer’ (p. 11). Highlighting my assumptions and concerns during analysis created a platform for greater abstraction and conceptualisation of the theoretical possibilities in the data.

4.3.3 Dimensionalising

One of the most important features of theory generating research is the ongoing iteration between data collection and data analysis. Data analysis followed the three stages of Schatzman’s (1991) dimensional analysis; dimensionalising, differentiation and integration. The first step was to identify a broad range of dimensions within the data concerning how trainee teachers engage with problematic situations. This section, called dimensionalising, outlines the steps taken in creating dimensions out of codes assigned to data pieces.

Interview transcripts were coded line by line. Labels were assigned to data pieces to attempt to capture the sentiment and meaning of the extract. In keeping with Strauss and Corbin’s (1998) recommendations for theoretical sensitivity and the processes of

31 Reflective memos contributed to the early insecurity I felt in my ability to carry out qualitative analysis. This subsided as I became accustomed to their importance as part of the analysis in explicating my position as part of the research (Birks, Chapman & Francis, 2008). This point is discussed in greater depth in chapter 7.
dimensional analysis, I used technical literature at this stage to try to conjure suitable words and terms as conceptual levers to further explore the sentiment and meaning of data pieces. Whilst being very mindful of the danger of forcing literature onto the data it was useful to look into journal articles in professions other than teaching to investigate labels which could provide clear explanation as to what was going on in chunks of data. Examples of coded data pieces drawn together from a range of interviews are shown in table 17 to illustrate the process.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Labels assigned</th>
<th>Edited interview extracts</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Motivations</td>
<td>That is one reason why I want to be a teacher. I want to affect the insecurities of someone. It bothers me that people have insecurities when they do not need to.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Negative emotion</td>
<td>I think she just needs lots of help and lots of support. I know after I had Thomas I did not want to go and do physical activity because I felt silly doing it, if that makes sense? I was a lot bigger than I had been before. So I think I kind of understood where she was coming from as well.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Investing time</td>
<td>I do not think there was anything else, and it was just about the building up a bit of a rapport with her, just chatting to her, making her feel a little bit more comfortable, getting to know a bit about her. Then you can engage her. I found out a bit about what she did out of school, and then it was easier to chat to her.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Empathy</td>
<td>So I think in that way it would probably be impossible to teach you how to respond to those sorts of situations. It is something that I have definitely gained a lot more experience on placement of, rather than from formal lectures.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Investing time</td>
<td>So next time I tried getting the girls to actually group themselves. All of the perceived skinny, more able pupils put themselves together, and she put herself with a couple of girls, one of her friends, but still really did not improve with her participation in lessons, she just stood there with her hands in her pockets.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Humanising self</td>
<td>I do think you should always try what you feel is right. Just try it out but feel able to fall back on what the department say. Try your ideas out, try different strategies, follow your instincts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Reducing distance</td>
<td>I liked having to deal with issues myself, they were quite prepared to let me go off on my own with interventions.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Experiential learning</td>
<td>That is what everyone else did. I suppose you do what the rest of the department do. I think in the sense that he (the child) was not doing what he should have had been it was then passed higher up in the school.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 17 – examples of codes assigned to data pieces
The labelling of data pieces within individual interviews was a creative exercise which allowed me the freedom to interpret the sentiment of participant responses. Labels (codes) assigned were conjured almost instantaneously and then clarified using dictionary, thesaurus and reference articles from the professions where it was perceived that the existing code did not adequately capture my reconstruction of the data. The process of abstracting out from the data and finding names for data pieces and then dimensions was a challenging and iterative process which required significant attention to my own thought processes. Maintaining a clear audit trail which could clearly signpost how I arrived at the words used was a principle concern during coding and dimensionalising. An example of the use of literature along with my own interpretive analyses to create and then evolve a dimension is detailed in the following example of an analytical memo.

Analytic memo 1 -

I have noted the apparent common use by trainees of interventions which provide varying degrees of autonomy to pupils in designing their own levels of activity and their involvement in PE lessons. This resonates with elements of my own lecture content on teaching styles conducive to a positive motivational climate. In slightly less volume are examples of trainees who are concerned with generating pupils’ perceived competence and their awareness of the point and purpose of physical activity in their lives. Collectively these concepts are the pillars of Self Determination Theory (SDT) (Deci and Ryan, 1986) and may be linked to examples of practice given to trainees from formal lectures during their ITT programme. Evident are examples of all three of the central tenets of SDT, perhaps this has significance that needs further consideration?

Reflective memo;

I would expect that in the eyes of the trainees I would be synonymous with SDT given the nature of my lecturing role on the BA (QTS) course. I should be wary of two factors here; 1. My role in planting these processes in the minds of the trainees, 2. my affinity and familiarity with SDT which may be influencing what I am seeing in the data. It is dangerous to accept SDT and autonomy as too central at this stage, it could lead to shutting off other directions in the data. I need to abstract further and see what other meanings may be lifted from the data. If it has salience then where does it fit in my theory of learning to become a teacher?

Emanating out of this was the temporary acceptance of Self Determination Theory as a substantive dimension. Over time the place of SDT as a dimension at all was questioned as it was considered as merely descriptive of trainee practice when confronted with
problematic situations. Accepting the centrality of SDT was descriptive as opposed to analytical. I needed to abstract further on the tenets of SDT and their ‘fit’ within the data.

I was still left with autonomy as a significant code which was evident in all interviews in varying degrees. The term was too frequent to be ignored. I re-entered the data and constructed a grid containing examples of trainee use of autonomy. Viewing the example with greater abstraction allowed me to view exercising autonomy as important to trainees, or at least their perception of the autonomy they were given. It also allowed me to find counter cases where autonomy was not perceived by trainees and the impacts it had on their experience.  

Analytic memo 2 -

Autonomy is too frequent and too powerful to be ignored. The data suggests significant exercising of autonomy over decision making by trainees. They are exercising ‘occupational jurisdiction’ over their work, taking control, doing what they think is right in a given situation. In many respects this jurisdiction could be described as maverick behaviour as it goes against accepted department protocol. If autonomy is important what happens when they do not perceive autonomy? Are there any controlling environments that students resided in? I need to investigate cases of high and low perceived autonomy.

This is significant information and an important consideration for this study. How often does this happen? How does it happen? When does not it happen? How common are counter cases?

Table 19 – example of analytic memo on autonomy

Analytic memo 3 -

There are examples in the data of trainees following protocol. Sometimes this is against their perceived better judgement and under instruction. They often seem bitter about following processes which do not appear to serve the interests of the child. Conforming to department protocol as opposed to exercising their autonomy is substantive in the data. Whilst autonomous practice is salient there are counter cases where the opposite is true and trainees following protocol.

Trainees appear to want to choose the hard option on exercising their own ideas and interventions, unless

---

32 I could further investigate this through theoretical sampling.
33 A further example of my reflexive awareness in memoing and data analysis. At the time of writing memos I became increasingly aware of the need to select words which accurately captured the true meaning and emotions of trainee responses. I was careful not to use words that could over exaggerate the meaning of participant sentiments. These words have not been used lightly or without consideration of their significance to the emerging story of learning to become a teacher.
there is perceived pressure to act according to protocol. How they perceive their opportunity to exercise autonomy is substantive. How this impacts on trainees emotions also appears very significant. There are threads of cognitive dissonance theory here. How this plays out in the early experiences of trainees is interesting. There is a clear conflict between what they want to do and what they have to do. Conflict is influenced by perceptions of autonomy. Trainees speak emotionally about having the chance to act in ways that meet their own ideals.

Table 20 – analytic memo to help identify the place of autonomy

The professional literature and on-line journal articles were searched for further insight into autonomy and how perceptions of autonomy influenced trainee emotions. This was done until saturation of the dimensions was achieved thus creating heightened theoretical sensitivity and a better understanding of how perceptions of autonomy were important to trainees.

Reading of professional literature and journal articles at this point provided conceptual levers with which to inductively explore the data and then ensure the analyses were well grounded and evidenced within the transcripts. This process was evident throughout this stage of the analytic process.

4.3.4 Building dimensions

The following section further considers the steps taken in building up from individual codes to theoretical concepts (dimensions) which have the capacity to explain what is going on across participants. Codes were used to generate broader insights into more general concepts. The process employed in generating broader concepts in this research was in keeping with the constant comparative method (Glaser and Strauss, 1967; Strauss and Corbin, 1998). As interviews were conducted previous transcripts which had been coded were revisited and code names were amended to reflect the evolving meaning and new interpretation of ‘what all was in the data’ (Schatzman, 1991). Data were compared within interviews as dimensions and their properties were constructed. Data were also compared across interviews to compare dimensions and to develop interpretations and potential new names for dimensions and properties.

The following example shows how data pieces across interviews were interpreted to construct the dimension of ‘emotional investment’ along with the properties that provide richer insight into the range and scope of the dimension. The properties in this instance reflect occasions where trainees showed emotion as well as counter examples
where trainees were completely pragmatic\textsuperscript{34}. This example has been shortened to just four interviews. Its purpose is to exemplify the analytic process from codes assigned to individual data pieces (anger, concern, empathy, pride, irritation, caring, happiness, rewarding) to two properties (emotive, pragmatic) and then to the overarching dimension (emotional investment) which has the capacity to capture ‘what all’ is going on as regards what emotions trainees are investing in their work.

Table 21 – construction of the dimensions of ‘emotional investment’

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Interview number</th>
<th>Trainee emotive</th>
<th>Trainee pragmatic</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>P4 – <strong>Rewarding</strong> - a big thing for me is trying to encourage people to enjoy PE, and that’s a big reward for me if I can get someone who has negative opinions to then actually find some enjoyment in it.</td>
<td>P9 - I filled in an incidents book and spoke to my head of department and passed it on to the head of year, who then was the one that told us that she’s had similar issues in her primary school, the head of year, supposedly spoke to her, I don’t know if she got much response, whenever you spoke to the girl she just looked to the ground, just shook her head.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>P5 – <strong>anger at poor observed practice</strong> - I personally felt a bit angry with, not with the girl, with the other members of staff, in that they’re your class, and you start to feel responsible for them, and the fact that I’d gone away for one lesson and that she’d been fine, and then suddenly things started going wrong.</td>
<td>P13 - There were a couple of times I had to give detentions out because that’s how the school does things, she was very policy orientated, like ‘this is how we deal with things at this school.’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>P5 – <strong>empathy</strong> - after really thinking about it and making an effort to really think about what they were learning and what impact it was going to have on them, such as are they doing it in front of other people, thinking to myself how would it feel feel if they come in last?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>P9 – <strong>Concerned</strong> - whereas I was generally quite concerned, and want to engage her more and find out what the problem was.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>P3 – <strong>Empathy</strong> - I know what it feels like to feel uncomfortable, whether it’s a PE or dance environment, I know what it feels like to feel like a lemon, to not understand the task and to feel uncomfortable about performing in others.</td>
<td>No data</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>P4 – <strong>Rewarding</strong> - I think it was when you get a reward out of having a relationship with the pupils, and you want to have that short, sharp impact, and you think ‘right, I want you to know that you are a somebody and you’re noticed.’</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\textsuperscript{34} This example of one dimension is presented here in a shortened format representing just 4 interviews. Each dimension was created using a similar process, a full example for all 10 interviews is presented in appendix 7.
P4 – **Rejecting pragmatism** - if you wanted me to be unemotional, then that, that’s the consequence of me not dealing with it, do you know what I mean?

P7 – **Caring** - I want to affect the insecurities of someone and that sort of thing. It bothers me that people have insecurities when. They do not need to. I think when you’re in a teaching position you can have that powerful tool to do it, and you also have the powerful tool to destroy someone.

P10 – **Empathy, caring** - I think if you don’t want to empathise you don’t have to, if you just want to teach because you enjoy teaching, but not actually care about what’s beyond the pupil in front of you, then you’ll minimise the impact you’re going to have.

P3 – **Empathy** - I think if I was in that position, like I know after I had Thomas I was really didn’t want to go and do physical activity particularly, because I felt silly doing it. I was a lot bigger than I had been before and it was, so I think I kind of understood where she was coming from as well.

P6 – **Empathy** - but I think some trainees, if they’ve never been in that situation, they don’t understand how those kids feel, then they are not going to be able to deal with it as well. I have not observed any other trainees teaching or anything like that, but I think if I had not experienced something like that, I probably would not have been able to deal with it as well.

P6 – **Empathy** - a lot of PE teachers will have never been in that position. I think if I hadn’t had Thomas, if I had not ever experienced that, I would not know what it felt like, I would not know what it was like to be one of those children that kind of didn’t want to participate.

P8 – **Pride** - I was like ‘right, I can do this, I can deal with this girl’, managed to get her going to the gym which was good, I was quite pleased with myself there.

P16 – **Rewarding** - Sometimes I made headway with them, that was a lot more rewarding than going in and teaching a really good lesson with another class, but sometimes I came out of lesson and just wanted to cry. So, it was tough but looking back it probably was a lot more rewarding overall...

P2 – **Empathy** - I had back problems, my family have had back problems. My auntie is massively overweight and she has a lot of back problems, and it’s a sort of thing where I am well aware. I knew the character of this young girl, and she is very lovely, very positive, and I knew that it would not be too difficult to touch upon.

P2 – **Empathy** - I made it a bit personal to me, I said ‘I have back problems, but I find if I do exercise it makes, it’s a lot better than if I don’t’, I said ‘even if you, you know do some stretching or’, I just, I could not leave it.

P10 – **irritated** - I mean one thing that irritated me, I had one boy, and every lesson he always looked very dishevelled, he looked really malnourished, everything, he would always come up with an excuse to never have his kit.

P12 – That was what I had to do, that was the policy so that is what action I followed.
P11 – Upsetting - I think it is really, really upsetting though when you do try and you realise that some teachers have kind of given up, and that there is a kid in their class they can’t be bothered with. If the teacher can’t be bothered, then the kid hasn’t got any self-esteem, and the teacher shows no interest.

P12 – Happiness - When I see that girl, Molly, I feel so happy, she’s such a lovely girl, and I think at least she is doing something. I think about what would happen if I hadn’t have pushed that point, maybe she would have been out of activity for the whole month or two.

Table 21 – construction of the dimensions of ‘emotional investment’

From this dimension it can be seen that there is strong emotional investment by trainees when confronting the challenges of obesity and sedentary behaviour. Out of this broad dimension I was able to view the range of specific emotional responses of trainees. Trainee empathy was considered substantive enough from this analysis to be a dimension in its own right and was subjected to further analysis.

This process of dimensionalising continued beyond the 10th and final first round interview. During this time dimensions and their properties were continually being generated from my interpretations of the data. Interview transcripts were repeatedly read and re-read, hand written memos were attached to interview transcripts and an extensive list of labels and their frequency across interviews was drafted. Many codes were dismissed. Others were renamed, amalgamated or abstracted to generate a name which encompassed several other codes. The analytic process outlined here allowed me to mould the dimensions into headings which held explanatory power. I was left with a series of dimensions that had been compared across interviews. Each dimension was allocated properties. Their appearance in the data was inserted into a spreadsheet so that I had a record of instances of each dimension across all interviews. Table 22 contains the list of dimensions generated in the first phase of dimensionalising along with their associated properties.

At this point I became stuck in my analysis as the sentiment of most dimensions was mere description of trainee practice. I had amalgamated and coded trainee practice when confronted with problematic situations. For example, trainees would try to humanise themselves by reducing distance and trainees would try to understand problems from the pupils’ perspective in order to address them. Amongst these descriptive dimensions, which could be later expressed as ‘actions’ in DA terms, are more abstract dimensions
which can explain as opposed to merely describe the phenomenon under investigation. A second phase of analysis using Schatzman’s (1991) framework allowed me to ask more probing questions of the data concerning context, conditions and consequences. I continued to use literature to enhance my theoretical sensitivity to find terms which captured my interpretations of what was happening in the data. Further dimensions were generated which began to build a more analytical understanding as opposed to description of trainee experience and are shown in table 23.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dimension</th>
<th>Properties</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Gender</td>
<td>Male or female</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
<td>22 – 28 years</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Biography</td>
<td>Parental career, previous experience, cultural experience, personal circumstances</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Course</td>
<td>BA (QTS), PGCE PE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Path to degree</td>
<td>‘Straight through’, gap year, relevant life experience</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>State or private</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Placement setting</td>
<td>Mixed, single-sex, state funded, private, faith</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ideals</td>
<td>Idealism, realism, cynicism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Changing pupil self-perception</td>
<td>Perceived competence, belonging, compromise, empowering pupils</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contributors of sedentary behaviour</td>
<td>Acceptance by staff, acceptance by parents, self-consciousness, pupil labelling,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self determination</td>
<td>Offering autonomy, perceived competence and relatedness to pupils</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interventions</td>
<td>Own interventions, department interventions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emotional investment</td>
<td>Emotive, pragmatic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Empathy</td>
<td>Yes, no</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rewards</td>
<td>Intrinsic, extrinsic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Humanizing self</td>
<td>Self-projection, social contact, time investment, pupils as people</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Building physical self-perception</td>
<td>Affordance of autonomy, perceived competence, relatedness in lessons</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Source of support</td>
<td>Mentor / school, University, self-supported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Policy</td>
<td>Willingly adopt, dismiss, accept</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Definition of ‘difficult pupils’</td>
<td>Lazy, apathetic, rude</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perceived reasons for sedentary behaviour</td>
<td>Social, physical, emotional</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 22 – Examples of dimensions from the first phase dimensionalising
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dimensions</th>
<th>Properties</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Trainee values</td>
<td>Pupil-focused, procedure-focused</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>External pressures</td>
<td>Macro, meso, micro</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emotional investment</td>
<td>Emotive, pragmatic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nature of mentor</td>
<td>Democratic, autocratic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Autonomy</td>
<td>Autonomous decisions, received wisdom</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emotions</td>
<td>Supporting, debilitating</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Immediate response to problems</td>
<td>Emotional, behavioural</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Philosophy of PE</td>
<td>Health, personal development, sport</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Retrospective response to problems</td>
<td>Positive or negative value as a learning experience</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Locus of control over interventions</td>
<td>Internal, external</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parental influence</td>
<td>Strong, weak</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity to practice</td>
<td>High, low</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self-efficacy</td>
<td>High, low</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ability to cope</td>
<td>High, low</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coping strategies</td>
<td>Acceptance or rejection of received wisdom</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>View of problem situations</td>
<td>Adaptive, maladaptive</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 23 – Examples of dimensions from the second phase of dimensionalising

At this point I considered that I had conjured a sufficient number of dimensions and could begin to make decisions about the relative value of each in building a storyline.

### 4.3.5 Differentiation

During this stage of analysis decisions were made concerning the salience of dimensions and their relationships to one another. At this stage dimensions were configured into a coherent story of the phenomenon under investigation.

The creation of a critical number of dimensions continued beyond the final first round interviews. According to Schatzman (1991) what constitutes a critical number of dimensions is a matter of practical judgement. A researcher is able to consider that they have accrued a critical mass when they perceive that the major aspects of a phenomenon have been identified and has the potential to explain what ‘all’ is in the data (Kools, et al. 1996). As data were accrued and analysed the relative importance of dimensions started to become apparent, revealing the direction for future data collection and analysis. At this point I was satisfied that the dimensions created had the potential to build a story of learning to become a teacher and I began the process of assigning relative value to each dimension. I had already started making decisions concerning the salience of dimensions whilst they were being created. Some dimensions had already been dismissed as too superficial to have explanatory power. I had also started forming
opinions about the centrality of some dimensions and their potential to act as the central organising dimension, the dimension around which others could be fitted.

Identifying the central organising dimension proved to be a very challenging process. A lengthy period of memoing, diagramming and storying of the case with a wide range of dimensions taking centre stage took place between December 2010 and January 2012. Each central dimension was subjected to constant analysis by revisiting the data and through rigorous questioning during supervisory meetings. Each time a new dimension was auditioned for the central perspective a new story was inductively built and new hypotheses were drafted and then tested through further analysis.

Auditioning different dimensions constantly shifted the emerging theory. Dimensions were constantly being promoted, relegated, moved or excluded altogether in order to find the dimensions with most explanatory power. Such is the iterative nature of dimensional analysis, some dimensions continued to evolve as I developed my theoretical sensitivity through consultation with texts and journals in the professions which helped develop my understanding. Through this process new names and interpretations were considered. Examples are cited below

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Original name of dimension</th>
<th>New name of dimension</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Trainee values</td>
<td>Aspirations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>External pressures</td>
<td>Expectations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emotional investment</td>
<td>Range of emotions experienced</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ability to cope</td>
<td>Capacity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Immediate response to problems</td>
<td>Immediate response to contradiction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Retrospective response to problems</td>
<td>Retrospective response to contradiction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>View of problems</td>
<td>View of contradiction</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 24 – examples of evolved dimensions

4.3.5.1 Second round of data collection

The first two interviews in the second round of data collection aimed to test out a developing explanatory theory and the central dimension. Participants were reminded of the previous interview transcript and were given access to hand written field notes which showed the generation of codes from round 1 of the data collection. At this stage I had a hypothesis developed from the data that I wanted to investigate with participants. Specifically I had hypothesised that trainees were too emotionally engaged
in their work and were vulnerable to heightened stress and eventual withdrawal from their work. I auditioned vulnerability as the central organising dimensions for the study.

The first two second round interviews proved this working hypothesis to be a misfire as my analysis had abstracted too far from the data. Vulnerability was deemed to be too disempowering of the trainees, assuming a weakness that was not validated by the participants. Gaps in the explanatory theory were exposed. This testing out process did, however, illuminate other theoretical possibilities within the data as vulnerability was not completely dismissed by trainees. It was considered too extreme and as having completely negative connotations to trainees. Some considered their vulnerability to be a positive step in generating an understanding of what it meant to become a teacher. I shifted my view and hypothesised that it was the contradictions they faced on a daily basis that was central to their learning to become a teacher. If this was accepted I could then begin to build the story of the case around contradiction.

Table 25 contains dimensions yielded from the first two second round interviews which informed my view of contradiction as central to the emotional demands of learning to become a teacher.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dimensions assigned</th>
<th>Interview extracts showing contradiction</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Acceptance</td>
<td>I knew what was happening. I knew that this was part of the job. I suppose I was vulnerable but not in the darkest sense of the word. I wasn’t going to change my plan of action. I didn’t fold and follow what was suggested</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Resilient</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learning through negative Retrospective learning</td>
<td>It was crucial. Not always pleasant to go through but I needed it. I kind of get it now but at the time it was tough.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Questioning</td>
<td>I remember thinking ‘what is the point of trying?’ and asking if I really wanted to put myself through this all the time</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Negative emotion</td>
<td>Sitting with my head in my hands feeling really shit about the situation. I wasn’t getting on with her (my mentor). I didn’t want to do it her way. She didn’t get where I was coming from. I could have given up. It gives you the real world, what you are going into. You have your eyes opened. You have to ask if this is really what you want to do with your life.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learning from negative Questionning</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 25; examples of dimensions and data confirming the centrality of contradiction

Second round interviews continued with a re-worked hypothesis that contradiction was central to the emotional demands of becoming a teacher. Contradiction was used as the conceptual level to build a story of trainee learning. This new working hypothesis
focused on more specific detail of the case. Four further second round interviews were then conducted to deductively strengthen the centrality of contradiction\(^\text{35}\).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Trainee recollections of contradictory situations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Q. Can you recall the moments when you found things difficult to deal with? What was the source of these difficulties?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q. How did these situations make you feel?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q. Did you feel that you were in control of these situations?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q. Were your values or ideals threatened? Did you feel vulnerable to conforming to received wisdom even when it didn’t match your own aspirations?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Recollected outcomes of contradictory situations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Q. What did you do to overcome the problems you encountered?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q. What did you do to manage the situation?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q. Did these actions leave you in a difficult position? Did this concern you at the time?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Learning potential of contradiction</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Q. Are the contradictions you encountered something you rather had not happened? How do you view them now?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q. How did your responses to contradictory situations differ over the course of the placement? Were there different responses at different times?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 26 – interview guide for consolidating contradiction as the central dimension

In total six second round interviews were conducted. Interviews were recorded for later analysis but were not transcribed. Field notes were taken to evolve subsequent interview prompts and to continue to develop the emerging theory. Out of these interviews came my heightened awareness of contradiction as holding a central position in an explanation of the emotional demands of learning to become a teacher.

4.3.5.2 Third round of data collection

The final round of data collection aimed to test the central dimension and to begin to configure the emerging theory. This stage involved seeking verification of my reconstruction of trainee experiences. This stage consisted of:

\(^{35}\) Noticeable at this point is the absence of questions concerning the original focal point of coping with obese and sedentary children. By this point in the analysis obesity as the focus had served its purpose and illuminated broader issues of learning to become a teacher that could be investigated.
• Third interviews with three participants, theoretically sampled for verification. During these interviews trainees were given the emerging theory to date and asked to comment on the clarity and accuracy of the story. They were asked if they could identify themselves and map their own experiences within the theory.
• A focus group with three current University mentors aiming to provide sufficiency and recognisability to the emerging theory. Mentors were given the opportunity to comment and to add their point of view. Gaining the perspective of mentors allowed an even greater understanding of trainees’ daily context.

During this third stage of data collection I was able to stay open to the prospect of new dimensions being raised and to the prospect of further differentiation to identify the central dimension. No new insights were constructed during the third stage of data collection. At this point I considered that I had reached theoretical sufficiency. Analysis of all data and staying open to further interpretations continued through the final stage of dimensional analysis and up until writing of the theory.

4.3.6 Integration

This stage of dimensional analysis requires drawing together the most salient dimensions around the central organising dimension and then writing the explanatory theory. This was an iterative process which continued up to the point of writing up the thesis. Numerous explanations were drafted. Each version was tested against the data and was subjected to critique during supervision. Alongside this were constant drafting of diagrams and memos to integrate dimensions into an explanatory theory.

Through regular supervisory meetings, peer discussions and a staff focus group I was able to repeatedly check for coherence. The focus group comprised four University of Brighton teacher trainers and aimed to test the story and to help confirm the central dimension. This focus group was constructed through an open invite to all members of the Physical Education Area at the researcher’s place of work. The focus group comprised the course leaders of both BA (QTS) and PGCE courses. Discussion during the focus group focused on three themes.

1. Coherence of the emerging theory
The focus group members were asked to comment and question on central components of the theory presented and encouraged. This was a good test of my own understanding of the process I had constructed and highlighted areas of weakness where further attention and clarification was needed.

2. The centrality of a contradiction in learning to become a teacher

The focus group members gave numerous anecdotes of students from their experience that could be depicted by the model presented.

3. The applied implication of the model presented.

Discussion of this theme was concerned with lessons learned from the research presented.

Finding yet another point of view allowed me to test for clarity with a group of professionals from within the field and to open discussion centring on what could be considered a contribution to the field and implications for future practice. Experiencing contradiction between aspirations and the expectations of others was confirmed as the most significant dimension in this case, the dimension which triggered what followed. Having confirmed the centrality of contradiction I had even more confidence to write extended theoretical memos and continue to build the rest of the story. With contradiction as the catalyst it was possible to begin to shape the rest of the emerging theory.

4.4 Summary

This chapter has outlined the methods employed in attempting to fulfil the aims of the study within the broad methodological principles discussed in chapter 3. Semi-structured interviews were used to accrue the majority of the data. Focus groups were used to verify the emerging explanatory theory and to seek sufficiency and recognisability. This chapter has also exemplified each stage of data the collection and has used carefully selected examples of data to demonstrate each stage of the analytical processes employed to give transparency to the findings that are presented in chapters 5 and 6.
Findings

5.1 Introduction to the findings

The previous chapter demonstrated how data were collected and analysed. The next two chapters present the findings and how an explanatory theory of emotional demands of becoming a teacher was inductively built from the data. Data extracts are used throughout both chapters to exemplify the analytic process and present transparency to the findings.

The first round of data collection provided most of the extracts used in theory building. Data was expanded through second interviews with six of the original participants. Theoretical sampling using focus groups with three University of Brighton mentors and University staff added to the data and were used to confirm and strengthen the findings. Three theoretically sampled interviews with original participants were carried out for further testing and verification of the emerging theory.

As the theory is built through these two chapters it is compared against relevant literature from the field. Literature was therefore used throughout this chapter as a comparative case to help to clarify the emerging theory.

The findings are presented here as two chapters. Chapter 5 provides insight into the participants, their biography and their ideals. It also presents significant features of the training context and the external influences on trainees. What happens when personal ideals are combined with external expectations and factors that influence how trainees experience this clash conclude chapter 5.

Chapter 6 builds understanding of the accumulation of experiences outlined in chapter 5 and how they impact on trainees over the duration of the final professional semester. This chapter then outlines different responses made by trainees in coping with the demands of becoming a teacher. The findings are concluded by drawing together chapters 5 and 6 and a presentation of the explanatory theory of the emotional demands of learning to become a teacher.
Chapter 5

This chapter:

- Introduces the study participants, pieces of their biographies and experiences that shaped their practice intentions.
- Presents the trainee intentions regarding how they would like to practice during their final professional semester.
- Outlines contextual factors and conditions that shaped the trainees’ experiences.
- Presents how personal intentions and contextual factors merge and impact on the experiences of trainees.
- Uses literature to further explain the findings.

5.2 The study participants

Trainee teachers interviewed for this study were all studying one of two pathways to QTS in Physical Education. Eight participants studied a 4 year BA (Hons) degree and two participants followed a one year PGCE course. Selected features of the participants’ biographies are bullet pointed in table 27. These points have been selected as having potential to help understand the origins of intentions that the trainees had for their practice.

Table 27 – bullet pointed summaries of trainee biographies

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Participant</th>
<th>Course</th>
<th>Age</th>
<th>Selected Biographical information</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Stephanie</td>
<td>PGCE PE</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>- Father is a head teacher with a PhD in education.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- Has 3 years of experience of using sport and PE for social development. She has a clear view of</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>the role and purpose of PE in school and in society.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sam</td>
<td>PGCE PE</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>- Has never considered herself as a ‘sporty type’ more an active exerciser who claims to understand</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>the potential of sport and activity in physical and social health.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- Has experience of working in a range of contexts in using sport for health.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sarah</td>
<td>BA (QTS)</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>- Attributes her view of education to be influenced</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

36 Names have been changed to protect the identity of participants
by her faith having helped her through a troubled past and helped inform her life decisions.
- Describes herself as ‘humanistic’ in her outlook and always looking to ‘do what is right for the child.’
- Parents are both full-time employed in education.
- Has a clear view of the potential of PE for developing pro-social behaviour.
- Does not consider herself to be ‘main stream’ in her view of PE or education and has felt, at times, like an outlier in some contexts.
- Has a clear view and experience of health underpinning PE above other potential objectives of the subject.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Degree</th>
<th>Age</th>
<th>Bullet Points</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Stacy   | BA (QTS)| 28  | - Came back into education after having a child.  
- Has struggled to handle the pressures of full time study with motherhood and income generation.  
- Feels she is acutely aware of low self-esteem in physical situations having experienced difficulties post childbirth. |
| Sonia   | BA (QTS)| 24  | - Has a history of poor health curtailing her sport career. This has extended into her studies and inhibited her capacity to exercise.  
- Feels she is able to understand the difficult phenomenon of forced sedentary behaviour. |
| Steven  | BA (QTS)| 22  | - Straight through the education system and now moving straight back into school as a full time teacher  
- Has experienced personal injury that has impacted on his own weight, health and level of activity. |
| Sally   | BA (QTS)| 23  | - Straight through the education system and moving straight back into the education system as a full time teacher. |
| Sue     | BA (QTS)| 22  | - Straight through the education system and is moving back into education as a full time teacher immediately after graduating. |
| Seb     | BA (QTS)| 23  | - Born in Baghdad with an English mother and Arab father, who has experience as a teacher.  
- Understands what it means to not fit ‘the norm’ and to be different in many contexts.  
- Has sought experience of sport in divided societies and is constantly seeking opportunities to practice a ‘branch of PE teaching that often doesn’t fit into a typical school curriculum.’ |
| Sean    | BA (QTS)| 30  | - Worked in sport interventions with young offenders prior to attending University.  
- Worked voluntarily with social services and in education for a number of years in order to ‘feel’ he was making a difference.  
- Has a clearly defined view and experience of the purpose of PE and outdoor education as vehicles for promoting behaviour change and health promotion.  
- Parents fostered children while he was growing up. |

Table 27 – bullet pointed summaries of trainee biographies
The biographical information presented in table 27 provides a broad picture of each of the participants and some of their life experiences which could contribute to the intentions each of them held for their teaching practice. The following three tables draw out common features of individual biographies to build dimensions which can begin to build a picture of trainee practice intentions.

Tables 28, 29, and 30; Common features of trainee biographies

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Significant biographical information from table 1</th>
<th>Dimension created to help understand trainee practice intentions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Prior experience of using sport and PE as a vehicle to promote health, activity and personal development.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Has a clear view and experience of health underpinning PE.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Has a clearly defined view and experience of the purpose of PE and outdoor education as vehicles for promoting behaviour change, health and personal development.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Used sport interventions with young offenders prior to attending University as well as gaining experience in outdoor education. Both experiences prioritised personal development.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Worked voluntarily with social services and in education for a number of years in order to ‘feel’ he was making a difference.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Recognising the person-centred value of PE.</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The above table outlines the foundations of trainees’ view of PE which recognises the contribution it can make to development of the person, as opposed to other orientations of PE outlined in chapter 1.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Significant biographical information from table 1</th>
<th>Dimension created to help understand trainee practice intentions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Does not consider herself to be ‘main stream’ in her view of PE or education and has felt, at times, like an outlier in some contexts. Knows what it is like to be in the minority.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Feels she is acutely aware of low self-esteem in physical situations having experienced difficulties post childbirth. Understands the stigma of being overweight.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Has a history of poor health curtailing her sport career. This has extended into her studies and inhibited her Previous experiences have given trainees a willingness to be empathetic with obese and sedentary children</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Recognising the person-centred value of PE.</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
capacity to exercise. Appreciates barriers to exercise.
- Feels she is able to understand the difficult phenomenon of sedentary behaviour.
- Understands what it means to not fit ‘the norm.’
- Has experienced personal injury that has impacted on own weight and physical health. Appears to understand difficulties leading to inactivity.

Also emanating from trainees’ previous experience was their perceived ability to empathise with sedentary children, whether due to personal weight gain or through appreciating how it felt to be different and not fit the ‘norm’ in certain situations.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Significant biographical information from table 1</th>
<th>Dimension created to help understand trainee practice intentions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| - Father is a head teacher with a PhD in education and has worked on several community education initiatives.  
- Attributes her view of education to be influenced by her family’s faith having helped her through a troubled past and helps inform her life decisions. Parents are active in community work.  
- Parents are both full time employed in education. Mother now works in a school for disadvantaged children.  
- Born in Baghdad with an English mother and Arab father, both experience as teachers.  
- Parents fostered children while he was growing up.  
- Mother was a social worker and had a stream of children in her care living with the family at various times. | Parental influences have shaped trainees’ educational values. |

The parental influence on trainees was considered to be a significant feature of the trainees’ biographies. Noticeable was the number of occasions where trainees offered insights into their childhood and occasions where parents had been active in children’s education and welfare. Implicit in many of the participants’ biographies are humanistic, child-centred messages that may have framed the values which they took to their practice.

Tables 28, 29, 30 present key biographical information and show the creation of three dimensions of trainee biography that are considered here as laying the foundations of future practice intentions as a PE teacher. Specifically, trainees’ biographies contribute to
• Their valuing of PE as a contributor to personal development.
• Their willingness to empathise with pupils who need their support.
• Their desire to follow their parents in being proactive overseeing the welfare of children.

It is considered here that these three dimensions were guiding principles that underpinned how many of the decisions that the trainees took and the ways in which they chose to practice as their final professional semester unfolded.

Previous life experience was considered important in shaping how trainees wish to act. It is important to recognise that the trainees’ biographies were constantly evolving as new experiences were accrued. Awareness that trainee biography was not static and would continue to be shaped by daily experiences was an important feature of this study. As the final professional semester unfolded pressure was exerted on trainees to evolve their practice. The rest of this chapter builds a clearer picture of how this happened, whereas chapter 6 considers the accumulation of these experiences over the 17 week professional semester.

5.3 Daily practice

Trainees arrive at their final professional semester with three guiding principles established through their biography. This section will consider how these principles framed their intentions and what they wanted to achieve through their practice. The following quotes capture some commonly held views of trainees as they considered what underlined their practice.

Seeing pupils develop and grow socially and emotionally is part of the reason for becoming a teacher and that’s really what I enjoy. Getting to know pupils and building up the relationships, and, especially for the ones that do find it more difficult, because then you see such an improvement, such a progression (Sam).
I think for me it’s important for every pupil to participate and to feel success, and it doesn’t matter how they go about doing it, I know that in my lessons if they achieve that then I’ve achieved. If they don’t then if I just have to not sleep, eat or use my lunchtimes or my time to sort it out then I will (Sonia).

If I can be someone that she has a connection with, that she trusts, then I want to have that impact on her in those 6 months and hopefully she’ll be able to continue. I care about impacting on the insecurities of someone (Sarah).

These quotes show trainees having clear aspirations for their practice. Their vision of the role was heavily pupil-centred with the intention of offering fully inclusive PE experiences to all pupils. Such intentions were common to all of the participants interviewed. Further, these quotes demonstrate that trainees were motivated by the prospect of forging relationships with pupils, achieving inclusive practice, impacting pupil self-perceptions and having an impact on the lifelong activity habits of pupils. Their aspirations placed pupils at the centre of their early teaching experience and showed that they were prepared to invest considerable time, energy and emotion into fulfilling these goals. Here trainees showed that they had feelings about pupils, they engaged emotionally with their practice. The pupil-centred aspirations voiced by trainees were further substantiated by their recollections of specific scenarios that they shared.

She [the year 9 pupil] would very much want to talk to me on my own, if she had an issue with the activity, she’d come over to me before the start of the class and we would discuss different ways of incorporating her into the lesson. When it worked it was such a high (Sarah).

It was all about building up a bit of a rapport with her [the obese child], just chatting to her, making her feel a little bit more comfortable, getting to know a bit about her, then I could engage her into the lesson. I found out a bit about what she did out of school, and then it was easier to chat to her. (Sam).

I try to engage in some sort of dialogue that establishes why and takes their views into consideration. I think that pupils appreciate you taking an interest in them, so finding out what is the problem, and letting them know that it is
something that we can resolve together. Showing them that you care about them and what happens to them (Sally).

Such aspirations were widely held by the trainees. The strength of these aspirations was reflected by the evidence that these intentions endure throughout their final professional semester. These extracts again demonstrate that trainees claimed to care deeply about the welfare of the children that they came into contact with. They invested time and emotional energy into finding ways of helping children become active and to help them overcome problems.

There was evidence to suggest that some trainees had intentions that their pupil-centred aspirations will endure well into the future

> I think it is just my philosophy of PE and how I want to come across as a teacher. I want to show that what happens to them matters to me. I don’t want them to feel horrible. I could force them but they would hate it. I wouldn’t ever see myself operating like that. (Seb).

> You could tell that there wasn’t that much interest [in the obese girl] from her other teachers. She was merely a name on the list. Treating her like that was never going to be an option for me. I care about what is best for them (Sarah).

These extracts reflect a desire to invest emotion in maintaining a pupil-centred emphasis throughout the placement and the view that their aspirations to act in the best interests of the pupils will remain strong.

Throughout this section data has built the case that the trainees had pupil-centred aspirations for their work. Extracts have also depicted how much trainees care about their pupils, how they progress and what happens to them. Trainees were investing significant emotion into their work. This recognition of teaching as a profoundly emotive profession is not a new conception (Kinman, Wray & Strange, 2011; Hargreaves, 2001; Zembylas, 2005; Freid, 1995). It has been presented here that the place of emotions is no less significant in the lives of trainees where they routinely invest emotion into their work.
Previous studies have outlined potential sources of emotion in teachers such as safeguarding the emotional and physical well-being of pupils (Brennan, 2006; Hargreaves, 2000) and the need to show strong emotional control when showing compassion and warmth to children (Beatty, 2000). Both of these sources were evident in the data presented here. Trainees recognised and willingly accepted the requirement to engage in such emotional work as part of their role and had clear awareness of its value and importance to the children. The willingness of teachers to engage emotionally in their everyday contact with pupils is also evident in literature (Jakhelin, 2011).

Study participants were heavily child-centred in their approach to their work and therefore it is unsurprising that they were prepared to invest emotions in attempting to address problems of sedentary behaviour of pupils. Their emotional investment in attempting to make a difference to pupils’ activity profiles and arrest their sedentary behaviour is part of the ‘demanding but pleasurable emotional work’ required by teachers (Carlyle & Woods, 2002: 62) and as such is a common feature of trainees’ work in their early experiences in a school environment. The emotional work carried out by trainee teachers in this study may be considered to be an automatic response and readily engaged in, mirroring research in other professions such as nursing (Theodosius, 2008).

This section has

- Built the case that the trainees held strong pupil-centred aspirations for their work.
- Depicted the willingness of trainee teachers to invest emotion into addressing the day to day problems that they faced in addressing the problem of sedentary behaviour. This is the ‘demanding but pleasurable emotional work of teachers’ (Carlyle & Woods, 2002: 62)

Having ascertained the pupil-centred emphasis of the trainees it is also important to understand some of the broader contextual factors which influenced and shaped their practice.
5.4  The training context

Trainees entered the training context with aspirations to invest time and emotion into the welfare of their pupils. However, trainee teachers do not have the luxury of simply carrying out their own practice intentions. They exist in complex social structures which are governed by rules and policies which shape the way trainees act. This section;

- Begins with an overview of the final professional semester undertaken by the trainees.
- Discusses the specific contextual factors which have guided the practice of trainees.
- Uses literature to help build the picture of the emotional demands of becoming a teacher.

5.4.1 The final professional semester

The trainee teachers interviewed for this study were all studying one of two pathways to QTS in Physical Education. Eight participants studied a 4-year BA (Honours) degree and two participants followed a one year PGCE course. The unifying feature for all trainees was that their final professional semester was the point at which they were required to draw together all aspects of their initial teacher training. At this point the trainees are required to demonstrate a level of knowledge and competence that can aid a smooth transition into teaching. The learning emanating out of this final school-based experience holds great significance to trainee progression.

Prior to their final professional semester trainees all undergo intensive University-based programmes which provide much of the theory and pedagogic content in readiness for their practical teaching experience. These programmes are one of the many contextual influences on trainees

*I'm aware of a range of interventions [to increase engagement in sedentary children] through some of your lectures and just through readings and research. So immediately I knew how I was supposed to approach the situation (Sarah).*
I would look to combine my own experience with the lectures we have done on other ways to approach athletics. I really agreed with what was covered when we had the lectures on it, so those interventions are something I want to do when I teach it. The first few weeks of lectures were important to give an insight and to get the theory down on paper (Stephanie).

I knew how to respond from some of A.T’s [lecturer] lectures. He gave us some ideas about how to deal with non-engagement. In this respect I felt ready for it (Seb).

I did my dissertation in this area so I got a feel for what I needed to do from my research. I had conversations with my supervisor and some of it I needed to use (Sonia).

There was some psychological ‘blurb’ about it [handling sedentary behaviour] in a lecture, which I recalled (Sarah).

These extracts demonstrate the influence of University staff and curriculum content on the practice of trainees. The use of the University-based element of teacher education to encourage trainees to adopt and portray a particular set of approaches is revealed below.

From all the lectures and all the advice you get I had a good idea of what I was supposed to do [with sedentary children]. There was lots of discussion to prepare you (Steven).

I knew how I was supposed to respond according to the theory we had been given in our lectures (Sean).

I instinctively knew how I was supposed to respond [to the challenge of engaging an obese child]. You’re not supposed to stress about it. It’s expected that you will cope with it (Sally).

From these extracts it can be seen that the trainees responded to the taught elements of their University programme. Conducting themselves in a manner which was in-keeping with the unspoken rules of ‘being a PE teacher’ was one effect of the University-based
element of ITT. The trainees appeared trained in how to respond and how they were supposed to react to situations that arose.

Learning from lecturing staff was one way in which the trainees shaped their own views of the practice of PE teaching. Understanding the immediate ITT context surrounding trainees prior to entry to the profession is a small part of the contextual influences that need to be considered. The following sections consider further contextual factors that trainees must contend with.

5.4.2 Contextual factors impacting on trainee practice

Chapter 1 provided an in-depth overview of the political, social and historical contexts within which trainee teachers are operating. The intention of this section is to address the specific factors reported as having a role in shaping trainee practice.

Teaching is a profession that has been exposed to rapid policy change over the last 25 years. All trainees referred to the wider social and political context as influencing how they practiced during their final professional semester. In this study the contextual factors have been grouped on three levels of macro, meso and micro according to their origin. The table below presents each of the three levels, their source and specific examples from the data. Also shown is the extent to which each group were able to be negotiated by trainees.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Level</th>
<th>Origin</th>
<th>Examples from data</th>
<th>Negotiable?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Macro context</td>
<td>Government, University, TDA</td>
<td>QTT Standards, NCPE, University protocols</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Meso context</td>
<td>Schools, PE departments, school staff, mentors</td>
<td>Department protocol, school policy, actions of members of staff</td>
<td>Partially through dialogue or freedoms afforded by mentors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Micro context</td>
<td>Pupils</td>
<td>Pupils’ needs, pupil requests, teaching strategies</td>
<td>Partially through negotiation with mentors</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 31; examples of expectations

This collection of contextual influences offers limited negotiability to trainees. Due to this, these factors have been collectively termed ‘expectations’ as each level contains practice that is expected of trainee teachers. Each set of expectations is now discussed and evidenced in greater detail.
5.4.2.1 Macro expectations

Macro level expectations include national frameworks and policies which trainees felt had an influence on how they practiced during their final professional semester. Chapter 1 gave an extended overview of the degree of change that ITT and education in general has been subjected to since the 1944 Education Reform Act and more recently with the first iteration of the NCPE in 1991 following the Education Reform Act of 1988. Alongside changes to the subject were successive versions of teacher competencies, often referred to as ‘The Q Standards’. This structured social space, controlled by higher authorities, can be considered as the ‘field’ (Bourdieu, 1990) in which trainees operate. The following excerpts demonstrate how the field impacts on the practice of trainees.

*I think the whole QTT [Qualifying to Teach] standards are important to make you think about everything, and to show you that it’s more than just going and taking a lesson, but there is so much more to it. At times it did feel like the time spent doing our folders could be time when you were actually doing something that could have been of more benefit to the School or the pupils (Stephanie).*

*It doesn’t matter what I think. Pupils cannot just be allowed to sit out of PE they are expected to bring their kit, PE is part of the National Curriculum, and it’s one of the most important subjects on the National Curriculum. You are expected to get them all involved. (Stacy).*

*What eats the time up is, for me has been what I see as unnecessary paperwork that I’ve felt like I’m doing just to tick boxes to fulfil ‘the Standards’ and competence criteria. (Sean).*

These quotes illustrate the expectations felt by the trainees from macro level structures such as the TDA, NCPE and the University partnership arrangements. Whilst sometimes acknowledged as inhibiting their aspirations for practice, trainees gave no examples of being willing or able to reject macro expectations and preferred instead to ‘play the game’ in order to achieve their QTS. Carrying out macro expectations were considered non-negotiable and could come at a cost to other aspects of trainee practice.
I think we are trained to completely over plan. My mentor sat me down and she said ‘Sue, your planning is getting in the way of your teaching.’ But it is what we have to do to meet demands of The Standards\textsuperscript{37}….it’s frustrating but just how it is (Sue).

The way I view it is that if I can give the pupils my best whilst on placement it might come at a cost to other things I am supposed to do. It would be difficult to justify though (Sally).

The emphasis on placement files and collating evidence, that was frustrating when there were other things that demanded my time (Steven).

The emotional investment of trainees into the well-being of their pupils may be considered as being undermined by expectations. This may be considered as similar to Hochschild’s (1983) depiction of ‘speed-up’ in the airline industry and in Theodosius’ (2008) analyses of emotional demands on nurses. The situation facing teachers is a reflection of schools having an increased focus on success criteria, examination results and league tables. These factors have been shown in previous literature to have had in impact on the emotional work of teachers (Carlyle and Woods, 2002; Perryman, Ball, Maguire & Braun, 2011; Ball, 2008; Mahony & Hextall, 2000). These impacts on teachers have been far reaching and not least serving to increase frustration and disengagement due to perceived lack of control over their actions and reduced opportunity to show creativity in their work (Perryman et al, 2011).

The situation facing trainee teachers is considered here to have similar impacts but for differing reasons. The trainee teachers did not report feeling that the importance of their emotional work was undermined by school league tables, striving for exam results or following whole-school agendas, as reported in research into qualified teachers. The rules of the ‘field’ in which trainees operate differ from those of the ‘field’ of the qualified teacher and are more concerned with fulfilling competencies and rules associated with completing their ITT. In the case of the participants involved in the present study these were the QTT Standards (DCSF, 2007) which required 33 competencies to be met. Of similar impact to the trainees was the perceived need to

\textsuperscript{37}The TDA Standards are a set of competencies that trainees must demonstrate in order to achieve QTS
show their own accountability against the University partnership agreements including, but not limited to, lesson planning, evaluating, action planning and placement based tasks. Such an approach to education may be considered to be based upon technical rationality and has been criticised as being unable to capture the nuances, creativity or diversity of social life (Schon, 1987; Rolfe, Freshwater & Jasper, 2001; Thompson & Thompson, 2008). Trainees have a finite amount of time to fulfil their roles and are often required to reduce time from what they consider to be their priorities. In ways different to qualified teachers this technical rationality can undermine the important emotional work of trainee teachers and how they want to practice.

5.4.2.2 Meso expectations

Not all the trainees acknowledged the presence of macro-level expectations. Some emphasised the presence of meso-level expectations including school or department protocols. The following section considers a range of comments which represent differing responses to meso-level expectations:

*I filled in the incidents book and spoke to my head of department and passed it on to the head of year, who then was the one that told us that she’s had similar issues in her primary school. That was the process I had to follow (Stephanie).

*Because that is what everyone else did and it was what I was told to do. I suppose you do what the rest of the department do (Steven).

*I didn’t feel as though I could plan for my own interventions. I felt I did as much as I could but I couldn’t do my own thing as a trainee as I was working with the Head of Department. You can’t go in all guns blazing criticising what they do (Sam).

These first three extracts depict a conformist attitude as expectations were accepted and uncontested by the trainee. However, on some occasions the meso-level expectations appeared to be negotiable, were subjected to critique by trainees and were in some cases

---

38 The simplistic view that using knowledge in professional practice is simply a matter of applying a technical knowledge base in a direct way (Schön, 1983)
contested. Some participants were less accepting of meso-level expectations and showed that they were able to privately question the suitability of department processes.

*I think the action I took was all about writing something on a bit of paper, it’s on the school policy. I had to follow it, didn’t want to. You can’t make someone do something unless they’re psychologically ready to do it (Sarah).*

*I used the department 3 strikes policy, so if they forgot or if they didn’t bring kit 3 times, they would get a detention. The school has rules and you are expected to bring your kit. I’m not saying I agree with it (Stacy).*

*Obviously I’ve thought about more appropriate ways of dealing with the situation in my own head, but I didn’t say anything as I didn’t want to rock the boat or anything. It was really early stages of my first placement and I didn’t want to just bowl in and do my own thing. That wouldn’t have gone down well (Sam).*

*It is hard because a lot of the time you have got to go by what the school, what the placement, what the department recommend, and if you go against that, a lot of them won’t give you their support or time (Sue).*

*The department says that if you don’t bring your kit you get a detention. I’m not going to turn around and say ‘I won’t give you a detention because you’ve just told me that you don’t want to get in the water because of your man boobs.’ I would be on dodgy ground if the school has a hard and fast rule and I don’t follow it (Seb).*

In each of these examples trainees practiced as directed by the department but held private reservations and criticisms. On these occasions these participants demonstrated a more critical and constructive way of thinking about their treatment of sedentary children but ultimately still followed the expected courses of action. These extracts have been interpreted as trainees following expectations of others but with suggestions that they considered these approaches to be of limited value. Inherent in these extracts is also the suggestion that trainees felt inhibited by their neophyte status and did not feel able to express their opinions for fear of falling out of favour with staff and having
support withdrawn. To further support this contention the following extracts show some trainees who showed the strength to resist following recommended protocols and instead followed their own courses of action. In both cases the trainees appear aware that they were taking a risk by following the own practice intentions.

*I was encouraged to follow the behaviour policy, but to a degree I resisted. There was one girl who I had to have a word with each lesson. One of the teachers told me to make an example of her, and to send her on call [exclude to a member of the Senior Management Team]. I took a chance and just resisted from doing that because I thought that it’s only going to make the situation worse [by following the rules]. There was more to the situation than just punishing her (Sally).*

*I took a bit of a risk in doing it my own way. Originally what I did was I put them in groups of ability. I saw the situation differently to other staff so I tried it out. I wanted to raise her self- esteem (Sonia).*

The trainees often felt compelled to act in a certain way and to overtly act in accordance with the context which may include certain behaviours which depict that of the department or of their mentor. These behaviours are most often acknowledged as in conflict with their own preferred ways of operating causing emotion which trainees are often trying to conceal in order to stay ‘onside’ with mentors.

### 5.4.2.3 Micro expectations

The expectations felt by trainees extended all the way down to their perceptions of the individual needs of children. Having made strong reference to child-centred practice in their aspirations for their work there were numerous examples of the trainees feeling compelled to act in accordance with the needs of the children with whom they came into contact. On these occasions trainees would invest time and effort to find ways of engaging the children into their lessons.

*I would just take a few minutes to listen to what she [the obese girl] thought. We made a deal that she could choose who she worked with (Steven).*
I just tried sort of talking to her [obese girl] and it turned out that she was very, very conscious of performing in front of her friends because of her larger size. We came up with a solution of what she was prepared to do (Stacy).

There has got to be a dialogue that establishes why, and I think that these pupils want you to take an interest in them, finding out what is the problem, and is it something that we can resolve together (Sally).

The nature of these quotes reflects expectations of specific children which were in-keeping with the trainees’ aspirations for their practice. These differ from meso and macro expectations which often conflicted with the trainees’ aspirations and practice intentions, often undermining what they see as their priority. These findings further echo the notion of trainee teachers willingly engaging in certain types of emotional work as a daily routine part of their role.

The findings to this point have provided insights into the vision that the trainee teachers had for their practice. The trainees had an identity of the type of teacher they aspired to be, that is pupil- centred. It has been shown that the contextual expectations influence how trainees acted and how they conducted themselves in the practice setting. It is also apparent that the aspirations that the trainees held were very often conflicted by the structural demands on the social context, whether local or national rules or policies which direct their practice.

These experiences of trainee teachers have resonance with one of the central principles of Hochschild’s (1983, 2003) theory of emotional labour where flight attendants were required to publicly act out certain emotions for financial gain. Whilst there was no financial gain for the trainee teachers in this case, necessity is created in the present theory from the need to pass their final professional semester. The ‘currency’ in the present theory is the knowledge and support of the department and a smooth passage to qualified teacher status, as opposed to a wage as is the case in Hochschild’s original theory.

These dilemmas faced by the trainees resonate with the work of Hargreaves (1999) and Isembargar & Zembylas (2006) who argue that comparing Hochschild’s research on flight attendants with teachers may be a long stretch but the fact that teachers are
frequently asked to act in accordance with institutional rules regardless of how this
makes them feel suggests that teachers engage in emotional labour.

This section has;

- Presented three levels of contextual factors that influenced how the trainees practiced. These have been called macro, meso and micro expectations.
- Shown how expectations often conflict with the practice intentions of trainee teachers.
- Used literature to begin to explain key findings, in particular how the findings resonate with one aspect of emotional labour.

The next section depicts what happened when the trainee aspirations collided with contextual expectations in their daily lives.

5.5  
Combining trainee aspirations with contextual expectations

Learning to become a teacher requires trainees to confront problematic situations on a daily basis. Preferred courses of action can be conflicted by the expectations of others. Trainees are required to balance their own aspirations to make a difference to young lives, whilst also being seen to adhere to a series of contextual factors. This often presents a conflict to the trainee teacher. The following data charts some examples of trainee situations where they experienced this clash.

You see the difference when you work in different departments. You see the differences between teachers in departments, and the differences in their beliefs. I’ve worked with teachers that think everyone should be involved, whereas I’ve worked with teachers that think if they haven’t got their kit, they shouldn’t be allowed to take part. It’s tough to navigate (Steven).

I like to see them grow, see them progress, then you have a good relationship with them. Whereas the policies, the detentions they are not going to change them in the long term. I like to create a more positive atmosphere but in my experience the policy doesn’t do this (Sam).
From speaking to the other members of staff who took the lessons before I arrived, I think their opinion of athletics and of PE is quite different to mine, a bit more old school if I can call it that? I found it really confusing in that I had two conflicting views of the curriculum, and it’s quite hard to hit the balance. In this respect from the first moment that I met my mentor I knew that our kind of philosophies of PE were different (Stephanie).

I attended a parents’ evening with a member of staff who I didn’t particularly rate very highly and I wouldn’t say we shared the same sort of philosophy. It was very interesting to see a number of his pupils who came were kids who really didn’t enjoy PE at all (Sue).

For example, I would take the time just ask the pupil to hang on for a moment, or to spend 5 minutes for a chat. Whereas my mentor seemed to be saying to themselves ‘why am I going to waste my time on someone that doesn’t care, when I could be spending my time doing other things?’ (Sally).

The apparent mismatch between aspirations and expectations caused a disturbance in the minds of the trainees. The examples presented here centred upon the mismatch between their practice intentions and that of more experienced colleagues. To test the possible centrality of the discord between aspirations and expectations, evidence from an alternative perspective was gathered from a focus group with three University mentors.

The following data extracts appear to add weight to the claim that trainee aspirations were often subjected to pressure from other sources.

I saw part of my job as moulding them to the realities of teaching and of school life. There are so many other things to be getting on with. Pupils are just one aspect of our job (Mentor 1).

Some trainees arrive with aims and ideas which just won’t work in our school. Some students have honourable but unachievable intentions. Sometimes they are a little too idealistic. I have to rein them in and tell them what will work. (Mentor 2).
I think trainees are often misled or have adopted strategies which just won’t work in the ‘real world’. I don’t want to dampen their hopes but some have unattainable goals for their placements. (Mentor 3).

The role played by mentors in shaping trainees may often have been in conflict with the trainee preferred courses of action. Through these extracts mentors showed evidence of exerting influence over the trainees as they tried to influence how they wished them to practice. The mismatch between how trainees wanted to act and how they were pressured to act is considered here as a form of contradiction. The contradiction between aspirations and expectations became the central dimension of the emerging theory. Its centrality is based on the significance it holds in the experiences in learning to become a teacher along with its power in triggering the emotional responses of the trainees.\(^{39}\)

The contradiction generated by the mismatch between personal intentions for practice and contextual expectations was influenced by two factors. The next section considers factors that influenced how the trainees experienced contradiction.

### 5.5.1 Opportunity to carry out practice intentions

The degree to which the trainees could exercise freedoms over their practice varied greatly between trainees. Some trainees perceived that they had the opportunity to act out their own practice and to construct their own responses to situations.

*On this placement the department would just say ‘Do it yourself and learn from your mistakes. That felt really good as they were prepared and willing for me to make mistakes but let me come up with my own answers to situations (Sally).*

*The teachers suggested that I operated in a certain way but it wasn’t obligatory. They were very open for me to make my own decisions. If I didn’t do what they suggested there weren’t any repercussions (Sally).*

\(^{39}\) Data and explanations of triggering emotional responses are presented in section 6.1.
They were quite prepared to let me go off on my own. Which I suppose could be viewed as a positive or a negative (Stephanie).

There were, however, examples where trainees perceived little opportunity to act under their own volition.

I didn’t feel as though I could plan for my own interventions. I felt I did as much as I could but I couldn’t do my own thing as a trainee as I was working with the Head of Department (Sam).

My mentor didn’t really see her role as helping me develop into the teacher that I wanted to be. She would direct me how to deal with a class and insisted I followed her direction. I struggled as it wasn’t in my nature to do what she was suggesting (Stacy).

To add to the trainees’ perceptions of opportunity were several insightful comments made my mentors which confirm the limited opportunities for trainees to carry out their own actions.

I give them freedom to come up with their own way of dealing with situations but there have to be limits. Sometimes I have to think of the most expedient way of addressing the situation (Mentor 2).

I do sometimes tend to lean on trainees so that they make the right decision to best support their practice (Mentor 3).

The significance of this finding is that the trainees were keen to adopt certain courses of action which could fulfil their aspirations. In some cases there was no resistance, no contradiction. On numerous other occasions, when courses of action were imposed upon them trainees felt inhibited from adopting their practice intentions. The emotional impact of being inhibited from achieving personal goals has been reported in literature elsewhere. Emotion derived from being unable to achieve child-centred goals resonates with literature on the experiences of trainee and early career teachers who struggle to maintain their intentions associated with nurturing the needs of children (Hargreaves, 1994; Lortie, 2002; Day et al; 2007). The debilitating impacts of not being able to achieve personal goals (Burke & Greenglass, 1995; Kyriacou, 2001) or having courses
of action imposed which threaten the achievement of personal goals (Grandey, 2003) is also apparent within literature. Such an inability to carry out practice in-keeping with aspirations can also be a threat to the identity, the self-view that trainees hold of themselves as teachers (Perryman, Ball, Maguire & Braun, 2011).

Trainees are visitors in departments for the duration of their placement and as such can expect to have controls limiting their freedom to make certain decisions. The path to becoming a teacher is heavily regulated. Entry to the profession and the actions of teachers post qualifying to teach can expect to be heavily monitored by both internal school processes and external measures such as OFSTED and league tables. The increasing emphasis on measurement has already been considered in this chapter as having hallmarks of Hochschild’s (1983) notion of ‘speed-up’. The responses made or demanded of trainees can also be put into a sociological context of increasing accountability and managerialism where they are required to navigate a path through their school-based experiences whilst striking a balance between structure and agency.

The trainees showed examples where they perceived they could reproduce aspects of their world and that they were not completely controlled by structure. There are clear rules, policies and moral codes which govern the world of the trainee teacher. Trainees need to act according to these imposed structures but the findings here suggest that there does appear to be room for manoeuvre to exercise choice over some aspects of their work. The balance that trainees attempt to strike within their practice is captured by Bourdieu (1990, cited by Parkin, 1997: 376) who considers practice unfolds as ‘strategic improvisations – goals and interests pursued as strategies – against a backdrop of doxa that ultimately limits them.’ How trainees experience this balance is a critical feature of learning to become a teacher.

5.5.2 Perceived capacity to cope with problems

The second factor that influenced how the trainees coped with the contradiction between aspirations and expectations was their perceived capacity to cope with the situations they encountered. The following examples depict positive perceptions of a capacity to cope.
I didn’t feel the need to hand the problem on to my mentor. Perhaps I should have done, but I just felt that this was my class, you are part of my class and I will deal with what’s in my class. I wanted to show that I could deal with it myself (Sarah).

I think it comes down to experience of working with some incredibly vulnerable kids. That is the advantage I sit on now, priceless experience. But I don’t think everybody can go and get that experience, it is down to some tough choices I have made. I can’t really comment on other people. I just know I think the experience I had before University allows me to cope with these situations (Sean).

But I think that if it was just part of who I am. I try and always have a positive approach to things, deal with things my way and not get too stressed because I think at the end of the day I know I will have a positive impact on the pupils (Sam).

These examples depict high perceptions of capacity to cope with situations that they were confronted with. The trainees appeared to have drawn strength from previous experience and as a result showed no signs of being influenced by contradictory expectations. Other participants’ experiences differed.

They are quite a challenging class in terms of the behaviour and some of the more difficult characters. I would quite often think that I can’t do this anymore. I would get worried that I physically couldn’t bring myself to keep trying (Stacy).

I remember getting feedback on my lessons when I had said ‘that girl is such hard work’, because I didn’t know how to change it. I couldn’t deal with her. I didn’t really understand why she was acting the way that she was. I remember working with my mentor to come up with a plan to help (Sonia).

I couldn’t have continued without the guidance I was given. I became quite clinical but I didn’t know how else to respond. It felt bad to follow the policies but as I saw it at the time I didn’t have any other choice (Steven).
I genuinely thought there is nothing I can do here. So I just had to let the situation roll. It was horrible but I did nothing because I just felt helpless. I couldn’t think of what to do to change the situation (Sue).

Variation is seen here in the data as some of the trainees were overwhelmed by situations where they did not feel that they had the capacity to cope. In these situations they became reliant upon the support and recommended practice of others in the department. In these situations the trainees had the desire to follow, and their own practice intentions were inhibited.

Previous literature has considered the emotional impact of perceived low capacity to meet the demands of a given situation with the outcome of increased debilitating emotions (Lazarus & Folkman, 1984; Aldwin, 1994; Speilberger & Sarason, 1991; Toch, 2002). Some participants in this study perceived that they had sufficient capacity and opportunity to confront challenges as they arose. In these cases there would be fewer debilitating impacts of emotions. On the other hand were trainees who perceived insufficient capacity, with or without opportunity to carry out their own action. In these situations it is reasonable to suggest that trainees may suffer from negative emotions and stress of not being able to deal with situations they face.

This section has;

- Depicted that trainee teachers experience contradiction when there is a mismatch between the aspirations they hold for their practice and the expectations of the training context.
- Contended that the contradiction they face is influenced by two factors; the opportunity they perceive in dealing with problems that they confront and their perceptions of their capacity to cope with challenges as they arise.
- Used literature to further support recognition of the emotional demands placed on trainees due to contradiction they face.
5.6 Summary of chapter 5

This chapter is the first of two chapters presenting the findings of this study. It has built the basis for the explanatory theory of the emotional demands of becoming a PE teacher. More specifically this chapter has been presented in four progressive sections:

Section 5.2 - presented key biographical information which underpinned the practice intentions of the trainee PE teachers.

Section 5.3 - showed the strength of the trainees’ child-centred aspirations for their practice.

Section 5.4 – outlined three sets of contextual factors, called expectations, which impinge upon the trainees’ decision making and practice.

Section 5.5 – depicted a contradiction between the trainees’ aspirations and contextual expectations, and revealed two factors that influenced how the contradiction was experienced by trainees.

Integrated through this chapter was the use of literature for comparison and to offer clarity to the emerging theory of becoming a teacher. The literature used has focused on the emotional demands placed on qualified teachers and has drawn parallels with the experiences of the trainees who took part in this study.

The findings to this point have depicted what causes and influences emotional demands of learning to become a teacher. Some emotional work is expected and willingly accepted by trainees, such as investing in practice which they feel is making a difference to the lives of the pupils. Other emotional work is less enjoyable and results from being unable to fulfil practice intentions due to contradiction in their day to day practice.

The final professional semester is 17 weeks long and is filled with ‘ill-structured’ or ‘messy’ situations (King & Kitchener, 1994). Navigating these are common occurrences for trainee teachers. Further detail on emotional demands and what happens when these experiences accumulate over 17 weeks is the focus for chapter 6.
Chapter 6

Building on the findings presented in chapter 5 this chapter:

- Explains how the trainee teachers responded to contradictions in their daily lives.
- Builds an understanding of how accumulated emotional demands impacted on the trainee teachers.
- Depicts the processes employed by the trainees in coping with the emotional demands of becoming a teacher.
- Uses literature to enhance the clarity of the findings.
- Summarises the findings of this thesis.

6.1 Responses to daily contradiction

Throughout their 17 week final professional semester it was common for the trainees to experience contradiction between their personal aspirations and the expectations of others. This contradiction was influenced by;

- perceptions of opportunity afforded to cope with problems,
- perceptions of their capacity to cope with problems.

Data and supporting literature presented in chapter 5 showed how these experiences contributed to the emotional load on trainees. All trainees considered that their final professional semester presented successive situations which were emotionally demanding. There was, however, variation in trainees’ emotional responses.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Participant</th>
<th>Positive emotions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sally</td>
<td>Satisfaction, motivating, rewarded for effort</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Steven</td>
<td>Enjoyment, energised</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sue</td>
<td>Fulfilled, pleased</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sam</td>
<td>Proud, worthy</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 32; positive emotional responses described by trainees
Table 32 presents some of the words used by trainees to describe the positive emotions they felt as they worked to confront contradiction in their role. These emotions were most often associated with situations where they felt supported in making their own decisions and where they felt that they had the capacity to deal with situations they faced.

Table 33 presents a greater number of examples where the trainees responded to contradiction with negative emotions.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Participant</th>
<th>Emotional response&lt;sup&gt;40&lt;/sup&gt;</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Stephanie</td>
<td>Anger, confusion, worry, annoyance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sam</td>
<td>Shame, confusion, annoyed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sarah</td>
<td>Annoyance, confusion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sonia</td>
<td>Mistrust, anger, upset</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sue</td>
<td>Disheartened, disillusioned, horrible, de-motivated</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Seb</td>
<td>Anger, rejection, dismay</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sean</td>
<td>Resigned, accepting, disappointment, understanding</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 33; trainee negative emotional response to contradictions

Seven out of ten trainees raised negative emotions they experienced as a result of contradictions. These emotions were most often aligned to situations where the trainees observed or were required to practice in such a way which did not match their views on child-centred practice. They did not feel able to exert their control over situations or where they perceived they did not have the capacity to cope with the situation they faced. The range and strength of emotions depicted in tables 32 and 33 presents contrasting responses to repeated contradiction. There is stark contrast between energising, positive emotions and others which were draining and debilitating.

Whilst emotional responses were common there were variations where trainees concealed or tried to ignore their emotions choosing instead to follow a pragmatic, mechanical approach to the situations they faced.

> Yes, there was definitely one occasion where I just left the two problem children alone. They didn’t bother me and I didn’t bother them. There was only so much I could give so I just let it ride. It felt gutting, really bad but also slightly relieved that I didn’t have to think of how to cope with them all of the time (Sonia).

<sup>40</sup> The vast majority of emotions cited were self-labelling e.g ‘It (the treatment of the child) made me so angry.’
I could either tackle the situation my way or just try to accept that she [the obese girl] didn’t do PE and ignore the situation. They [members of the department] wanted me to be unemotional about it and that was the consequence of not dealing with it properly, my way.....caring about what happened to the pupil (Sarah).

If I am brutally honest I just sat them down, some of them children were quite rude to me. I didn’t think anything would work with them and wasn’t going waste my time and energy. I just did what others do, followed the policy and called the Head of Department. It was horrible. I felt I had failed (Stacy).

In these situations the trainees undermined their preferred courses of action. On these occasions their initial intention appeared to be to avoid making an emotional response to the situations they faced. In retrospect their pragmatic approach backfired and trainees ended up accumulating emotions due to the uncaring approach they felt they had to adopt. This data presents the case that trainee teachers engage in considerable emotional work in learning to become a teacher. Even when they make conscious efforts to avoid investing emotions into a situation they end up becoming emotional about the pragmatic approaches adopted.

6.1.2 Managing emotional responses

The previous section established emotional work as a significant feature in learning to become a teacher. Due to the prevalence of emotional work it is critical to build an understanding of ways in which trainees try to manage their emotions on a day to day basis. Emotional management, defined by Hochschild (1983: 7) as, ‘the management of feeling to create a publicly observable facial and bodily display,’ is the focus of this section.

Despite often harbouring negative emotions towards some of what they saw and how they were required to act, the trainees seldom felt able to display their true selves to others around them. The following quotes are examples of where the trainees admitted that they did not want or feel able to overtly share their emotions with others.
I actually felt angry, not with the girl, with the other members of staff, in that you start to feel responsible for them, and the fact that I’d gone away for one lesson and that she had been fine, and then suddenly it was back to square one.....I didn’t know how to approach it. I just left it and carried on as normal (Stephanie).

.... I was genuinely very concerned, and wanted to engage her more and find out what the problem was, but my mentor just didn’t really have time for her, she said ‘I think everyone’s giving her too much patience.’ I was thinking how wrong that was but didn’t feel I could show it (Stephanie).

I’ve thought about it in my own head, it really annoyed me to see her not getting involved but I didn’t say or do anything because I didn’t want to rock the boat. It was really early stages of my first placement (Sam).

The following two extracts from one interview capture an example of how this trainee was emotive about the practice they observed but put their own feelings aside to adopt the department norms

But then I would see poor practice that would upset me and I wouldn’t agree with it. I would think to myself that there’s no way I’m going to teach like that (Sarah).

I questioned why that was their strategy. The answer was ‘Oh, as long as he’s got his kit he can do what he likes.’ I couldn’t tell them what I thought or how I felt. I was on placement. I just got on with it. I just couldn’t show them how I felt (Sarah).

These two quotes depict the desire of one trainee to act out her own preferred course of action which she felt would be more beneficial to future retention of activity for a sedentary child. The trainee painted a situation where she felt unable to exert control over a situation which she perceived was non-negotiable.

During their final professional semester trainee teachers identified what they considered to be appropriate emotional displays and appropriate actions. These displays are called feeling rules or emotional conventions that people consider are expected within a
context (Fineman, 2007). The trainee teachers felt inhibited to display authenticity in their outward emotions due to the perception of what they should feel as a PE trainee surrounded by experienced staff. These emotions were most often associated with showing willing when following prescribed courses of action despite harbouring negative feelings. Data presented also shows how expected emotions were not made explicit to the trainees but were left implied through the actions and general persona of qualified staff.

I could tell that it [my way of coping] wouldn’t have gone down well. It wasn’t the way they [the department] did things. I felt the need to follow what I was told (Stacy).

Emotions can become controlled through invisible pressure (Jakhelln, 2011). Just as overt teaching practice is exposed to the social and contextual demands around it, so too are the emotional practices of trainees. It was common for the trainees to respond to the emotional work demanded of them by feigning or ‘painting on’ emotions to match those required for their role. This response has been termed ‘surface acting’ (Hochschild, 1983) or ‘emotion faking’ (Zerbe, 2000). It is carried out by trainees when they feel dissonance between the emotions they should express and those they feel they should suppress (Zapf, Vogt, Seifert, Mertini & Isic, 1999).

The trainee teachers claimed to be heavily pupil-centred in their intentions and actions. Their perspective appeared almost exclusively directed at concerns over pupil well-being. Surface acting by the trainees was most often associated with suppressing feelings derived from observing practice which did not meet their visions of child-centred approaches to teaching. The perception that their own actions should follow the practice of others placed further emotional demands on some trainees. Becoming emotionally involved in trying to enhance children’s school experience has previously been considered a common occurrence in the teaching profession (Jakhelin, 2011), but little research has considered this point in the lives of trainees.

41 Surface acting – ‘In surface acting we attempt to deceive others about what we really feel, but don’t deceive ourselves’ (Hochschild, 1983: 33)
The importance of surface acting was recognised by the trainees as many felt the need to mimic the emotional environment around them whilst in the school whilst at the same time working hard to contain their true emotions. It was common for trainees to bottle up emotional outbursts for private audiences away from the school context.

*You have to train yourself to carry that baggage. I’ve got my coping mechanisms, like for example, I don’t like to share lifts with anybody to where I work, I like to be more than 40 minutes away from my house. That means I can sit in my car, going to school, and I can sit in my car coming back from school. I can do what I need to do to wrap up my day (Sean).*

*I would get home and be completely drained from bottling it all up. I would want to hide away. It helps knowing your friends are in the same position and you can bounce off each other (Sam).*

*Sometimes I just need to get out of there [school] and let it all out. It became difficult to keep it all in on some days (Steven).*

*I would lose myself at the end of the day in my training. It became cathartic for me, releasing everything that had built up and couldn’t be released elsewhere (Sally).*

Some trainees found ways of releasing emotions outside of their school such as peer support, physical activity or a pre-planned moment of solitude at the end of the school day. Differentiating between private and public emotions is a feature of trainees’ emotional work. This process requires trainees to recognise what is suitable and appropriate for the public realm and what must be hidden from public display. This feature of their practice resonates with Goffman’s concept of dramaturgy (1974) and his notions of ‘front stage, back stage’ (1959, 1961) where front stage is merely a publicly acceptable performance and back stage is where the real self can be expressed. Similar explanations are proposed by Boud (1989) and Usher, Bryant & Johnston (1997) who both conceptualised traditions of adult learning and shared common ground in recognising displays of the authentic and inauthentic self that permeate practice. It is suggested here that surface acting is a key part of learning to become a teacher as it is a
common response to the accumulation of emotions during the final professional semester.

Responding through surface acting was not the only way the trainees responded to the accumulation of emotional demands. In some situations trainees acted in accordance with recommended practice without openly questioning its suitability and in apparent good grace in order to fit in with the department. As the 17 weeks progressed there were occasions where trainees appeared to adjust to the demands of the department. The following extracts show traces of trainees gradually overriding their authentic feelings and following a course of action that started to become their new ‘norm’.

Then you completely forget it, all of your morals, all of your values, everything, because you’ve just suddenly just been given time and pressure constraints, now all of a sudden nothing else matters but getting from A to B with your work and getting the job done (Sean).

At the time it was the mentor who advised me and I felt I needed to follow what they were saying. I questioned it at the time but eventually I avoided thinking about it too much and just got on with what they were saying (Sally).

I just got on with what I had to do. I told myself it was only a few weeks to go and would be finished (Sarah).

I found my second placement much harder to deal with. Basically, it was do it their way or no way. I couldn’t justify making allowances to do it my own way. I was confused so I worked hard to follow their policy, following what they were saying and it all worked out OK (Sam).

Thinking about it now, after the placement, makes me think again. I just got my head down, got on with my work and got through it (Steven).

Acceptance of practice around them may be considered to be the beginnings of trainee practice becoming moulded by the context. Over time some of the trainees showed signs of beginning to adopt alternative strategies as their own. The processes described here may be considered to be similar to what Hochschild (1983) called ‘deep acting’ which requires the individual to deceive themselves about the emotions they feel,
usually by suppressing negative emotions (Grandey, 2003). In this case deep acting is being achieved by exhorting emotions\(^{42}\) that are required for a particular context or situation. Exhorting emotions are achieved in the above extracts by self-talk and thought suppression.

Exhorting emotions requires the trainee to overtly display certain emotions whilst also trying to actually feel those emotions. It was common for some trainees to gradually become more accustomed to practice which would previously have conflicted with their preferred courses of action. Quotes show a perceived need in the trainee teachers to change or suppress true emotions to ‘fit-in’ in order to depict more believable displays to those around them.

### 6.1.3 The emotional labour of learning to become a teacher

The previous section built the case that the trainees managed their emotional load by either concealing their true emotions or by adjusting their emotions to fit into their environment. These two responses are called surface acting and deep acting and are central features of Hochschild’s (1983) theory of emotional labour.

Emotional labour has been used to understand the relationship between emotions felt and emotions required in a particular context. Several authors have applied an emotional labour perspective to the roles of teachers (Hargreaves, 1999; Carlyle & Woods, 2002; Naring, Breit & Brouwers, 2006; Noor & Zainuddin, 2011; Jakhelin, 2011). Isenbarger & Zembayas (2006: 122) conceptualize emotional labour as ‘when emotions are underplayed, overplayed, neutralised or changed according to specific emotional rules ....teachers perform emotional labour.’ There are no known theories that have focused on the emotional labour of learning to become a PE teacher.

Data has been presented which underlines the emotional work of trainees and how they respond by surface and deep acting. Other features of emotional labour were evident in the practice of the trainee teachers. The table below contains an overview of

\(^{42}\) Exhorting emotions – ‘where an individual attempts to evoke or suppress an emotion.’ (Kiely & Sevastos, 2008: 1).
components of emotional labour according to Hochschild (1983) and Theodosius (2008) along with the resonance of each component against the present theory. The resonance presented is based upon the regularity of each construct within individual cases.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Emotional labour construct</th>
<th>Presence in the data</th>
<th>Resonance with the present theory</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Emotional demands</td>
<td>Every first round interview included examples of trainees citing emotions associated with their work</td>
<td>Very high</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Feeling rules</td>
<td>Five out of ten first round interviews contained trainees’ perceptions of the emotions required of the context</td>
<td>Medium</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Surface acting</td>
<td>Eight trainees depicted situations where they felt unable to display their true self or real emotions to members of the department, choosing to ‘paint on’ more appropriate emotions</td>
<td>High</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deep acting – exhorting emotions</td>
<td>Five out of ten trainees showed signs of exhorting emotions which would ‘fit in’ with the context through thought suppression or self-talk</td>
<td>Medium</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emotional consonance⁴³</td>
<td>Regulating emotions was a big part of trainee emotional work. In this respect there was no sign of emotional consonance.</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emotions sold for a wage (analytical comment and data on this construct can be seen on page 108)</td>
<td>Trainee teacher emotions were not sold for a wage but for department support. Trainees perceived they needed to act in accordance with rules to gain smooth passage to QTS</td>
<td>No⁴⁴</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Undermining of emotions</td>
<td>Six first round interviews and three second round interviews considered their emotional work undermined by external expectations.</td>
<td>High</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 34 – The resonance of the present theory with central tenets of emotional labour according to Hochschild (1983) and Theodosius (2008).

Learning to become a teacher has significant emotional demands. The way the trainees managed their emotional work is presented here as being congruent with central features of emotional labour, most strongly with the undermining of emotions through surface and deep acting. The trainees also appeared to recognise the need to adopt feeling rules of the context in order to maintain support from school staff to smooth their pathway to

⁴³ Emotional consonance; where an individual is able to effortlessly feel required emotions there is an absence of emotional labour (Naring, Breit & Brouwers, 2007).
⁴⁴ But the principle of emotions being ‘sold’ for support towards QTS is apparent in the present theory (analytical comments and data presented on p. 115)
QTS. Comparisons between Hochschild’s (1983) formal theory of emotional labour and the substantive theory built in this thesis are revisited and discussed in chapter 7.

The finding that trainee teachers frequently acted out feelings and behaviours which were incongruent with their preferred practice and the self-view they held for themselves as teachers was particularly significant. This process has been previously labelled as the inauthenticity of self (Hochschild, 1983; Theodosius, 2008) and has been considered as one of the traditions of adult learning in the professions (Boud, 1989; Usher, Bryant & Johnston, 1997). Such concealing of the true self, or faking, has been previously considered in the lives of early career teachers as contributing to emotional exhaustion (Ogbonna & Harris, 2004). It is evident here that trainee identity can become threatened by their experience if they are required to conceal their true self, and can lead to similarly debilitating emotional strain (Clemente, 1999). No known studies have traced this phenomenon back to the teacher training phase. This finding is considered further in chapter 7.

This section has:

- Presented the emotional responses made by the trainee teachers as they contended with daily contradictions throughout their final professional semester.
- Depicted processes used by the trainee teachers in attempting to manage their emotions, most notably the use of surface and deep acting. Both of these ways of managing require trainees to be inauthentic in their work and undermine the teacher identity they hold for themselves.
- Aligned trainee teachers’ emotional management to the central processes of Hochschild’s (1983) theory of emotional labour.
6.2 Impacts of emotional labour on trainee teachers

This section builds the explanatory theory by considering how the accumulation of emotions and their regulation through emotional labour impacted on trainee teachers. The following series of extracts depict some trainees’ recollections of emotive situations.

*I am glad it happened and I am glad I experienced that situation. It wasn’t the only time I got upset. I’m still a bit worried now but I know that it is all a learning curve really (Steven).*

*I think I needed to go through those moments to get to where I needed to be, to understand what I was going into (Sue).*

*Sometimes I just wanted to cry, it was tough. But overall it was rewarding and necessary for me (Seb).*

*That’s how we move on. If you tackle a problem or an issue you learn and move forward. If you hide behind something or are constantly relying on others then the problem will never be solved. You have to tackle the issue and learn from it (Sam).*

*The situation helped with my confidence, in my teaching and my ability to actually engage children....and to cope with being in a department. I think as a result I actually came a lot further, and with children like that it kind of helped me grow in my ability to deal with things like that (Stacy).*

*I learned from those testing situations. They taught me what the job was really like (Sean).*

In each of these examples the trainees felt benefits from emotive experiences. In some cases the moment itself was unpleasant but provided learning opportunities for future growth. Experiences were viewed as helping them move towards achieving their goals and have been labelled here as the *adaptive impacts* of trainee teachers’ emotional work. Adaptive impacts included; improved learning, enhanced confidence, greater

---

45 Adaptive impacts - impacts that help the trainee adapt to the demands of becoming a teacher
awareness of being a teacher and progression in coping with problems. Trainees, however, did not always feel positive about their emotional work.

As soon as I knew my mentor’s thinking I felt so disheartened. I hated it. I didn’t want to teach after I’d finished the placement (Sue).

I didn’t feel I could cope and didn’t have the belief that I could complete the placement (Sonia).

I came out of my first placement not wanting to teach anymore. I didn’t like the way the school operated, the children were horrible and I just didn’t want to teach. It would get to the point where I would be thinking ‘I can’t do this anymore. I actually can’t carry on’ (Stacy).

I saw little point in carrying on. I wasn’t getting anywhere. It was just the same day in day out. I wasn’t getting anything from it [the teaching placement] (Sally).

I just wanted to go away and cry. It was terrible that they didn’t seem to care, weren’t bothered about her [the obese girl]. I couldn’t operate like that (Stephanie).

These are variations in the data which show alternative perspectives on the contradiction experienced during the final professional semester. Several examples exist whereby trainees endured *maladaptive impacts* of their experiences. More specifically maladaptive impacts included; thoughts of withdrawal from teaching, feeling disillusioned, reduced job satisfaction and reduced confidence to fulfil their role. These examples demonstrate how contradictory situations can inhibit learning, job satisfaction and even the continued pursuit of a career in teaching. In these situations trainees may move further away from their goal of becoming a teacher and therefore their emotional work is considered as having a negative impact. A further example below shows how one trainee recognised harmful impacts vicariously and projected forward to predict possible consequences for their own future

---

46 Maladaptive impacts - impacts that inhibit the trainee from successfully adapting to the demands of becoming a teacher.
I think there are times when you just reach the limit of what you can take on board and your brain will just say ‘I can’t take this anymore.’ I am aware of this and have begun to see it in others around the school. Will it happen to me? That comes back to my 10 year rule. Will I still be able to do this in 10 years’ time? Probably not (Sean).

Data has shown that impacts of emotional labour can have either adaptive or maladaptive impacts on learning to become a teacher. Further analysis of the data shows factors which can dictate the type of impact that trainees are likely to experience. The following extracts depict a range of intrinsic factors such as forging a bond with children, improving children’s adherence to activity, impacting on children’s lives and pride emanating from receiving praise from other people.

My priority has always been to establish the relationships with the children. When I have that bond and start making a difference to their lives it is all worth it (Sally).

When I see her [the obese girl] I feel so happy because she is now so active. I think if I hadn’t of kept pushing the point with the other teachers, maybe she would have been out of activity for months (Sue).

I think the ups and downs all mean something when I get a reward out of having a relationship with the pupils, and I can make sure that the child thinks that they are somebody and that they have been noticed (Sarah).

Part of the reason for becoming a teacher and really what I enjoy is getting to know pupils and building up the relationships especially for the ones that do find physical activity more difficult, because then you see such an improvement (Steven).

When things are tough it is important to me that I feel I can begin to sustain relationships really, really well with kids, and it’s not just so that I can tick off that competence (Sean).
I felt so proud. The Head of Department came up and shook my hand as no one else had been able to get her active. It seems that I have had a big impact on her. I was really pleased and proud. (Sam)

It was during parents’ evening when I began to feel so proud. A resounding number of parents told me that their child had a terrible time in PE until now (Sally).

Feeling intrinsic reward is important if trainees are to experience helpful impacts from the emotional labour that they engage in. Further examples however, depict a different story when reward is not forthcoming and experiences are less positive for trainees.

Sometimes I would go in, have a really good lesson, I would get her engaged. The next lesson it would be back to square one and now not participating again, and it was very up and down, very frustrating as overall I don’t think I got anywhere (Sonia).

I felt like a like a babysitter almost. I wasn’t actually having any impact and no engagement with the kids which was meaningful. There was no great rapport with the kids. There was no feeling that you were making an impact on how they felt about things like principles of life, physical activity or health. You were just turning up, they were turning up, you’d take them, and then they went to another class (Sue).

It was tough because sometimes I did think to myself that I’m hitting my head against a brick wall with you. There’s no amount of talking to this girl, or going at it from different directions that’s going make you do PE or going to make you take part actively in PE. What’s the point? I did just feel like hitting my head against a brick wall, and thinking what am I going to do with you? (Sally).

It didn’t make in impact. She still did the same thing in the next lesson or maybe I would get it sorted for one lesson or so. But I think that would give me a headache if I had to teach like that all of the time (Stephanie).
It just didn’t have any impact, which is probably hard and frustrating because you think about the lessons that you would have taken in trying to change something and the time you have put in (Sonia).

In contrast to being able to fulfil their aspirations and gain rewards or recompense for their efforts these extracts show instances where trainees failed to feel reward for their labour. In some instances they felt reward for their emotional labour by yielding positive outcomes such as forging strong bonds with pupils, making a difference to young lives and staying true to their child-centred aspirations. On other occasions, trainees gained little or no such rewards from their labour.

This section has

- Presented how the trainees’ emotional labour could have adaptive or maladaptive impacts on learning to become a teacher.
- Shown that feeling intrinsic rewards from fulfilling their child-centred aspirations is one important factor in the trainees’ experiencing helpful impacts from their emotional labour.

### 6.3 Coping with the emotional labour of becoming a teacher

The substantive theory to this point has presented the accumulation of emotions in learning to become a teacher. Central to this is contradiction between aspiration and expectations and how trainees sometimes felt compelled to undermine their true self, to be inauthentic in their practice. The final part of the theory depicts coping with this emotional labour as they prepare for their career.

Challenging situations are recollected in the next series of extracts. On each of these occasions the trainees’ difficulties are accompanied by support from school staff.

My two mentors were very different. One was less interested in building me up and was only concerned with what I did, how I taught day to day. The other [mentor] supported me when I was struggling, we would sit down and discuss things affecting me (Sarah).
On my second placement I realised that I could try different things as I was given support in and time for reflection. Reflection and guidance were definitely major bits for me (Sue).

I never really knew I was actually paying that much attention to the support at the time but deep down it must have helped me. Talking to someone in the profession stopped me just accepting things I was told and things I saw. In time I was more able to respond in my own way. (Stephanie).

Sometimes I dealt with situations well, sometimes I dealt with it badly, but then it comes down to your reflections on it with another member of staff, or just your own evaluation of how you dealt with the situation. That is when you get to learn (Stacy).

I got through my lessons with conversations and reflections with my mentor who was in the room at the time....I didn’t really understand how to get through it [the difficult situation in a lesson] until we talked (Steven).

The apparent value and importance of being given time to reflect and understand their experience is displayed by these quotes. The trainees depicted scenarios where they had been able to recollect occasions where they had been afforded time to discuss issues that had confronted them in their teaching. The value of reflection in these quotes is limited to helping trainees address issues relating to pedagogy and their teaching practice. The quotations show where trainees had been able to keep their ‘head up’ and be cognisant of factors that were influencing them during their lessons, and have been given opportunity to address issues that arose. These quotations contrast with occasions where trainees became immersed in challenging situations and began to show signs of emotional strain in their work. The following extracts present some trainee recollections of being consumed by their immediate surroundings, showing an inability to see through the difficulties that they faced.

I genuinely thought there is nothing I can do here. So I just had to let the situation roll, got on with what I was told to do. It was horrible but I did nothing because I just felt helpless. I couldn’t think of what to do to change the situation (Sue).
I would quite often think that I can’t do this anymore, pretending everything was OK. I would get worried that I physically couldn’t bring myself to keep trying (Stacy).

The students weren’t listening, nobody was paying any interest at all, it was awful, it was awful. It made me question myself as a teacher, question what I had planned and question what I was trying to do. I didn’t want to just ‘get by’ I wanted to do it my way, the way I was trained but it came down to just surviving, just getting my head down and getting on with it (Steven).

And then before I knew it weeks had passed and I was having the same conversations, same problems and doing the same things. Nothing had changed (Seb).

It got to a point where I just broke down. I had put everything into it and then realised that I was doing what I could to survive (Seb).

I would go home some days and think ‘God, I’ve not made any headway today, she was awful, she didn’t bring her kit again’, it was like a huge slap in the face. I wasn’t making any progress and now we’re back to square one. Have I got the energy to keeping trying to have an impact on her [the obese pupil]? (Stacy).

These extracts show examples of where trainees had recollections of being ground down by the day to day challenges they faced. They also allude to energy sapping emotional strain of not being able to meet the demands of challenging situations. Evident in these comments is the extent to which the trainees appeared deflated by their experiences due to a lack of reward for their efforts and the prospect of compromising their practice just to survive. It is proposed here that trainees adopted a ‘head down’ approach to their work as they confronted daily challenges and emotional demands of their work. They did not appear to have had support in working through the difficulties they faced. The value of reflection in assisting trainees cope with the pedagogic issues they face in their teaching scenarios is not contested here. However, concerns are raised over the extent to which traditional conceptions of reflective practice have the capacity to address wider issues facing trainee teachers, such as coping with the emotional demands or being slowly ground down by their experiences, or feeling able to articulate their feelings. In
support of this are three quotations illustrating where trainees did not feel supported making sense of their experiences beyond the classroom

I didn’t feel as though there was anywhere to go, anyone to talk to about how I felt things were going and things that were affecting me personally (Stacy).

I am pretty sure I would have benefitted from the opportunity to think about some of the broader issues affecting me on my placement (Steven).

I still don’t feel like I learnt a lot from my earliest practice because I had no-one to reflect on it with. Quite often people will say that it’s good if you have a challenging first placement. I only agree if you can reflect on it and you have someone to reflect with. I didn’t have that opportunity on the first placement I didn’t know what was right or what I should ……I had some big issues but didn’t know what I should do or who to approach (Sue).

In two cases the interviews for this study provided a forum from which two trainees could consider their experiences.

I think this sort of process and the conversation that we’re having now is important in understanding what went on and how it made me feel. I probably wouldn’t have sat down and thought about it if I hadn’t been coming here today [to the interview]. I’m sure that lots of people are experiencing this sort of thing day to day and haven’t really thought about it (Sally).

This interview is the first chance I have had to really analyse it [my experience] like that (Sue).

Looking back on experience appeared important in helping the trainees to stay attuned to their place in the teaching profession. In a fast moving context such as school teaching, it is easy for teachers to become detached from their surroundings and lose sight of who they are and what they set out to achieve. Trainee teachers in this study shared several vicarious examples of this through the observations of others

I found that hard to believe at the time that a teacher would deliberately sidestep a child who looked like they were going to disclose something [to them]. But
when you’re now in schools and under pressure and you’re hearing things on a day to day basis, I can see what he means and why he would switch off and sidestep the situation. I don’t think I could ever do it myself, but then come back and ask me in 5 years, maybe sometimes in your life you’re carrying your own personal baggage and you have to avoid other people’s baggage? (Sean).

I think it’s really upsetting though when you do try and then you realise that some teachers have given up and that they can’t be bothered with some children. If the teacher can’t be bothered what message are you giving to the children? (Sue).

I see it that when you get into the profession and it’s busier. You don’t have much time to deal with everyday sorts of issues. I can see how you could forget the things that matter (Stephanie).

I could begin to see it most days, teachers almost giving up, going through the motions and just trying to get through their day. I wonder what it will be like for me a few years down the line (Sally).

It is a shame, it is definitely a shame that some teachers have almost given up on their standards of practice. I can see why but I would like to think that I would still be doing the same things in 15 year time. (Steven)

These quotations demonstrate trainees’ recognition of practice which they do not agree with but do appear to understand. Here the trainees disclosed how they saw a deterioration of teacher practice as those around them showed signs of fatigue but had the presence of mind to reconsider their own place within this by projecting forward into their careers. The ability to attend to the dangers of switching off, becoming detached and merely existing in the profession is a crucial final stage to the substantive theory presented here. The trainees in these extracts commented on how they intended to continue honouring the identity they held for themselves and how they intended to stay authentic to their aspirations. The extracts below depict further trainee intentions as their career unfolds.
I like to think that it will never come to that [going through the motions] and I will always make time to sort out the important things. I like to think I wouldn’t just hide behind policy. Unlike some (teachers) I have seen (Stephanie).

If it doesn’t work, then I will just keep changing it. I think that’s a duty of a teacher to make sure that every pupil is engaged, and I think if I’m not able to do it then I would question whether I was doing my job properly (Sonia).

I look at other teachers and many don’t make the effort to individualise learning. I don’t think it takes a great deal of effort so I don’t understand why they don’t do it. I could probably sit down and within an hour come up with alternative tasks. I’m sure I could try and think of something that would make it a bit more inclusive (Sue).

I will be more proactive in trying to change things and to sustain it later on. If you change things when you go into a school I think you can make a difference and to sustain that difference over time. It would be my ambition to make sure that my intentions are sustained throughout my time at the school (Sonia).

Whilst these quotations could symbolise what has been referred to as the shift from idealism to pragmatism (Shkedi & Laron, 2004; Furlong & Maynard, 1995), appreciating how this shift may be delayed or altogether prevented is crucial to the training and retention of teachers. These last four extracts depict occasions where trainees showed their awareness of what was happening around them, they had not become totally immersed in their day to day lives and showed the ability to keep their head up and be aware of issues that will face them as their career unfolds. This attribute is labelled here as conscious attention and should be distinguished from traditional conceptions of reflective practice. Whilst the data presented in this section would appear to add further support to the value of reflection in addressing classroom based issues it is considered here to be an inadequate and misleading term that fails to capture a broader understanding of staying attuned to what is happening in the environment and how it is impacting on emotions. Conscious attention is further demonstrated below.

47 The term conscious attention and how it is distinguished from traditional conceptions of reflection is discussed in detail on p. 160.
I think becoming less pupil-centred would be an easy thing to do. I think that there’s only so much you can do, there’s only so many avenues you can go down before you just feel like hitting your head against a brick wall. I think that has been a major part of being a teacher for me, being aware of what to expect and the chance that this could happen [to me] (Sally).

Seeing it happen around you, being aware of how teachers get ground down. It is important to see it and be aware of what is going on in the profession (Sue).

I can see that some teachers reach a limit of what they can possibly take on board. The human brain gets to a point when it says ‘I can’t do this anymore’. When you see that in some teachers you begin to understand other sides of the job (Sean).

I think being pupil centred is just my philosophy of PE and the sort of teacher I want to be. I want to show that what happens to the children matters to me. I don’t want them to feel horrible. I wouldn’t ever see myself operating like that (Seb).

You could tell that there wasn’t that much interest [in the obese girl] from her other teachers. They had had enough and she was merely a name on the list. Treating her like that was never going to be an option for me, I wouldn’t compromise what I thought was right for the child (Sarah).

By consciously attending to their environment and their place within it the trainees were avoiding the prospect of becoming ‘unreflexive prisoners’ (Usher, 2009) in their work or adopting ‘tramline thinking’ (Thompson & Thompson 2008). Both of these terms have been used to depict scenarios where teachers focus exclusively on day to day management and lose sight of their evolving self in the bigger picture. Through conscious attention trainees were able to continue to develop their understanding of their role, the context, and stay attuned to their sense of self. Despite being considered as novices, some trainees appeared able to keep track of how their landscape was changing, what was happening around them and keep abreast of how events may impact on their developing identity as teachers.
Various terms have been applied to this ability to periodically consciously attend to the bigger picture, float above their practice and take a holistic overview of themselves and their work. Terms such as ‘going meta’ (Bruner, 1996), ‘helicopter vision’ (Thompson & Thompson, 2008) and ‘mindfulness’ (Heron, 2009; Hamer, 2006) have been previously used to label the capacity of teachers to be conscious of themselves within their surroundings, to be present in the moment and to attend to pressures to gradually adapt their practice. It is suggested here that conscious attention can help trainees in maintaining a strong sense of identity in their work despite significant contextual pressure to compromise their practice.

Being able to avoid complete immersion in the day to day mechanics of teaching is important in coping with the emotional labour of becoming a teacher. When supported trainees are able to consciously attend to their surroundings. Staying in touch, or connected, with one’s surroundings has been reported as vital in retaining a sense of achievement, achieving our goals and being able to avoid becoming fatigued by the emotional demands of the role (Todaro-Franceschi, 2013). Learning to become a teacher has a heavy emotional load. Some trainees have the opportunity and ability to consciously attend, a process which is considered to be important in coping with the impacts of the accumulation of emotional labour. Staying true to one’s identity, being authentic and adopting processes to withstand, or at least understand the threat of contextual pressure, may hold keys to addressing some of the debilitating emotions of learning to become a teacher.

This section has;

- Depicted that some of the trainees became ground down by being immersed in the daily activities expected of a teacher.

- Shown that some of the trainees were conscious of how teaching had impacted on those around them. They could project forward to consider consequences to their own future.

- Made early links to the value of conscious attention in attempting to avoid some of the harmful impacts of the emotional labour of becoming a teacher.
6.4 Summary of findings – ‘The accumulation and mitigation of the emotions of learning to become a teacher’

This section summarises the explanatory theory that has been inductively built throughout chapters 5 and 6. Figure 1 presents a model that depicts six stages that trainees go through as they accumulate and cope with the emotions and emotional labour of learning to become a teacher.

- **Pre-experience**
  - Three features of trainee biographies contributed to trainee teachers’ identities and aspirations they held for practice; 1) valuing PE as a contributor to personal development; 2) willingness to empathise with pupils who need their support; 3) their desire to follow parents in assisting the welfare of children.
  - Trainee aspirations were almost exclusively child-centred.

- **Experience**
  - Trainees felt pressure to act in accordance with three levels of expectations; macro, meso and micro.
  - Expectations differed according to negotiability.

- **Contradiction**
  - Trainees often felt conflict between how they wanted to act and how they were required to act, this is called contradiction.
  - How they experienced contradiction was influenced by their perceptions of opportunity to act on their own volition and capacity to cope.

- **Emotional labour**
  - Contradictions elicited emotional responses in trainees.
  - Trainees engaged in emotional labour when trying to manage their emotions.
  - Most common strategies used by trainees in managing their emotions were surface acting and deep acting.

- **Interpretation**
  - Emotions encountered had adaptive or maladaptive impacts on learning to become a teacher.
  - How trainees interpreted their emotional labour was dependent on two factors; intrinsic reward for fulfilling aspirations, and whether it was perceived as aiding progression towards becoming a teacher.

- **Coping**
  - Coping with negative impacts of emotional labour was dependent upon having time, opportunity and support to attend to their emotions and actions. This is the basis of conscious attention.
  - Conscious attention to threats and challenges to trainee teacher identity may mitigate debilitating emotions.

Figure 1: The accumulation and mitigation of the emotions of learning to become a teacher.
What follows is a brief summary of each of the phases outlined in figure 1.

1. Pre-experience
Prior to their final professional semester trainees accrued experiences which guided their practice intentions. Three factors stood out as shaping how trainees intended to act; their prior knowledge of PE as a tool for health promotion, their willingness to empathise with the difficulties that obese and sedentary children face and the modelling of their parents who have taken active roles in supporting the welfare of children. These three factors underpinned the child-centred aspirations of how they wanted to practice. Aspiring to be child-centred is considered here to be a significant part of the trainee teachers’ identity as they approached their final professional semester.

2. Experience
As their 17 week school experience unfolded the trainees were exposed to many of the realities of teaching practice. The local and national contexts made demands of trainees that inhibited them from practicing according to their aspirations. They were required to contend with three levels of contextual expectations. Macro and meso-level expectations were largely non-negotiable and placed heavy influence upon how trainees practiced. Some micro-level expectations were negotiable giving trainees some freedom to plan and carry out their own interventions to address problems they faced. The emotions invested in following child-centred aspirations that prioritise the welfare of children were part of the pleasurable emotional work of trainee teachers.

3. Contradiction
Different school contexts exerted differing levels of control over trainees but all trainees encountered circumstances which threatened to undermine their aspirations. Trainees regularly experienced a contradiction between their aspirations for their practice and the expectations of the context. This often created conflict in the minds of trainees and generated an emotional load. Contradiction between aspirations and expectations was the catalyst for what followed and became the central organising dimension of the theory presented.
How trainees experienced the contradictions they faced depended upon two factors. Firstly, the opportunity they perceived they are given to construct their own responses to problems, and secondly, their perceived capacity to cope with situations as they arose.

4. Emotional labour
Contradictions regularly elicited emotional responses from trainees. In attempting to manage their emotions trainee teachers carried out emotional labour. Trainees were sensitive to the ‘feeling rules’ of teaching and as a result used surface acting and deep acting to cover up their true emotions. In order to fit into their environments trainees often undermined the view they held of themselves, their teacher identity. This involved being inauthentic, faking emotions or concealing one’s true identity. These processes have been previously reported as having debilitating impacts on teachers (Ogbonna & Harris, 2004; Goldberg & Grandey, 2007; Clemente, 1999) and will be further considered in chapter 7.

5. Interpretation
How trainees interpreted their emotional labour was dependent upon two factors. Firstly, trainees perceived their emotional labour as adaptive if they felt intrinsic reward from being able to fulfil their child-centred aspirations for their practice. They also saw their emotional labour as adaptive if they felt it had value in helping them to appreciate the realities of being a teacher. Opposing interpretations were also apparent. Trainees would often see their emotional labour as maladaptive if they were not able to remain true to their child-centred aspirations or if they saw no value in the emotional work they undertook.

6. Coping
Maladaptive impacts of emotional labour resulted when trainees were required to be inauthentic in their work and to undermine the identity of themselves as teachers.
Trainees could become immersed in the day to day mechanics of teaching practice with little awareness and can become ‘unreflexive prisoners’ (Usher, 2009) in their work. When trainees were able to lift their head to survey the environment around them and then interrogate how it was impacting upon them they appeared more adept at coping with their emotional load. The assertion made here is that this interrogation requires more than a superficial reflection on pedagogy or teaching practice but also an internal audit of the impacts of external demands on the trainee and attention to broader factors that extend beyond the classroom. It is a significant finding of this study that the trainees all encountered emotional labour in their work. In some circumstances this proved to be debilitating and threatened their progression towards becoming a teacher. Where trainees were able to consciously attend to their role within their context and stay attuned to their evolving teacher identity, emotional labour was successfully managed and less damaging.

The following chapter will further discuss some of the central findings of this study in relation to the research questions using existing literature in teaching and teacher education.
Chapter 7

Discussion

This chapter presents the study’s main findings in relation to existing literature and understanding of the accumulation and mitigation of emotional labour in trainee teachers. More specifically this chapter:

- Revisits the central aim of the study and the research questions raised at the end of chapter 2.
- Critiques significant elements of the explanatory theory presented at the end of chapter 6 in relation to existing literature in the field.
- Examines the contribution of this study to existing professional knowledge in the training of physical education teachers.
- Critically discusses implications of the theory presented to teacher education processes and to future research.
- Critiques the transferability and limitations of the study along with reflective comments.
- Offers a conclusion to the thesis.

7.1 Findings in relation to the research questions

The central aim of this study was to build an explanatory theory of the emotional demands of learning to become a teacher. The findings presented in chapters 5 and 6 have addressed the research questions of the study in the following way;

- What factors contribute to the emotional load on trainee PE teachers?

Some of the emotional load experienced by trainee teachers was anticipated and welcomed as part of the ‘demanding but pleasurable emotional work required by teachers’ (Carlyle & Woods, 2002: 62). Contributory factors to this emotional load were in-keeping with trying to fulfil their pupil-centred aspirations for their work such as safeguarding the emotional and physical well-being of children (Brennan, 2006; Hargreaves, 2000), or by showing warmth and compassion to children in need (Beatty,
This emotional load was willingly accepted by trainees and fitted with their identity of the role of the teacher.

Perhaps more significantly, this study has highlighted the impact when there is contradiction between trainees’ personal aspirations and expectations of their placement and how this leads to the emotional load felt by trainee PE teachers. Contradiction between aspirations and expectations resulted in a wide range of emotions in the trainee teachers as they confronted the challenges associated to obesity and sedentary behaviour. This phenomenon has been previously described as a two-way struggle of how trainees want to be and the socializing influences of the school (Huberman, 1995). This study found several factors to be influenced by this contradiction and resonated with some of the previous research in the field. These factors included a perceived lack of control over their work (Perryman et al, 2011), perceived inability to cope with the demands of their work (Burke & Greenglass, 1995; Kyriacou, 2001), failing to maintain their child centred intentions (Lortie, 2002; Day et al, 2007) and a general inability to fulfil personal goals in their teaching practice (Grandey, 2003).

- Do threats and challenges to identity impact on the emotional demands on trainee PE teachers?

When trainee teachers are required to act in accordance to their environment and undermine their emerging teacher identity they are engaging in emotional labour in their role. Of greatest prevalence in this study was the requirement for trainees to act out what they felt were expected emotions in public, to fake in front of an audience and to show inauthenticity in their feelings about what was happening around them.

The constant interaction between the trainee and the expectations placed on them exerted pressure on the identity they held\(^48\), congruent with research by Reynolds (1996). The present study also found that emotional demands were greatest when trainees felt that they had little voice in how their identity was being threatened. The most significant cause of emotional labour in this study was found to be when trainee

\(^{48}\) For example quotations and analytical comment on p.120-121.
teachers felt that they needed to conform to practice which was not in keeping with their identity or the view of the teacher they wanted to be.\footnote{For example quotations and analytical comments on p. 133-135}

- How does emotional load impact on trainee PE teachers?

The emotional labour carried out by trainee teachers was found to have either adaptive (for example increased confidence, heightened awareness of being a teacher) or maladaptive impacts (such as thoughts of withdrawal, disillusionment with teaching) on trainee teachers. How trainees experienced their emotional labour was dependant on two factors. Firstly, if trainees felt that their emotional labour was contributing to their learning and helping them to complete their ITT the impacts were positive. Trainees who felt that their emotional labour inhibited their progression towards becoming a teacher encountered negative impacts. The second factor was found to be linked to the rewards trainees felt for their emotional labour. Those who felt intrinsically rewarded by the bonds forged with children or the impact they were having on young lives were less susceptible to maladaptive impacts of their emotional labour. This dichotomy corresponds with previous work with qualified teachers which suggests that teachers’ emotional labour is either liberating or alienating depending on whether personal goals are achieved (Isenbarger & Zembylas, 2006).

- How can trainees be helped to cope with the emotional demands of becoming a teacher?

It was found that trainees who were able to keep their ‘head up’ while carrying out their day to day activities were better equipped to cope with the emotional demands of their role. Being able to avoid becoming immersed in their day to day lives and instead being consciously attentive to how they are changing within their role had a significant part to play in coping with the emotional labour experienced by trainees\footnote{For example quotations and analytical comments on p. 140-143}. The provision of opportunities to raise conscious attention is considered here as important in helping trainees cope with emotional demands of their role.
How can ITT evolve to better prepare trainees for the emotional demands of becoming a teacher?

The findings discussed above present processes that help trainees to prepare for the emotional demands of becoming a teacher. Helping trainees cope with emotional labour is a significant professional implication to this study and is further explored in section 7.3.

The following sections, 7.2, 7.3 and 7.4, extend this overview of the research questions of the study. Literature has been incorporated into chapters 5 and 6 to compare and clarify the emerging theory. By using literature in this way it has meant that some of the broader areas of discussion against existing literature have been permeated into the findings. What follows is a distillation of the major points of discussion concerning teacher education and implications for the future.

7.2 The study findings in relation to existing literature

Carrying out this research with a population of trainee PE teachers provides part of the distinctive element of this study. The majority of existing literature that is discussed in this section has been conducted with teachers at different stages of their career such as during early career, 3-5 years or over 10 years in the classroom. Other predominant areas of focus for previous research have been with particular groups of teachers such as reception teachers, childcare educators or within specific subject areas. All available literature across areas of education has been used to discuss two central findings of this thesis. Firstly, that emotional labour is an inherent part of learning to become a teacher and, secondly, that emotional labour can be mitigated by providing opportunities for trainees to develop their skills of conscious attention.

7.2.1 Emotional labour is an inherent part of learning to become a PE teacher

Previous literature has emphasised the place of emotional labour in the lives of qualified teachers (Hargreaves, 1999; Carlyle & Woods, 2002; Naring, Breit & Brouwers, 2006; Noor & Zainuddin, 2011; Jakhelin, 2011; Isenbarger & Zembylas, 2006) but there are
no known studies which consider its onset, impact or management in initial teacher training. This study has used Hochschild’s (1983) theory of emotional labour as a conceptual lever to help understand the emotionality of learning to become a teacher.\footnote{For an overview of emotional labour processes grounded in the present theory go to p.128-135.}

Whilst applied here to help capture an explanation for trainee teacher emotionality, emotional labour has been extensively critiqued. Firstly, emotional labour has been described as unjustifiably ‘absolutist’ in assuming that the commodification of emotions is negative and alienating for workers (Bolton, 2005; Korczynski, 2002). In contrast to this position labour processes have also been found to be ‘double-edged’ in being ‘subjectively satisfying as well as distressing’ (Brook, 2009a: 532). Brook’s position is supported in the present study as how trainees experience emotional labour is considered dependent on the recompense received for their labour. It has previously been shown that the accumulation of emotional labour through undermining of personal values can be balanced against rewards and feelings of accomplishment (Isenbarger & Zembylas, 2006). Emotional work of trainee teachers can come at a cost but is dependent upon the rewards felt for emotions invested. When feeling a sense of reward for emotional labour in the form of praise from others, or by successfully addressing the activity level of an obese child, trainees do not see their emotional labour as debilitating. Under these circumstances trainees view their emotional labour as satisfying and worthwhile. On the other hand are scenarios where trainees have not felt sufficient reward and tend to view their emotional labour as negative and unfulfilling.

A second critique of emotional labour concerns the claim that it renders workers as ‘crippled actors’ in the workplace (Bolton & Boyd, 2003; Lewis, 2005). It is claimed that Hochschild over estimates the degree of managerial ownership and control over employee emotions (Theodosius, 2006; McClure & Murphy, 2007) and that only a small proportion of employee emotions are under the ‘sway of large organizations’ (Bolton, 2005: 48.) Bolton’s work resides predominantly in the public sector and implies that employees are able to exercise their autonomy over how and where they display their emotions. Bolton (2005: 102) also considers that public sector workers are able to exploit these ‘unmanaged spaces’ by showing ‘moments of truth’ in their work. Data presented in the present study partially accepts this critique offered by Bolton.
(2005) in that trainee teachers most often felt compelled to surface act in their day to day role but also revealed occasions where they could demonstrate authentic emotional displays, particularly in their contact with pupils.

However, by feeling compelled to conceal their true identity to others, trainees unwittingly contributed to their own emotional labour. This process has been previously labelled as the inauthenticity of self (Hochschild, 1983; Theodosius, 2008) and has been considered as one of the traditions of adult learning in the professions (Boud, 1989; Usher, Bryant & Johnston, 1997). Such concealing of the true self, or faking, has been previously considered in the lives of early career teachers as contributing to emotional exhaustion (Ogbonna & Harris, 2004). A strong link has also been reported in previous work between accumulation of emotional labour and the development of emotional exhaustion (Goldberg & Grandey, 2007; Kruml & Geddes, 2000; Brotheridge & Grandey, 2002).

It is well documented that trainees and new entrants to teaching are regularly expected to act in ways that conflict with their own view of the profession (Wilkins, 2011; Reeves, 2009). The prospect of continually undermining their own values for little reward creates emotional costs which are not deemed worthwhile and can result in thoughts of withdrawal from teaching. Such outcomes of a mismatch between emotional efforts and rewards yielded in the lives of experienced teachers have been well reported (Burke & Greenglass, 1995; Byrne, 1991; Kyriacou, 2001; Travers & Cooper, 1996) during what Jakellen (2011) referred to as the 2nd generation of research into teaching and emotions. Considering this in the lives of PE trainees is a new contribution to the field.

The longer term implications of the early onset of emotional demand as teachers embark on their careers require consideration. Teaching is widely regarded as a high stress occupation (Johnson, Cooper, Cartwright, Donald, Taylor & Millet, 2005) a direct result is that it has one of the highest rates of burnout of all of the professions (Brouwers & Tomic, 2000; Jones, Huxtable, Hodgson & Price, 2003; Kyriacou, 2001; Carlyle & Woods, 2004). Discussion on burnout in teaching has been the subject of a great deal of research from the earliest warnings within the profession (McGuire, 1979) to current concerns over continued attrition rates (Kinman, Wray & Strange, 2011).
The accumulation of emotion has been considered to contribute to burnout symptoms in early career teachers (Carlyle & Woods, 2004; Grayson & Alvarez, 2007). Teachers are known to be most susceptible to burnout in the first three years of their career (Tait, 2008; Yoo, 2011; Beltman, Mansfield & Price, 2011). More recent research has provided evidence of further increases in early career burnout and attrition as new entrants to the profession struggle to come to terms with the realities of teaching (Jones & Youngs, 2012). Different views have been expressed on the causes of early career burnout. Most recently, and a highly relevant implication to the present study, this phenomenon has been attributed to the accumulation of excessive challenging situations in the day-to-day working lives of teachers (Voltmer, Spahn, Schaarsmidt & Kieschke, 2011). The concept of this process beginning in the training phase of teachers has not previously been reported.

The subject of teacher burnout has attracted substantial academic interest since the conceptualisation of the term by Maslach & Jackson (1981) who proposed three components of; depersonalisation, emotional exhaustion and reduced performance accomplishments. This view of teacher burnout has been consistently validated through research across varied contexts and populations (Durr, Chang & Carson, 2014). More recent research has revealed individual components of burnout in specific groups of teachers, as is the case in the present study which aligns widely accepted components of burnout to the emotional labour experienced by trainee teachers during their final professional semester. This suggests that the seeds of burnout are sown during the teacher training phase. This finding has been tentatively proposed in previous literature (Fives, Hamman & Olivarez, 2007) but there has been little research that has tried to verify this claim.

Whilst it should be asserted here that no claim is made in the present theory that trainees are suffering burnout, continued accumulation of emotional labour, as has been evidenced in this study, is known to contribute to emotional exhaustion over time. It is plausible to suggest that this accumulation, beginning in ITT, may be a contributor to

---

52 Maslach & Leiter (1999: 295) described the 3 components of teacher burnout as ‘Emotional exhaustion refers to feelings of being emotionally overextended and depleted of one’s resources, depersonalization refers to a negative, callous or excessively detached response to other people (often the recipient of one’s service or care); and reduced performance accomplishment refers to a decline in feelings of competence and successful achievement in one’s work.’
the high levels of burnout and drop out in early career teachers. It is also plausible that this is the point at which some teachers learn to manage emotions intuitively. Implications of this to ITT and to future research are discussed in section 7.3.

7.2.2 Impacts of emotional labour can be mitigated by providing opportunities for trainees to develop their skills of conscious attention

For some trainees the interview process for this study provided the medium through which they could articulate some of their thoughts and experiences concerning their practice, emphasising how such opportunities may be limited for some trainee teachers to articulate key features of their professional development.53

Providing trainees with the opportunity to practice being attentive to shifts in their role and their emotions is considered here as a means through which the damaging accumulation of emotional labour can be mitigated. Usher (2009) has highlighted the importance of workers in the professions avoiding becoming ‘unreflexive prisoners’ in their work by openly engaging in discussion in a protected, professional space. Dewey (cited in Moon, 1999) supports this notion by what he calls ‘elevated consciousness’ where important information is brought forward and made explicit to prevent vital experiences being buried, losing their learning potential and even creating debilitating effects on the learner later down the line.

This concept has a central place in this study and to the wider teaching profession as emotions are routinely buried as opposed to openly addressed. As previously discussed this can lead to debilitating impacts. The term conscious attention has been devised here as a term to underpin a process that enables an audit of one’s practice as well as an audit of oneself within practice. The term has been drawn together from an overview of definitions of consciousness and attention from the fields of cognition, psychology and neuroscience. To be conscious is to be aware of ‘global indicators capable of elaborate information in order to give a survey of what is going on inside and outside the body’ and attention is taken as ‘the capacity to shift and appreciate the sensory relevance or salience’ of this information (Cavanna & Nani, 2008: 3). The emphasis on inside and

53 See quote and analytical comment on page 143.
outside of the body in these definitions provides the basis for conscious attention used in the present study to depict a way in which trainee teachers may be able to evaluate overt teaching practice as well as staying attuned to how their practice is impacting on their thoughts and emotions.

It is important to state that conscious attention presented here should be distinguished from the ambiguous and contentious concept of reflective practice in teacher education (Beauchamp, 2006; Collin, Karsenti & Komis, 2013). Overuse of the term has resulted in a lack of clarity and misinterpretation. Fendler (2003) summarises diversity in conceptions of reflective practice in teacher training and raises the point that this has contributed to confusion in research and in practice. The present study acknowledges the difficulties in pinning down a suitable conceptual understanding of reflection. This study is also acutely aware of the traditional, restricted view of what constitutes reflective practice in teacher education. Most common applications are based around Schon’s (1983) depictions of ‘reflection-on-action’ and ‘reflection-in-action’ and are limited to thoughts on the technicalities of teaching methods. In an extensive review of reflective practice in teacher education Desjardins (2000: 37) concluded that ‘reflection can bear exclusively on the practice, [for example] teaching strategies’. In relation to the present study such traditional conceptions of reflection are incapable of supporting trainees in managing their emotional labour.

A further critical point of distinction between conscious attention and traditional conceptions of reflection in teaching is the apparent absence of the place of emotions in definitions, practices and models of reflective practice (Moon, 1999; Beauchamp, 2006). Conscious attention, as defined and depicted in the present study, is a more holistic concept building awareness of factors inside and outside of the teacher, which includes being attentive to shifts in emotions. By contrast, reflection is considered as an overview of performance within a given context or situation, such as within the classroom, whereas conscious attention requires deeper consideration of wider aspects of the self, including shifts in emotions and identity.

The management of emotional labour in teaching has long been considered a matter of ‘personal disposition, moral commitment and private virtue’ (Hargreaves, 2000: 813). The extent to which interventions for building capacity to cope with emotions have been
constructed in teaching and teacher education are still open to question (Kinman, Wray & Strange, 2011) as new entrants to the profession still have few avenues in which they can confide on emotional issues (Jakhelln, 2009) and have had little experience in articulating their emotions in a safe, protected space.

Various ways of embedding opportunities to raise conscious attention to emotional demands of their role and to stay attuned to their emotional labour in a safe and protected environment have been previously considered, but without significant research support to add to their value or efficacy within a trainee population. Examples include Clutterbuck’s (1998) personal and dyadic reflective space where teachers are encouraged to discuss their emotional experiences with one another. Similar principles are proposed by Brookfield’s (1995) creation of a supportive emotional environment where authentic and open discourse can occur.

More recently (Zembylas, 2011) the importance of creating time and space for qualified teachers to carry out critical emotional reflection has attracted more attention in published work. Work by Chubbuck & Zembylas (2008) has considered the need for dialogue around emotions in teaching to help teachers resist unjust expectations and to understand how emotions can guide and influence their practice. Other studies, such as Rodger & Scott (2008) and Rots, Kelchtermans & Aelterman (2012), support the present study in raising the need for trainee teachers to be given the opportunity for ‘sense-making’ discussions where they can challenge, critique and monitor their emotions and threats to their sense of self. Recent work by Cross & Hong (2012) used case studies of two qualified teachers which required them to articulate their emotions and feelings of exhaustion. The research process became a significant opportunity for them to surface emotions that had become buried in day to day roles, to discuss them openly and to refocus their thoughts in ways that kept them committed to quality teaching. During this process the two teachers became reminded of their strong beliefs around quality educational experiences for children and reaffirmed their professional identities. Cross & Hong’s (2012) research appears to support the strength of open discourse on emotions in supporting teachers in managing emotions in their work. The present study extends this claim to include such opportunities for trainee teachers.
The airing of personal values with supporting staff and the monitoring of emotions could allow trainees to share their emotional labour and have their needs better supported. However, the difficulty that teachers have in discussing true emotions has been reported elsewhere (Beatty, 2000; Hargreaves, 2000; Cross & Hong, 2012) all of whom have cited well founded reasons why teachers may not be willing to engage in an open process of critical discussion on emotions. Such a process is problematic in the current context of ITT and has been the subject of recent research by Hobson, Ashby, Malderez & Tomlinson (2009) and Hobson & Malderez (2013) who coined the term ‘judgementoring’. This term depicts the contradictory position of school-based mentors in having the responsibility to develop and nurture as well as evaluate and assess their mentees. Further research reported that trainee and newly qualified teachers attempted to hide perceived weaknesses from significant others for fear of receiving unfavourable appraisals, being branded inadequate or perceived as failing in their role (Hobson & McIntyre, 2013). In addition, Bolton (2010) has previously suggested that such open discourse on emotions may be perceived as damaging to future prospects while Rowland (2000) considers that some teachers could even end up feeling that their position is untenable. Feeling inhibited from discussing emotive issues including dissonance between personal and institutional values has been found to have particular resonance in the present study. This contention requires any recommendation for future practice to protect the security and confidentiality of any interventions which set out to support trainees in making their emotions explicit. To achieve this may even include significant changes to mentoring of trainee teachers.

The prospect of raising attention to emotions in trainee teachers has attracted far less research. Studies that have been carried out in this area concur with the present study that teacher training should evolve to include greater discussion of the emotional dimensions of teaching (Kinman, Wray & Strange, 2011). Further studies have argued for the inclusion of formalised programmes of emotional intelligence or resilience.

---

54 Judgementoring ‘a one to one relationship between a relatively inexperienced teacher and a relatively experienced one in which the latter, in revealing too readily and/or too often her/ his judgements on or evaluations of the mentee’s planning and teaching, compromises the mentoring relationship and its potential benefits.’ (Hobson & Malderez, 2013: 90)

55 Hobson & McIntyre (2013) used the term ‘significant other’ based on Sullivan (1953) to refer to people of perceived importance and influence. In this case the significant other in the perception of the trainee is his/her mentor.
training in teacher education to help trainees to cope and articulate their emotions (Giardini & Frese, 2006; Kinman & Grant, 2011; Brackett, Palomera, Mojsa-Kaja, Reyes & Salovey, 2010; Concoran & Tormey, 2012). Most recently studies have emerged focusing on the value of mindfulness training in addressing teacher stress and ultimately reducing burnout (Abenavoli, Jennings, Greenberg, Harris & Katz, 2013; Roeser et al, 2013). Whilst these papers offer informative insights into skills that student and early career teachers may require, such recommendations rarely consider the social, institutional and labour processes that impact on teacher emotions (Concoran & Tormey, 2012) or the difficulties trainees may have in openly expressing emotions. These papers also fail to acknowledge how policy and practice needs to shift to overcome these problems.

Approaches for providing time and space for teacher conscious attention discussed to this point have all advocated strategies of explicit discussion in controlled settings. Respectful of the limitations of discussing emotions explicitly are interventions which remain private but are still allocated protected time and space. Strategies such as metaphor analysis (Mahlios, Messengill-Shaw & Barry, 2010; Bullough & Gitlin, 2001), ‘narratives of action’ (Goodson, 1992; Keltchermans, 2009) and reflective logs (Carrington & Selva, 2010) have all been suggested as ways of raising awareness of the evolving self and expressing emotions in teaching, but little research evidence has been accrued to support their efficacy.

Whilst there has been a significant escalation of the understanding of the importance of emotions in teaching in the last 20 years (Jakhelin, 2011; Zembylas, 2005) there have been no discernible policy shifts towards any such strategies of emotional management or readying of trainees for the emotional struggle that is inherent to teaching (Jakhelin, 2011). The following section raises some implications of the present study and considers some of the gaps in teacher education.
7.3 Implications to PE teacher training and future research

7.3.1 Implications to PE initial teacher training

Permeating interventions to raise attention to the accumulation of debilitating emotional labour in trainee practice would be a marked change in teaching and teacher education where the dominant discourses are focus on the subject, pedagogy and the context as opposed to the self-knowledge advocated in this study. Teacher education has been increasingly centrally controlled since the inception of the first set of teacher competencies in 1992. Whilst subsequent iterations have varied in nomenclature and in wording, the substantive concept areas underpinning the teacher standards have not significantly evolved from a predominant focus on technical demands such as pedagogic knowledge, subject knowledge and contextual knowledge (Shulman, 1987; Leach & Moon 2000; Korthagen, Loughran & Russell 2006). This is also the case in Physical Education ITT (Hayes, Capel, Katene & Cook 2006)\(^{56}\).

The conception and evolution of competence-based teacher education in the UK has been the subject of significant debate. Initially viewed as mechanisms to ‘modernise’ teachers into a ‘new era of professionalism’ (Evans, 2011: 852), competency-based education has been the focus of significant criticism. Competencies have been labelled as being; symptoms of a climate of uniformity and compliance (Delandhsere & Petrosky, 2004), reductionist and limiting (Wetz, 2010), paperwork dominated (Jackson & Serf, 2008) as well as impossible to measure or assess (Yahuna & Watson, 2011). In response to proposals for the third set of teacher standards (DfES/TTA, 2002), Day (2002) voiced concerns over the threat to teacher autonomy and teachers’ ability to exercise professional judgement which could impact on their values and identity. This final point has particular resonance with the theory presented in this study as trainees perceive the need to conceal or undermine their values in order to comply with broader organisational expectations.

Trainee and early career teachers are under increasing pressure in their work, and it is questioned here whether teacher preparation has kept pace with the demands of the role and whether trainees are adequately prepared for the realities they will face. Becoming a

---

\(^{56}\) An overview of successive versions ITT PE competencies is shown in table 4, p. 31.
teacher is more than a binary assessment of achievement against a series of competencies. It should be acknowledged that there is a marked difference between achieving a base threshold of competence to ensure public safety and being considered a competent practitioner. Parallels can be made with other professions, such as nursing, where competence-based education is hotly debated. Pijl-Zeiber, Barton, Konkin, Awosoga, & Caine (2014) assert that a distinction must be drawn between possession of a set of general qualities and their mastery in the practice setting. Indeed, trainee nurses may accrue sufficient evidence to pass their competencies and yet may not possess fundamental practical skills (Butler et al, 2011). The same can be said for becoming a teacher as practice often falls between explicit competencies as it demands a level of ‘know-how’ or artistry to be effective in complex and dynamic school settings. The use of competence-based education in the professions may also be considered a vehicle through which governments can manifest their vision of what constitutes professionalism (Evans, 2011: 855), thus narrowing the concept down to a single meaning, akin to a ‘service level agreement imposed from above’. The present study acknowledges the alternative view of Gewirtz, Mahoney, Hextall & Cribb (2009: 3) who advocate the need for ‘plural conceptions of professionalism’ which can be socially constructed, dynamic and encompass commonly accepted features of practice from within the profession. Trainees in the present study all successfully achieved the competencies against which they were measured (DCFS, 2007), however, the theory presented here suggests that some important features of becoming a competent teacher are left to chance despite consistent reminders of the centrality of coping with emotions in the lives of teachers.

The enduring problem of teacher retention, added to the finding that trainee teachers invest significant emotions and carry out emotional labour in their learning, requires teacher education programmes to consider managing the emotional needs of trainees. Predominant emphasis of curriculum time spent on explicit knowledge bases concerning subject knowledge, pedagogic principles and the school context may be drawing much needed attention away from trainee teachers addressing the crucial personal and emotional issues relating to their work and allowing them to attend to contributors of emotional labour. The present study has presented that emotional labour, due in part to threats to teacher identity, is a significant factor in learning to become a
teacher. Coming to terms with the emotional demands of becoming a teacher is still absent in policy discourse on teacher education (Ballet & Keltchermans, 2008; Rots et al, 2012), in favour of competence-led criteria for qualifying to teach. Whilst this has previously been discussed in literature there is still little evidence of concrete action to support trainees’ needs in most recent ITT programmes or curricular.

Whilst the technical demands of becoming a teacher form the predominant basis of ITT it is suggested here that over time these become far less important than the emotional labour accumulated by trainees. Providing formal attention to the non-technical aspects of becoming a teacher, such as managing emotions and the impacts of emotional labour, should be considered essential parts of the skills required to enter the teaching profession.

It is not desirable or realistic to try to alleviate emotionality from professions such as teaching. Emotions are an inherent part of teaching. The presence of emotive situations due to contradictions in ITT should be viewed as necessary processes in learning to become a teacher, they are often viewed as sound preparation for the professions and can act as a trigger to further learning (Jarvis 1991, 2009; Mezirow, 1991; Dewey, 1933; Petty, Scholes & Ellis, 2011). However, this may only happen if trainees are given suitable supervision to turn contradictory experiences into learning opportunities. Secondly, if not adequately supported within ITT programmes, these experiences may contribute to debilitating emotions and thoughts of withdrawal.

It is proposed here that constructing opportunities for trainees to experience the full rigors of teaching, at least towards the end of their final professional semester, should be embedded within ITT curricular. Alongside this is the need for an increased emphasis on the affordance of time and support to engage in meaningful consideration of threats and shifts in beliefs and to monitor trainees’ accumulation of emotional labour.

The recommendation for more time and space for reflective practice has been proposed before for training in the professions (Schon, 1991; Heller, 1988; Thompson & Thompson, 2008) with a view to improve teachers’ ability to review and improve upon their work. In addition, Moon (1999) identified controlled practice settings such as the
final professional semester in teacher education as the perfect vehicle to practice ‘in the moment’ interventions for enhancing practice. Any such time and space should be mindful of the need to afford opportunities for trainees to engage in conscious attention as opposed to the limited capability of reflection discussed earlier\(^57\). Such time is often afforded as part of the school-based mentoring process during the 17 week placement in the form of mentor meetings and ad hoc support, but it is questionable whether any time is allocated to supporting the emotional needs of trainees instead of merely a reflection on the achievement of technical teaching processes or ITT competencies.

A clearer appreciation of the role of the mentor along with mentor skills that go beyond supporting the technical requirements of teaching practice are suggested practical implications for managing emotions and emotional labour emanating out of this study. Far from supporting trainees, some research suggests that mentors have had detrimental impacts on trainee competence and well-being (Richter, Kunter, Ludkte, Klusmann, Anders & Baumert, 2013). The role of mentoring has come under recent scrutiny and has been criticised for failing to achieve its full potential (Fletcher, 2012). Recent claims by Hobson & Malderez (2013) suggest that pitfalls of the current system of mentoring in schools may arise from the statutory guidance provided by the Department of Education (2012: 14), which states that

> The head teacher/principal must identify a person to act as the NQT’s induction tutor, to provide day to day monitoring and support, and co-ordination of assessment.

This dual role, supporting and assessing, has led some authors to request a re-examination of school-based mentoring (Ambrosetti, Knight & Dekkers, 2014) and the removal of assessment of trainees and NQTs from the roles expected of the mentor (Hobson & McIntyre, 2013: 12). The same authors contend that schools should make;

> concerted efforts to facilitate and encourage the creation of a climate within which [trainee] teachers are more willing and able to make themselves vulnerable, a climate within which they feel both that they are trusted by and are able to trust their colleagues, mentors, line managers and leaders.

\(^57\) See p. 160 for further discussion on distinctions between reflection and conscious attention
Creating opportunities for trainees to openly discuss difficulties that they are experiencing is a key recommendation of the present study. It would appear that this may not be as simple as providing a forum where such a dialogue can take place. Challenges also appear to reside in a reconsideration of how trainees receive the support they need. The present study concurs that there appear to be limitations in the current guidance on mentoring in schools and that adaptations are required. One suggestion is the concept of external mentoring which has yielded positive research outcomes with teachers in some contexts such as special education needs (Dempsey & Christenson-Foggett, 2011) and physics (Hobson, McIntyre, Ashby, Hayward, Stevens & Malderez, 2012). The use of external mentors to assess or support the trainee could provide a more secure basis for discourse on emotions.

A second consideration that has also come under recent scrutiny is the training that mentors receive. Given the growing centrality of mentoring in ITT it is suggested here and supported by others (Hobson & Malderez, 2013; Richter et al, 2013) that more formal training leading to accreditation of mentors would be a positive step in addressing the current limitations. Mentoring trainee and newly qualified teachers is widely considered to have evolved in its significance in school settings. However, the role is still not recognised with sufficient status or importance (Hobson & Malderez, 2013). This study has highlighted the need for trainees to learn to manage, and to be assisted in managing, their emotional labour. Enhancing the awareness that mentors have of contributors to trainee emotional labour would be a first step. Equipping them with skills to be able to support trainees in being conscious and conversant of their emotions would require further training beyond helping trainees achieve the existing competence-based curriculum.

It should be noted that this thesis was based on research into one traditional partnership model of teacher training where trainees experience a balance of school-based and university-based support. More recent policy in teacher training has seen a diversification of pathways into teaching, such as the School Direct model or Troops to Teaching. Whilst this thesis cannot make strong claims as to the applicability of the

---

58 Mentoring carried out by ‘experienced teachers who are not based in the same schools as the teachers they are supporting’ (Hobson & McIntyre, 2013: 345).
findings to alternative modes of teacher training, it is reasonable to suggest that the findings could have implications to trainees and mentors regardless of their pathway to becoming a teacher. The place of emotional labour in alternative approaches to teacher training and the development of conscious attention as a means to mitigate negative impacts may have similar implications to the trainees involved in this study. The findings may even have greater relevance given the increased emphasis on school-based training in alternative pathways into teaching.

7.3.2 Implications for future research

The present study was carried out in one PE teacher training institution so only tentative generalisations to other contexts can be made. Creating further cases by testing the present theory within other institutions and other pathways to becoming a teacher could be carried out to further strengthen the theory.

Much has been made here of the need to increase opportunities for trainees and teachers to enhance their skills of managing their emotional labour, however there is little known about the precise interventions which could effectively mitigate the negative effects of emotional labour in trainee teachers. Research into specific interventions to support teachers in this way appears logical and much required. Interventions such as conflict management or stress management workshops, relaxation techniques, mindfulness training, formalised programmes of emotional intelligence, resilience training, along with the more private interventions raised in section 7.2.2 have attracted support from academics and practitioners. However, little work has attempted to evaluate these interventions within ITT or develop an understanding of specific pedagogies to mitigate emotional labour in trainee teachers. These issues are given limited coverage in current research. More evidence is needed to form a basis for better informed decisions about how to incorporate strategies to manage accumulation of emotional labour within the context of ITT.

A starting point for this research may be to establish a picture of the different models of emotional support currently provided to trainees. It is apparent from the QTT Standards that supporting and managing emotions is not a priority for the training of teachers, it
may be assumed that support of this nature is carried out on an ad hoc and reactive basis. Whilst little is known about interventions to support teachers, even less is known about interventions which may currently exist, their prominence and their impact. Finding out what interventions currently exist and evaluating their effectiveness would be a worthwhile process across ITT providers.

A further possible avenue for future research with trainee teachers emerges from the very common finding that trainee values often conflict with those of the school or mentor and yet many mentors are themselves products of the same ITT process. It may be necessary to investigate possible value shifts made by qualified teachers who have survived their ‘painful beginnings’ (Huberman, 1993) in the profession in an attempt to understand more about how they have overcome the challenges of progression to the next phase of the teacher’s life cycle. Do they achieve emotional consonance? Do they suppress their feelings in order to survive? Do they stop caring or do they exist in a state of dissonance about their practice? Further research into the transition from trainee to qualified teacher of 1-3 years of experience could produce further insight into the emotional management made by teachers in their early careers. Such research could be extended to become a longitudinal study of the emotionality of the life cycle of the teacher through accumulating the stories of teachers from differing stages of their careers.

Literature cited earlier in this chapter has aligned the accumulation of emotional labour to feelings of emotional exhaustion and reduced accomplishments, which are two commonly accepted contributors to burnout. Further research is required to investigate a potential link between emotional labour accrued during the training phase and its contribution to these two universally accepted dimensions of burnout. Figure 2 represents a proposed relationship between the emotional labour accrued by the trainee teachers in this study and the potential origins of the onset of burnout later in early career that could be substantiated through further research.
Figure 2; the accumulation of emotions in ITT and a future research direction in linking to burnout.
7.4 Transferability of findings

The present study set out to add to the understanding of the emotional demands of learning to become a teacher when dealing with complex, problematic situations. The study used trainee teachers’ experiences of confronting the challenge of engaging obese and sedentary children into activity to focus the discussion on their management of complex situations in their everyday practice. Using this as a basis, a theory was inductively built from one PE teacher training institution. Processes employed have generated a theory which may be further tested in similar contexts with different students of different biographies, at different times or even studying in different professions. The level of similarity or ‘fit’ with other contexts is a relative consideration and therefore readers can make their own judgements as to the transferable potential of this study. The ‘thick description’ of this case is designed to present ‘full and thorough knowledge of the particular’ (Stake, 1995: 7) and claims are not made that the substantive theory has sufficient explanatory power to automatically generalise to other populations. The study has provided contextual detail, methods and mode of analysis, findings and implications. Readers may consider their own judgements on the transferability of elements of the study.

Knowledge of how emotional labour accumulates in the ITT of trainee PE teachers may have relevance to other contexts. Examples may include applicability to teacher education in other National Curriculum subjects or the applicability to alternative pathways into teaching such as School Direct or Troops to Teaching.

Much of the literature used for critical comparison throughout this study has been drawn from professions other than teaching and teacher education. Generating an explanatory theory from education could be transferred to other professions where understanding the accumulation of emotional labour and its management are considered to be important for practitioners. Of particular relevance may be professions where there is a perceived lack of education on emotions or protected time and space for raising attention to emotions in training or early career professionals.
7.5 Personal reflections, reflexivity and limitations of the study

Throughout this thesis every attempt has been made to ensure the methodological rigour and transparency of the findings (chapters 3, 4, 5 and 6). Part of this process has been to articulate my own position within decisions made during the data collection and analysis through the inclusion of memos, footnotes and signposting of personal values and experience. This section draws together my principle reflections of conducting the study. Emanating out of these is a number of limitations which are embedded within this section along with some of the measures taken to minimise their impact.

7.5.1 Being a neophyte researcher

Aside from very small scale projects as part of a Master of Science degree and during completion of stage 1 of the Professional Doctorate, this was my first experience of qualitative, naturalistic enquiry. Designing the study, meeting ethics committee requirements, recruiting participants and collecting data were all engaged in for the first time and were carried out alongside the gradual building of an understanding of grounded theory methods. I can recall numerous occasions where my decisions were long winded and based on a raw, uninformed view of the inductive nature of the methodological position adopted for the study. On reflection I can see how this naïve starting point may have hindered progress in the early stages of data collection and analysis but slow progress was necessary to fully appreciate the complexity and nuances of carrying out qualitative research. During the early stages of data collection I wrote copious memos without fully understanding their eventual centrality to the future cycles of inductive reasoning, hypothesising and auditing. I assumed the position of documenting my personal dialogues in hand written memos, voice files and detailed notes following supervision meetings as recommended by my supervisors and by much of my reading. As I grew more confident in memo writing it was evident that my notes became more analytical focusing on the data and its theoretical possibilities. I was eventually able to differentiate between memos which were theoretical or analytical and those which were reflective aimed at documenting my own position within the research. Having had limited formal tuition on the processes of qualitative research prior to starting this thesis, I can reflect on the importance of committing a significant amount of
time to learning to build theory from data, immersing myself in writings by key authors in the field and then entering the field as well informed as possible.

In hindsight I am drawn to the words of Schatzman when, as a student of Anselm Strauss, he asked how he carried out his analysis. Strauss replied, ‘Watch me, work with me…..and you will see’ (Bowers & Schatzman, 2009: 87-88). Despite holding insecurities about my understanding in the early stages it was of great value to be provided with rich supervisory support throughout the study, encouragement that I would ‘learn by doing’ with sufficient freedom to find my own way as the study took shape.

7.5.2 Carrying out interpretive analysis

Despite significant reading and supervisory meetings focused on conducting analysis there were several challenges that I encountered. Firstly, even whilst openly adopting a subjectivist epistemological position, it was a challenge to reconcile my own experiences, values and views on the area of research and to appreciate how these could be integrated throughout the thesis. Whilst this is in-keeping with the principles of dimensional analysis (Schatzman, 1991; Bowers & Schatzman, 2009), I initially found it difficult to use my existing knowledge as conceptual levers to further investigation and analysis. With further reading (for example Hall & Callery, 2001) and through supervisory meetings I became more confident in embracing and articulating the use of my experiences as offering alternative positions to catalyse further analysis.

A second challenge was in moving beyond my initial perspective on what the participants were telling me. Initially I was too focused on a limited view of the participant stories and looked to confirm, recall or recognise what I thought I already knew which limited discovery and genuine theory building. In a similar way it was a

59 The introduction to the thesis outlines my current position and biography in ITT and section 3.7 on p.62 acknowledges theoretical implications of research with certain insider characteristics.

60 Examples of this are in the articulation of analytical decisions in chapters 3 and 4, in particular section 4.3 on p. 79-97.
challenge to move from merely reporting the data onto interpreting and analysing what the data held. Whilst field notes were taken during and after each interview, on re-reading at the end of the study I can now see that these were too descriptive, too readily accepted conclusions that are insufficiently grounded in the data, and how they held some of my own values. My inability to abstract sufficiently from the data had the consequence of limiting and foreclosing on possibilities and threatened the rigour of my findings. I can also reflect on particular frustrations with encountering theoretical dead-ends in my analysis and unable to move on to find alternative perspectives.

I consider that these difficulties were partly due to inexperience but also due to perceived familiarity with the experiences of the trainees. I struggled to withdraw to make the familiar unfamiliar. It was only after I became more conversant with how to enhance my theoretical sensitivity and increased confidence to use literature to help expand and understand the data that I was able to become more creative and open to new possibilities. It was at this point that analysis became an illuminating and informative experience and I felt I was moving towards building a coherent explanatory theory. Many of the theoretical positions and terms used to build the explanatory theory were unknown to me throughout the first half of the research process, indeed potential new directions were continually being considered as the thesis was being written up. I believe that this point adds strength to my assertion that I have learned to abstract, hypothesise and look for new possibilities in data rather than merely recognise what I already know. Having the security of the ‘scaffold’ provided by dimensional analysis was a further contributing factor to my competence in theory building.

Finding the freedom to use literature as a comparative case to explain, clarify and strengthen the emerging theory allowed me to incorporate theory into the findings. I had found the use of literature particularly problematic in the early stages of analysis. This was partly due to reading contested positions of literature in theory building research and partly due to my tendency to use a limited range of existing theory to confirm early analyses rather than allow the data to guide further use of literature. Immersion in literature covering different positions in grounded theory research and taking part in special interest group seminars eased my fears and helped me to better understand my position as well as improve my analytical skills.
### 7.5.3 Duration of a study using grounded theory methods

The methodological position used within this study required regular iteration between data collection and data analysis using constant comparison to begin to build theory from data. The inductive building of theory requires cycles of reasoning, hypothesising, theoretical sampling and memoing at each step of the way until the point of writing the explanatory theory. Having been immersed in this cycle on a part-time basis for over four years I finally reached a point of confidence in my analysis that I could report findings and make a contribution to the field of teacher training. I attribute my confidence to three factors. Firstly was the regular questioning of my findings by supervisors. I wrote several iterations of what I thought at the time were findings but I now reflect on as extended theoretical memos and hypotheses requiring further analysis. This process did expose holes in the emerging theory but continued for 2 years. I drew support from the assurance of prominent authors in the field, such as Kathy Charmaz, that the theory will come through the writing. Secondly, peer debriefing (Guba & Lincoln, 1989) and supervisory critiques of the emerging findings at regular intervals right up until submitting the thesis provided more opportunities to consider gaps or slight alterations. Thirdly, prolonged engagement (Guba & Lincoln, 1989) and the time required to build the final theory provided the necessary time to enhance my theoretical sensitivity with each extended theoretical memo adding to the robustness of the findings.

I have great faith in the illuminating and explanatory potential of grounded theory methods but suffered from an elongated experience that threatened my completion within a permitted time frame. For students in particular grounded theory methods have been criticised for being unwieldy, complex and lacking in transparency (Schatzman, 1991). After repeated inductive and deductive cycles of analysis I began to question ‘how long is this going to take?’ whilst also being acutely aware of the diminishing time for completion of my studies. This process became very disconcerting and threatened my capacity to continue with my studies. Working through this particular challenge required me to build a more appropriate interpretation of sufficiency for a doctoral thesis and to view notions of saturation of a grounded theory as a product of much longer term research aims.
At the end of the study I can reflect on the significant value of having built an explanatory theory. I can also appreciate the skills I have developed and how much I still need to learn. Whilst I am reluctant to be critical of grounded theory methods, I do consider there to be limitations in contexts where there are time constraints and the analytical processes are new to the researcher.

7.5.4 Range, scope and depth of the study

In keeping with the comments made in section 7.4 on the transferability of research findings, the voices of only one group of trainees from one institution can be considered a limitation of the study. On reflection, 19 interviews across 10 participants accrued a significant amount of data and enabled me to be transparent in the building of a robust explanatory theory. In accepting that more participants from the same or other institutions could have added to the scope of the study I also reflected on the need to strike a balance with the time challenges of conducting a doctoral study using grounded theory methods.

When considering the depth of the study, the methodological approach taken to analyse and present the data, as one case, could have reduced its richness. The approach could also have limited an in-depth exploration of individual stories within the case.

7.5.5 Problems of self-selection and self-reporting

As presented in section 4.1 the study participants were purposively sampled from a population of 112 undergraduate and postgraduate trainee teachers. All students who fulfilled the inclusion criteria were invited to be part of the study. In the further information sent out to trainees who expressed an interest was further context and initial questions that would frame the interview. A limitation of this approach is the self-selection of trainees who may have considered that they have a celebratory story to tell of their experiences whilst completing their final professional semester. This could have restricted the number of potential participants from the 112 graduates who met the inclusion criteria and were invited to be part of the study. This could also be aligned to
issues of insider research and their perception of me as a member of staff, despite assurances that involvement would be after exam boards and confirmation of their QTS. To counter the impact of this limitation I was careful to invite each participant to provide examples of difficult situations where they felt their resources were stretched in order to provide data to counter celebratory stories. These examples often shifted from the original focus of obese and sedentary children and onto other examples where trainees had confronted problematic situations.

When self-reporting I had to remain aware of the potential for trainees to answer based on their perception of what I wanted to hear. Having been involved in the delivery of some aspects of their university-based ITT programme it was understandable that my position could have influenced their responses. All participants were reminded of the timing of the interviews in relation to their completion and that their responses were confidential and would be anonymous. Having conducted the first round of interviews all participants were given the transcripts and asked to feedback on any areas of inaccuracy or of any changes they wanted to make. In addition to this, all theoretical sampling and participant verification of the emerging theory continued almost two years after the initial interviews by which time participants were embedded in their schools and were likely to have held a different view of the researcher and of the research topic.

7.5.6 Application of grounded theory methods in my professional life

A final reflection is based on the skills that I have accrued in using grounded theory methods that have begun to permeate other areas of my practice. The decision to study a professional doctorate over a PhD was based on the desire to research a feature of my practice where findings may eventually inform practice, catalyse discussion, or at least enhance my own practice. It is my belief that the implications of this study, when communicated to a wider audience, may have a small impact. An additional and unexpected outcome of the research process is my gradual increased incorporation of some of the processes of the methodology used into aspects of my professional life such as teaching, course design and modular assessment. Schatzman (1991) considered dimensional analysis to be an extension of ‘natural analysis’ commonly used by people
to understand an interpret every-day life. I agree with this view and have become accustomed to using the principles of dimensional analysis to help undergraduate students build their own understanding of the academic and professional challenges they face. Examples include encouraging students to write reflective and analytic memos on professional observations and to engage with literature during their analysis of complex situations to help them build understanding and solutions to challenges. Students are then supported in coding their memos and abstracting to a level where they can identify theoretical possibilities in their analysis of their work and can access literature to build knowledge in their respective fields. It is my belief that this practice has created greater depth of understanding in trainees as they carry out their roles in professional settings. They begin to question, interrogate and analyse rather than merely mimic or accept what they see.

7.6 Conclusion

Research into teachers and emotions is entering a third generation (Jakhelln, 2011). The first, in the 1980s, identified the kinds of emotions experienced by teachers. The last 20 years has seen a second generation of research focusing on the origins of emotions in teaching. The present study has offered a contribution to the need to provide a stronger basis to the third generation of research into emotions and teaching, specifically the emotionality of teachers at different stages of their career. It has been widely accepted that more needs to be known about the causes and impacts of emotions with different groups of teachers. Research focusing on the very start of the teacher life-cycle, the training or ‘Q’ phase, is often neglected and yet it is plausible that much of what lies ahead for teachers can be shaped by their training phase. The present study has provided this contribution and can be a catalyst for further research directions in the field.

The concept of emotional labour has been applied to many settings, including school teachers, since the original contribution by Hochschild (1983). The present study contributes better understanding of emotional labour in the training phase of teachers and that the accumulation of emotional labour may be linked to deeply held beliefs.

---

61 The TDA (2007) consider there to be 5 progressive career stages ranging from ‘Q’ (qualifying) status to ‘A’ (advanced) status.
about the role of the PE teacher. Yielded from this study is the knowledge that emotional labour accumulates in trainee teachers when they are put under pressure to undermine the identity they hold. This knowledge is a significant contribution to the field of teacher education as there is good coverage in the literature discussing how identities are formed but limited literature that considers what happens when identity is threatened or undermined.

Since its conception, emotional labour has attracted substantial academic interest and application of it has continued to be developed. In the original work Hochschild (1983) acknowledged that individual differences and situational factors may account for differing outcomes of labour on employees. Despite this acknowledgement there has been a paucity of research that has built on this contention (Chu, Baker & Murrman, 2012). In addition to identifying factors contributing to the accumulation of emotional labour in trainee teachers this study has also added an understanding of factors that influence the impacts of this accumulation, namely perceptions of autonomy, rewards and whether labour invested contributes towards achieving QTS.

Recent data confirms that teaching has continued to suffer from a high level of early career dropout. In 2011, the DfE (2011a) reported that of trainees employed in the maintained sector in the first year post-qualifying, only 73% were still teaching in the maintained sector five years later. The statistic for those who began teacher training still teaching in the maintained sector is even lower at 52%. It is acknowledged that teachers may drop out for reasons other than those associated with burnout. However, research evidence has regularly highlighted burnout symptoms to be responsible for many teachers leaving the profession, particularly in early career (Tait, 2008; Yoo, 2011; Beltman, Mansfield & Price, 2011).

Previous research has focused on defining the concept of burnout, understanding contributors, its symptoms and recognition. The present study makes a contribution to the understanding of the onset of factors leading to burnout. Knowledge that some of the seeds of burnout may be sown during the training phase, through suppression of trainee identity and inauthentic displays of emotion, are important additions to the field of ITT and to addressing the problem of burnout in the future.

62 See chapter 2
By surfacing the concept of conscious attention, this study also begins to address the absence of emotions in current conceptualisations of reflective practice in teacher education. Authors have previously highlighted this as a significant omission from current practice and have asserted the need for greater coverage given the continued increase of emotionality in teaching. Existing literature falls short of discussing how this is best achieved within current ITT systems that do little to provide a secure basis for emotional support for trainees. The present study raises these issues and highlights potential avenues to better support trainees as well as how policy and practice may need to evolve to address issues of teacher retention. It is hoped that this study will increase awareness of issues facing trainees and stimulate further discussion in teacher training settings. This is particularly pertinent given the further reduction of time available in contemporary systems of teacher training and the heightened emphasis on school based training, such as School Direct, and the role of the mentor.

Whilst this study has presented important additions to the understanding of learning to become a teacher, along with some constructive messages to teacher education, it is accepted that it may only lead to modest changes in practice. Initiating changes into a culture that increasingly prioritises external performance measures which often undermine the emotional dimensions of teaching are problematic, and could even be described as a luxury that schools and teachers feel that they cannot afford (Thompson & Thompson, 2008).

‘What I envy you, sir, is the luxury of your own feelings. I belong to a profession in which that luxury is sometimes denied us.’

(Mr. Rugg in Little Dorrit, Charles Dickens, 1857: 311)
References


DfE (2012). *Teacher’s Standards,* London: TDA.


DfES and TTA (2002). *Qualifying to teach: Professional standards for qualified teacher status and requirements for initial teacher training,* London: TTA.


Health and Social Care Information Centre (2012). The Health Survey of England, London; HSCIC


Wetze, J. (2010). *Is initial teacher training failing to meet the needs of all our young people?*, Reading: CfBT Education Trust.


Appendices

Appendix 1 – Letter to BA (QTS) year 4

University of Brighton
Chelsea School

Dear Year 4,

This correspondence, along with the accompanying email sent to your University of Brighton email address, is inviting you to participate in a piece of doctoral research. My doctoral thesis is entitled:

‘Learning to handle problematic situations; how do student Physical Education teachers engage obese and sedentary children into physical activity?’

I would like to invite you to share some of your experiences in coping with such situations.

Involvement in the study is purely voluntary and will involve one, and in some cases two, semi-structured interviews of up to 1 hour in length. Interviews will take place between June and September 2010 at a time and place of mutual convenience. The research will commence following successful completion and exam board ratification of your BA (QTS) degree.

If you would like to receive further information regarding the study please contact me by email at j.wallis@brighton.ac.uk or by writing to me or calling me at the University. Requesting further information does not obligate you to involvement.

Yours sincerely

James Wallis

University of Brighton
Chelsea School
1 Denton Road
Eastbourne
BN20 7SR
Tel: (01273) 643861
Appendix 1 – Letter to PGCE cohort

Dear PGCE,

Congratulations on making it to the end of your PGCE year. I wish you well with your CEDP meetings and with any impending interviews or employment. In relation to your continuing professional development I would like to offer you the chance to be a participant in my doctoral research which may shape some of your reflections and future actions when confronted by challenging situations. The working title of my doctoral thesis is entitled;

‘Learning to handle problematic situations; how do student Physical Education teachers engage obese and sedentary children into physical activity?’

I would like to invite you to share some of your experiences in coping with such situations. It is not vital that you can immediately identify scenarios with obese or sedentary children but that you can reflect upon the challenges you may have faced in encouraging physical activity. The thesis is more directed at problem solving in trainees and uses obesity as the vehicle.

Involvement in the study is purely voluntary and will involve one, and in some cases two, semi-structured interviews of up to 1 hour in length. Interviews will take place between June and September 2010 at a time and place of mutual convenience. The research will commence following successful completion of your PGCE year and your CEDP.

If you would like to receive further information regarding the study please contact me by email at j.wallis@brighton.ac.uk or by writing to me or calling me at the University. Requesting further information does not obligate you to involvement.

Yours sincerely

James Wallis

University of Brighton

Chelsea School

1 Denton Road

Eastbourne

BN20 7SR

Tel: (01273) 643861
Appendix 2 – Follow up letter to participants, further information and consent form

Dear

Thank you for expressing interest in the proposed study into learning to handle problematic situations. The following correspondence outlines further information concerning the study and the research process. In addition it will outline the likely level of engagement of participants.

The research is being carried out as part of a thesis for a professional doctorate in education. Semi-structured interviews are the first part of the research process with the aim of beginning to build a substantive theory concerning how trainee PE teachers cope with problematic situations. It is envisaged that initial interviews will take place between June and September 2010 and will each last between 30 minutes to 1 hour. As the research progresses it is anticipated that a second round of interviews with some participants may be needed. It is recognised that some participants may have relocated away from the University. In such cases the interviews will take place at a venue chosen by the participant, therefore keeping impacts to a minimum.

During the interview you will be asked to reflect upon situations in which you have been presented with the challenge of engaging sedentary and obese children into physical activity. You will be asked to consider how you coped with the situation and decisions that you made. An example initial question is

- Can you tell me about an occasion when you had to try to engage a sedentary or obese child into physical activity / physical education.

In addition to this you will be asked to consider the origins of your actions.

If you are willing to become a participant in this research please complete the consent form enclosed along with contact details in order to arrange a convenient time for the initial interview. Your participation in the study is completely voluntary and you may withdraw at any stage without giving a reason.

Thank you for considering being part of this research project. If you have any questions prior to making a decision on your involvement please do not hesitate to contact me. Alternatively, if you would like to contact a School of Education contact who is independent of this research please contact Professor Avril Loveless at the Education Research Centre, Checkland Building, Falmer, tel; 01273 643423, or email a.loveless@brighton.ac.uk

James Wallis

Senior Lecturer in Physical Education

Chelsea School
Appendix 3 - UNIVERSITY OF BRIGHTON  Participant Consent Form

Learning to handle problematic situations; how do student Physical Education teachers engage obese and sedentary children into physical activity?

♦ I agree to take part in this research which is to investigate how I have handled problematic situations such as engaging sedentary and obese children into physical activity.

♦ The researcher has explained to my satisfaction the purpose, principles and procedures of the study and the possible risks involved.

♦ I have read the information sheet and I understand fully the principles, procedures and possible risks involved.

♦ I am aware that I will be invited to answer questions in a semi-structured interview and reflect, in-depth, on some of my responses.

♦ I am aware that interviews will be recorded and the data will be stored on the researcher’s dictaphone and password protected workstation until analysis is completed. Data will be anonymised and will be destroyed on completion of the study (June 2012).

♦ I understand that data will be viewed by the researcher, his supervisors and a third party transcriber. I am aware that if I prefer the interview to be transcribed by the researcher this can be discussed at the interview.

♦ I understand that any confidential information will be seen only by the researchers and will not be revealed to anyone else. Exclusions to confidentiality include disclosures which are illegal or threaten the safety of self or others. In such cases it may be necessary to contact the relevant authorities.

♦ I understand that I am free to withdraw from the study at any time without giving a reason.

♦ I agree that should I withdraw from the study, the data collected up to that point may be used by the researcher for the purposes described in the information sheet.

Name (please print) …………………………………………………………………………………………………

Signed …………………………………………………………………………………………………………………

Date …………………………………………………………………………………………………………………

Contact number……………………………………………………………………………………………………
Appendix 4 – Letter to University of Brighton trained mentors for focus group involvement

Re: Contribution to EdD research study

Dear [personalize]

I hope this letter finds you fit and well. I am writing to invite you to be part of a focus group that will contribute data towards a doctoral thesis. The working title of the study is ‘Learning to become a teacher: how do student Physical Education teachers engage obese and sedentary children into physical activity?’ To this point I have gathered and analysed data from a selection of year 4 BA (QTS) and PGCE PE students. The next stage includes investigating some of the emerging themes with a group of experienced teacher mentors.

This initial contact is to invite you to be part of a 45-60 minute focus group to discuss this topic. If you feel able to contribute please reply to any of the contact details below and provide me with a first and second choice from the dates listed. If you would like to request further information before making a decision please feel free to contact me.

Thank you for your consideration,

Yours sincerely

James Wallis
Senior Lecturer in Sport and Physical Education
School of Sport and Service Management
Faculty of Education and Sport
University of Brighton
Hillbrow
Denton Road
Eastbourne BN20 7SP
01273 643861
j.wallis@brighton.ac.uk

Please provide a first and second choice in return correspondence;

Tuesday 23rd April  ………………………
Wednesday 24th April  ………………………
Thursday 25th April  ………………………
Appendix 5 – Example of theoretical memo during differentiation of dimensions, June 2011

(This memo of the story so far is intended to make an attempt to draw together and organise some of the substantive dimensions in the case to date, an attempt to begin to bring the different pieces of the jigsaw together. In DA terms differentiating between dimensions conjured. The audit trail to each dimension included is clear when referring back to the data. I have not attempted to make that audit trail transparent here, but there are some elements that I need to check out or dismiss.) I have included some of the theoretical positions that I have investigated to try to expand and understand the data.

This memo auditions an amalgamation of negotiated order and self-determination as the central perspective through which to view and organize the story of trainee problem solving. The unification of these two concepts is necessary as each on their own appears to hold significant explanatory power but does not have the capacity within their accepted definitions to provide sufficient clarity to the phenomenon under investigation.

The concept of negotiated order is able to provide a comprehensive overview of the inter-play between trainee-mentor-university relationships and can be used to begin to interpret some of the decision making processes employed by the trainee. One point of particular significance is that both individual action and organisational constraints are key factors in the negotiation process, both of which are central tenets to the theory of negotiated order according to numerous sources. The recognition of the substantial contribution that individual actions play in the problem solving behaviour of trainees is a crucial factor in the addition of self-determination as study perspective. Trainees appear very inclined to pursue their own interventions and processes and are regularly afforded this autonomy by mentors and University staff. The route to this realization was the initial consideration of the theory-practice gap, which was quickly rejected as trainees appear to experience the polar opposite of the T-P gap and are given sufficient freedoms in which to apply autonomy in decision making. There is little indication that trainees suffer from an absence of opportunity to engage with pedagogical process presented during their University-based learning. The data presents numerous examples across cases whereby trainees are able to display their autonomy in problem solving behaviour. There are isolated cases where the reverse is the case. To broaden the story to try to further understand the contextual factors underpinning trainee problem solving a further term often used in cases where negotiated order are significant is that of the ‘negotiating space’. I have colloquially termed it ‘the bubble’. By expanding the contextual dimensions I was able to create three distinct sub dimensions. The three sub dimensions are closely correlated to accepted understandings of negotiated order and are clear identifiable within the data. More specifically,

i) Individual actions comprising 1) freedom / agency / autonomy, 2) making a difference, perceived competence in role, 3) sense of belonging to the profession. These three concepts are a very close correlation to the three central tenets of self-determination theory. Individual actions are also underpinned by the biography of the trainee. These are all strongly represented in the data.

ii) Tacit understandings - unspoken communication of the roles and responsibilities of the trainee, mentor and university. The assumed roles of the placement negotiated in the wider context of mentor training and university-based course. (Check this in the data – what is the source? Where is the trail?)
iii) Explicit contracts - the formal contracts followed by all parties which are formally negotiated and agreed. The evolution of the ITT partnership fits into this arena of the contractual and formal agreements between stakeholders.

The term used to colloquially define the negotiated space is a good metaphor as the ‘bubble’ creates a kind of semi-permeable membrane whereby some factors or conditions are allowed to freely enter and leave the negotiating space. In some cases the trainee does not have the skills or experience to make suitable judgments upon the conditions which impact upon their practice. Trainees allude to a wide range of conditions which are either selected by their own volition or unavoidably imposed on their practice. A key issue here is the experience or biography of the trainee in which mediating the impact of conditions. More specifically conditions have been grouped under the sub dimensions of

i) Compulsion – conditions which trainees must consider within their teaching approaches in problem solving. TDA ‘standards’, NCPE (check out the data pieces. Where is the audit trail?)

ii) Persuasion / manipulation – conditions which can be grouped as being ‘suggested’ or ‘recommended’ as approaches through negotiation whether tacit or explicit. The data represents such conditions as school policy (in negotiated order this may be termed organisational constraints), school practice, University-based ITT. It is evident in the data that these conditions are only viewed as persuasive and not compulsory. Here lies a key component of the SDT perspective as trainees exercise their autonomy in interventions used – some are accepted and some are rejected.

iii) Ideals and values of the trainee are important influences as they align with biography and impact on trainee problem solving to varying degrees. Trainees show a need to fulfill their perceived obligations in their role and feel as if they are ‘part’ or ‘related’ to the PE community – a sense of belonging. Trainees show a deep emotional commitment to their role which aligns with the ideals that they attempt to uphold.

Actions or processes resulting from the negotiations of trainees, mentors and ITT staff can be strongly aligned with the tenets of SDT. Their teaching processes employ huge resources of time and emotion and depict interventions which attempt to re-generate pupils’ physical identity and to reignite an interest in physical activity. Trainees do this by offering pupils autonomy in their physical choices, raising their perceived competence and re-creating a sense of belonging in the subject. There are a multitude of data pieces which provide a clear audit trail to this contention.

In attempting to gain a sense of fulfillment in their role trainees see occupational jurisdiction over aspects of their work and take ownership of outcomes achieved – this is further strength to the autonomy element of SDT but not to other aspects of SDT. Reject this? Is it too descriptive to accept? Data pieces are plentiful in terms of craving jurisdiction over classes and interventions targeting individuals.

Outcomes or consequences resulting from the negotiated order and SDT include
A variation on academically accepted versions of role strain. Trainees become emotionally strained by the conflict between their ideals and the processes they witness around them. This, coupled with institutional constraints, begins to challenge the extent to which trainees can stay true to SDT that is they don’t feel they are able to make a difference in the long term and begin to lose a sense of belonging to the subject and values they hold. Data pieces are available to substantiate this claim. The mainstream definitions of role strain do not fit neatly with the strain depicted within the data. Trainees feel strained by this conflict which may then have greater impacts further into their career as their values become unfulfilled. Is role strain the most appropriate term? They are strained in their role but it is not the classic definition, but they could be strained by the role they have negotiated…they may see this role as unachievable and end up compromising? I need to sensitize myself a little more to role strain via literature and then go back to the data (example in appendix 5)

Reality shock – again the accepted and common versions of reality shock do not apply here so this may be an inappropriate term. Trainees seem unfazed by the demands of the role negotiated for them but are shocked by their realities they see. Some of the implicitly communicated processes and the nature of persuaded / manipulated conditions is considered shocking by trainees as they observe practice which does not meet with their approval or match the value they hold for the subject. Data pieces solidly represent this contention.

A more problematic consequence of the negotiated space of the placement and the degree of self-determination exercised by the trainees is the emotive outpouring of trainees in the face of observed practice / tacit understandings / persuasion / manipulation. Seen as a consequence of the processes that trainees use to solve the problem of sedentary behavior is the polarity of emotions depicted in the data. At times trainees show pride in their celebratory stories, their retrospective reconstruction of events which they perceive to have fulfilled the role of the PE teacher. The data shows examples of euphoria and almost gloating on the success of interventions. By stark contrast the data also contains examples of negativity and criticism of observed practice and accepted / routine protocol which does not connect with the trainee’s values or the major tenets of their negotiated space or the interventions central to SDT. To try to label this polarity and to understand a little more about the nature of these outcomes I have come up with a term coined by Freud and used extensively in recent times to explain the origins of conflict and stresses that impact and can lead to the breakdown of relationships between otherwise similar people. Freud termed this the ‘narcissism of minor differences’ and it appears to hold a level of resonance when trying to understand the range of outcomes witnessed in the problem solving behavior of trainee teachers. Authors have elaborated on Freud’s work to draw distinctions between positive / helpful narcissism and negative / destructive narcissism. Data pieces can clearly locate both
ends of this continuum. It is too big a leap to accept this but it does provide another layer of abstraction that allows me to reconsider broader interpretations of what is going on in the data.
Appendix 6 – Example of Theoretical memo and use of literature to expand and understand role strain (a second example of a memo differentiating between dimensions)

Theoretical memo – 8/11 – Role Strain

Sensitizing and auditioning of role strain as central dimension

What evidence is there in the data that trainee problem solving in underpinned by role strain? Defining the area role strain is defined as, ‘the felt difficulty in fulfilling perceived role obligations.’ Literature presents numerous contributing factors to role strain. The paper by Lambert and Lambert (2001) has an overview of role strain / stress within nursing. These are diverse. This memo seeks to identify pinpoint the existence and nature of role strain in trainee teachers. Does it have significant explanatory power? Re-investigation of the data through this diverse interpretation of role strain taking participant from the two ends of the spectrum and from the middle (5 participants).

Participant 10

Strain appears mitigated by experience, biography, stress inoculation from biography. Strain exists but in more in an understanding of the chronic nature of strain and the potential consequences of strain on the capacity of the teacher to carry out role obligations. This participant acknowledges the existence of strain and takes steps to alleviate that strain through distancing and parking emotions and situations from the day. No acute role strain / stress but further checking out of this via a phone call may be appropriate.

Participant 9

Daily strain from trying to emotionally engage with the problem of sedentary children and finding little support in the department. There is no evidence of anyone putting formal barriers in the way of the trainee but there is little in the way of reassurance or support in the strategies she uses. This is causing emotional strain and a reaction which is highly emotive. She does not see the role she perceives as the vital role of the PE teacher being carried out by the department, which causes role strain. She is openly trying to engage these children and being slightly undermined by apathy elsewhere. There are also examples of where her strategies are contradicted elsewhere by ‘traditional and outdated approaches’. There is strain emanating from conflicting philosophies of the subject. This may have something to do with underlying philosophy of the subject, this participant has a different discourse for the subject (perhaps the University’s discourse?).

Participant 4

Limited existence of ‘classic’ role strain but recognises the nature of the placement as only 17 weeks and can give selflessly for the duration of the placement. This view does not translate to a full time career in teaching and therefore may not be considered a satisfactory coping mechanism. Contributors to role strain are contextual / environmental factors that are
constant features of the role of the teacher. Literature on role strain suggests a diverse range of sources of role strain. To the trainee teacher is appears to be environmental, daily stressors which accumulate and grind the trainee down over time and reduce their effectiveness. This could be a contributor to their inability to meet their ideals. Does biography mitigate role strain? There is an apparent recognition that behaviour exhibited by experienced staff could be seen as role strain.

Participant 7

Participant 7 talks of the daily grind which can be interpreted as role strain. Discusses ‘banging her head against a wall’ on many occasions where strategies have failed or the pupils slip back into old habits, they cannot create a behaviour change. This trainee does not exhibit other signs of role strain and is able to conceptualise their role as a 17 weeks placement. They have sympathy for staff and recognise the difficulties of the role when mid-career. This trainee is able to allude to how difficult it must be to operate with emotion / ideals all the time and how the staff around her work hard but are ground down. ‘Its all part of the job, but you can still try to solve deep set problems. ‘Ideal and values can become eroded over time. Here is the essence of the shift from ideal to realistic teacher over time. It is implied that staff are, in part, resigned to the situation and become apathetic to the health agenda. Underlying philosophy is quite significant here as if the teacher does not have a health philosophy then they have no role strain in this problem, they are elitist and take path of least resistance. Perhaps this is differing ideals and values of the subject?

Participant 3

Underlying philosophy is key again here as P3 suggests that some teachers get by avoiding role strain by disengaging and focusing on a different aspect of the role / different philosophy of PE. Perhaps this is differing ideals and values of the subject? She talks of the daily strain but not being significant at this stage of her career. She recognises the presence of straining features of teachers’ daily lives but is unforgiving of any apathy towards the values she holds for the subject.

Summary

Role strain has been characterised in literature as a range of factors. Those which are exhibited by the trainees in their problem solving are – concern over poor quality of observed practice (Scalzi, 1990), low organisational commitment (Lee and Henderson, 1996), lack of empathetic concern (Omdahl and O’Donnell, 1999), getting established in one’s career (Lengacher, 1993), confidence and competence in the role / meeting role demands (Mitchie, et al, 1996), emotional involvement (Snodgrass, 1998). The data analysed identifies these features of role strain in the experiences of the trainees.

Further consideration of this is the presence of trainees being given control and autonomy in their actions whilst on placement. They are given free reign but strain is coming from the disappointment that they are not seeing these interventions or emotional attachment to the
work of experienced staff. They feel they are sometimes ‘an island’ and that others have tried and have become exhausted in the battle in shifting sedentary behaviours.

A second key feature here is the notion that ideals and values may shift over time and may be a necessary shift to protect the teacher from damaging emotional and loads and general workload. Ideals and values of trainees may not depict those of trained staff.

- Role strain is apparent in various forms
- The ideals a trainee holds for the subject can contribute to role strain as they don’t see these ideals mirrored by staff. This could be considered a consequence of their ideals.
- Trainees display role strain but reduce their own emotional load by viewing their duties as 17 weeks – light at the end of the tunnel. They can maintain ideals they hold. May need to go back 1 year on and see the consequences of these ideals?
- Biography may mitigate role strain through inoculation / desensitizing / a well formed sense of perspective or by formal actions which reduce role strain.
- Dissonance does not appear to be a viable line of enquiry. Trainees are set on their course of action and carry act out their ideals, values and practice. This course of action does conflict with department practice (not that they are under explicit pressure to change) which creates role strain.
- Role strain may be a consequence of the ideals they hold and practice?

Next steps – In terms of the processes used by trainees to solve problems there does appear to be strain. It is necessary to understand the origin of that strain and their propensity to stick steadfastly to practice which underpins their ideals and values.

Dominant discourse of trainees – who or what is their dominant discourse? What drives them? The strain is the outcome but what is the catalyst?
Appendix 7 - Example of Dimensionalising and early analytic memos

Dimensionalising and analytic memos

Date – 5/11/10

Number – 4(ii)

Dimension – empathy – abstracted from emotional investment dimension AND shifting pupil perceptions AND humanising self. Four properties have been identified in literature on empathy. The properties are often re-cycled data pieces from elsewhere which may say something about the explanatory potential of this dimension.

Also worth noting at this stage that the ‘cost of empathy’ is an area in the literature that may throw some light on the reduction of emotion / empathy with experienced practitioners?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Properties</th>
<th>Interview number</th>
<th>Feeling concern (emotional aspect)</th>
<th>Experiencing emotion of others (emotional aspect)</th>
<th>Knowing how others are thinking (cognitive aspect)</th>
<th>Blurring the line between self and others (cognitive aspect)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Number</td>
<td>Intervi...</td>
<td>P9 - whereas I was generally quite concerned, and I...</td>
<td>P5 - after really thinking about it and making an effort to really think about what they were learning and what impact it was gonna have on them like are they doing it in front of other people, how’s that gonna feel if they come in last?</td>
<td>P2 - it was just about building up a bit of a rapport with her, just chatting to her, making her feel a little bit more comfortable, getting to know a bit about her, then you can engage her. I found out a bit about what she did out of school, and then it was easier to chat to her</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>P1 - just thought really it’s a shame because also I noticed that when she did get involved she was quite good, quite talented, so I just felt it was a shame really for her not to be taking part P2 - but obviously that’s one of the things I’m worried about (relapse) is what would happen when I left</td>
<td>P9 - I think he probably thought actually, I can be involved in PE and I can do PE, and I can do well, and which is really what I wanted</td>
<td>P4 - so asking about home life and just stuff like that, just building up a bit of a rapport really, and once you got her onto things that she felt comfortable talking about she’d talk quite willingly</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td>P1 - just thought really it’s a shame because also I noticed that when she did get involved she was quite good, quite talented, so I just felt it was a shame really for her not to be taking part P2 - but obviously that’s one of the things I’m worried about (relapse) is what would happen when I left</td>
<td>P9 - I think he probably thought actually, I can be involved in PE and I can do PE, and I can do well, and which is really what I wanted</td>
<td>P4 - so asking about home life and just stuff like that, just building up a bit of a rapport really, and once you got her onto things that she felt comfortable talking about she’d talk quite willingly</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td>P3 - I know what it feels like to feel uncomfortable in, whether it’s a PE or dance environment, I know what it feels like to feel like a lemon, to not understand the task, feel uncomfortable about performing in others</td>
<td>P1 - she would very much want to talk to me on my own as she knew we had a connection, if you had an issue with the activity, she’d come over to me before the end, before the start of the class, while we’re walking to the field or walking to the gym whatever, she’d come and tell me if she felt uncomfortable</td>
<td>P7 - was just building up a relationship, just getting to know the pupil P7 - Just show an interest really, treat them as a person, as an individual with feelings, with a life that they probably wanna talk about, and just go in there and be, just treat them as a human really, just try and build up that relationship and definitely just show an interest in them</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
P6 - I knew her name and I'd always ask her what's going on in the changing rooms. Even just things like, you know, I like her hair, hairstyle that day, and that, that will be enough. I think for her, because she wasn't noticed, that will probably be why she would have had a stronger connection. I think that would probably be the main thing in that changing room environment, that's when all the banter happens.

P3 - I think if I was in that position, like I know after I had Thomas I was really, I didn't want to go and do physical activity particularly, because I felt silly doing it, if that makes sense, cos I was a lot bigger than I had been before and it was, so I think I kind of understood where she was coming from as well.

P6 - but I think some trainees, if they've never been in that situation, they don't understand how tho-, those kids feel, then they're not going to be able to deal with it as well, if that makes sense, I mean I don't know, I, not observed any other trainees teaching or anything like that, but I think if I hadn't sort of experienced something like that, I probably wouldn't have been able to deal with it as well.

P6 - I think if I hadn't had Thomas, if I hadn't ever experienced that, I wouldn't know what it felt like, I wouldn't know what it was like to be one of those children that kind of didn't want to participate.

P2 - I think that when you try to be the teacher all the time and it doesn't work then you have to change something.

P2 - I kind of listened to her concerns, I think a lot of it was sometimes teachers are, in a way they're a bit like everyone does PE, you have to do it, you don't have a choice, it's part of the national curriculum, you need to participate', whereas I actually sat down with her, spoke to her.

P5 - I sort of went out of my way to sort of think 'what can I do to make her feel like she's successful within my lesson.

P7 - I think for me it's important for every pupil to participate and to feel success, and it doesn't matter how they go about doing it, they know that in my lessons if they achieve that then I've won.

P7 - I think that's a duty of a teacher to make sure that every pupil is participating and feeling success from your lessons.

P2 - And it wasn't until I actually sat there and thought about actually it’s his weight is the reason he’s not doing it, that I kind of realised how bad it was he wasn't doing it.

P5 - I think as a trainee sometimes they try to engage in conversation with you, we're quite keen to have a conversation back with them, whereas perhaps other teachers are just like 'oh, I'm too busy' and kind of don't and I think that makes quite a big difference with relationships with kids.

P5 - I really like the kids coming in and telling they've been to the park or what, it's nice, just the fact that they're, you know, they're happy to speak to you about kind of everyday things, and it is a shame when you see kind of heads of departments or somebody else higher up in the department like 'oh yea, no, I've got to go' kind of thing and not really having that conversation.
Issues of the 'cost of empathy' which alludes to some of the similar aspect. Have I got the right terms that capture chunks of the data? What unifies these pieces of being conjured. The emotional aspect of the dimension links with some areas as does the cognitive point there is some cross 'blurring' property with some of the 'soc Empathy seems to hold some substantive power in the transcripts, there is cross over in the

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page</th>
<th>Notes / analytic memo</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>P15 - sometimes I try and think 'well, you know, we can resolve that together!'</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>P1 - I did feel uneasy at the fact that these 2 obese kids are in classes where they aren't that able to do all that we are coming in last, were being watched by the rest of the group, but that's initially how I did start off cos I didn't know how to, how to deal with it. P8 - I thought 'oh no', kind of thing, I've got her into a setting where she's actually coming up to me and saying like 'I can't do it', and I said 'well, like, have', I basically just had a conversation with her; 'how do you wanna do it, how would you feel more comfortable?'</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>P2 - but there was something in me that I was, I just thought 'you can't stay like this, I can't be your teacher and just accept a letter when you are massively overweight'. She was in year 7, I'm so happy she's doing stuff now. P10 - I mean one thing that irritated, I had one boy, and he, every lesson he always looked very dishevelled, he looked really malnourished, everything, he would always come up with an excuse to never have his kit. P13 - I think it's really, really upsetting though when you do try and you realise that some teachers have kind of given up, and that kid in their class they can't be bothered with, cos if the teacher can't be bothered, and they hav, the kid hasn't got any esteem, self-esteem, and the teacher shows no interest. P11 - I'm really interested in how you feel, cos I want you to enjoy PE, I don't want you to turn up and hate what we have to do, and if you give me an idea then I'll try and work something out for next lesson!</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>P11 - well, you know, shed a couple of stone and then you, your back problems, my family have had back problems, it's, it's my auntie's massively overweight and she has a lot of back problems, and it's a sort of thing where I'm, I know the character of this young girl, and she's very lovely, very positive, and I knew that it wouldn't be too difficult to touch upon. P2 - I had back problems, my family have had back problems, it's, it's my auntie's massively overweight and she has a lot of back problems, and it's a sort of thing where I'm, I know the character of this young girl, and she's very lovely, very positive, and I knew that it wouldn't be too difficult to touch upon. P2 - made it a bit personal to me, I said 'I have back problems, but find if I do exercise it makes, it's a lot better than if I don't', I said 'even if you, you know do some stretching or-', I just, I couldn't leave it. P2 – Upset / moved - it really, really bothered me that she was so overweight… I couldn't drop it, it would have really bothered me. P5 - I'm not very good at long distance running, I find it very difficult, I have to keep pushing myself to go', and try and make it a bit more down to their level, and say it's about them individually.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| 11   | P12 - Once you've got that with a kid, he's probably never had that before from anybody else. They should a little bit of, you show a bit of respect for them, they're soon enough the kids in your class that will want to do anything they can for you, and I think it's, comes down to that little bit of time. Do we have enough time to do that 30 times, 5 times a day and then the next year have to do it all over again? |

Empathy seems to hold some substantive power in the transcripts, there is cross over in the ‘blurring’ property with some of the ‘social contact’ properties of the humanising dimension. At this point there is some cross-referencing of data pieces and therefore some links between dimensions being conjured. The emotional aspect of the dimension links with some areas as does the cognitive aspect. Have I got the right terms that capture chunks of the data? What unifies these pieces of data?

What is interesting is the literature on the ‘cost of empathy’ which alludes to some of the similar experiences witnessed by trainees in the experienced staff around them. I keep coming back to the issues of

1. Non-emotional investment / pragmatics / hiding behind policy which seeps into practice over time
2. how some practitioners (e.g. Gerda) manage to maintain these features (Weber – Charisma) of practice yet many buckle under the pressure of possibly bureaucracy or self protectionism / cost of empathy.

Is it too early for all this to start taking shape in this manner? Sketch in my reflective diary of some links between dimensions and assigning some dimensions. Next steps – look at trainee emotional investment, look at literature on emotionality – sources, types, coping.
Appendix 8 - Analytical memo and diagramming the explanatory matrix – February 2012

This diagram represents the story of the case. Literature has made a contribution to this building of the explanatory matrix – an attempt to begin drawing together substantive dimensions into a coherent model / story.

The basis of the integration is the creation of two learning cycles which inform trainee teacher learning through problematic situations. The first is called ‘learning in action’ and contains a regular series of events that trainees experience in their practice on a day to day basis. The second cycle is depicted as ‘learning from action’ as trainees take a retrospective and introspective view of their final professional semester in order to try to build a stronger sense of meaning and understanding to their experiences. This diagram pulls together context, conditions, process and outcomes with the central perspective of contradiction. Next steps - I need to make sure the terms used are suitable and immersed in the data. Is there enough to support reflective cycles in the data? How do the cycles interplay? I think this collects together some substantive elements of the theory but lacks coherence.
Questioning
- Immediate intentions
- Career intentions

Rewards
- Inclusive practice
- Bond with pupils
- External recognition

Impacts
Adaptive (learning)
Maladaptive (withdrawal, disengagement)

Introspection
- Shifting focus onto own learning
- Forming own interpretations
- Empathetic view of the needs of children

TRAINEE TEACHER – biography and experience

Expectations; meso, macro, micro

Aspirations
- Child centred

Responses; emotional, behavioural

Contradiction

Perception of influencing factors (capacity to cope, opportunity)